

---

# HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

City and County of San Francisco

## *Regular Meeting Minutes*

September 26, 2019

5:30 pm

City Hall Room #416

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place

### ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Susan Belinda Christian, *Chair*

Michael Sweet, *Vice-Chair*

Melanie Ampon, Commissioner

Karen Clopton, Commissioner

Hala Hijazi, Commissioner

Maya Karwande, Commissioner

Mark Kelleher, Commissioner

James Loduca, Commissioner

Jason Pellegrini, Commissioner

Abigail Porth, Commissioner

Joseph Sweiss, Commissioner

Sheryl Evans Davis, *Executive Director*

**SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION**  
**REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**  
**SEPTEMBER 26, 2019**

Present:

Michael Sweet  
Melanie Ampon  
Karen Clopton  
James Loduca  
Abigail Porth  
Joseph Sweiss

Absent:

Susan Christian  
Hala Hijazi  
Maya Karwande  
Mark Kelleher  
Jason Pellegrini

00:00:09

Michael Sweet

Good evening. It's 5:36 p.m. My name is Michael Sweet. I'm Vice-Chair of the San Francisco Human Rights Commission. Chair Susan Christian could not be here this evening, so I'll be chairing the meeting. I want to thank all of the folks who are in attendance to discuss this important topic, and I will ask the commission secretary to please read the roll.

00:00:32

Commission Secretary

Commission Vice-Chair Michael Sweet?

00:00:34

Michael Sweet

Present.

00:00:35

Commission Secretary

Commissioner Melanie Ampon?

00:00:36

Melanie Ampon

Present.

00:00:37

Commission Secretary

Commissioner Karen Clopton?

00:00:38

Karen Clopton

Here, yes.

00:00:39

Commission Secretary

Commissioner James Loduca?

00:00:41

James Loduca

Here.

00:00:42

Commission Secretary

Commissioner Abigail Porth?

00:00:45

Abigail Porth

Here.

00:00:46

Commission Secretary

Commissioner Joseph Sweiss?

00:00:48

Joseph Sweiss

Here.

00:00:49

Commission Secretary

Quorum is present.

00:00:52

Michael Sweet

Great. I want to thank the staff for putting on this meeting: Cheryl Evans-Davis, our fearless leader at the Human Rights Commission, Lori Gannon, our clerk, who is not here, SF Gov TV, who's recording this meeting tonight for posterity, and Noah, who's sitting in the director's chair.

At this point I'll ask if we have--well, let's read the next item.

00:01:26

Commission Secretary

So we have public comment on items not on the agenda, and we do have one public commenter, Aaron Goodman.

00:01:34

Michael Sweet

So this is for--here, I'll take the card. This is for public comment on items not on the agenda, so anyone who's here to speak on the transit issues, we'll have a public comment period for that later on. This is for people who want to speak on items within the purview of the Human Rights Commission that aren't on this evening's agenda, and you're welcome to step up at this time. If you haven't done so, please fill out a yellow speaker's card and give it to the commission secretary. And we'll have a clock for the public comment, two minutes. Please go ahead.

00:02:05

Aaron Goodman

Evening, commissioners. Aaron Goodman, District 11 resident. I just wanted to bring to your attention the issue of a current article in the paper about approving 10,000 e-scooters into the Bay Area. I think there's some concerns about bike share and modal--these other secondary modal systems that are being implemented that do not take into account disability, and I think it's gone far long enough without that really being revisited and relooked at seriously.

When you look at any of those platforms out there with bike share facilities that are dropping in at every district in the city, not one of them shows serious addressing of disability issues. There was an article in the *New York Times* on bike share options are rarely available for people with disabilities. But Portland and Detroit managed to come up with some alternatives, and I think it's about time the city and county of San Francisco, including SFMTA, takes this issue seriously. Thank you.

00:03:02

Michael Sweet

Thank you. Do we have anyone else who wishes to speak on items not on the agenda? Very well. If we could have the next item, please.

00:03:17

Commission Secretary

Item two, adoption of minutes dated August 8, 2019, discussion item/action item.

00:03:25

Michael Sweet

This was circulated earlier in the week to the commissioners via email. It's in your binder under tab two. And I'll entertain a motion. Clopton dings in first. Commissioner Clopton?

00:03:47

Karen Clopton

I move that we approve the minutes from August 8, 2019.

00:03:53

Michael Sweet

Do we have a second?

00:03:54

Abigail Porth

Second.

00:03:55 Michael Sweet  
Commissioner Porth, second. The--this is a motion to approve the minutes of August 8, 2019. Is there discussion on the motion? Seeing none, we'll take the vote. If the commission secretary would, please read the roll.

00:04:18 Commission Secretary  
Vice-Chair Sweet?

00:04:20 Michael Sweet  
Yes.

00:04:21 Commission Secretary  
Commissioner Ampon?

00:04:22 Melanie Ampon  
Aye.

00:04:23 Commission Secretary  
Commissioner Loduca?

00:04:25 James Loduca  
Yes.

00:04:25 Commission Secretary  
Commissioner Clopton?

00:04:27 Karen Clopton  
Yes.

00:04:27 Commission Secretary  
Commissioner Porth?

00:04:29 Abigail Porth  
Yes.

00:04:29 Commission Secretary  
Commissioner Sweiss?

00:04:30 Joseph Sweiss  
Yes.

00:04:31 Commission Secretary  
Motion passes by consensus.

00:04:36 Michael Sweet  
Thank you. If you could, please read the next item.

00:04:40 Commission Secretary  
Regular business item three, transit reliability presentation: Focus on Equity. 3A HRC staff presentation.

00:04:58 Cathy Mulkey Meyer  
Good afternoon, commissioners. My name is Cathy Mulkey Meyer. I am a staff member of the Human Rights Commission. And on September 24, 2019, a packet was submitted to you all electronically. Thank you.

00:05:32

Michael Sweet

Having a little technical difficulty here. With that, we will move on to the next item.

00:05:41

Commission Secretary

Item 3b, invited guests. One, SFMTA, two, District 2 Supervisor Catherine Stefani, three, District 10 Supervisor Shamann Walton, four, District 11 Supervisor Ahsha Safai, five, George Davis Senior Services, six, Hope SF.

00:06:02

Michael Sweet

And I want to--I've got a couple of notes here that I'll share. I understand that Supervisor Stefani--I have a note that she sends regrets, and is unable to attend today's meeting. Supervisor Walton sends his regrets, and is unable to attend today's meeting. And we have in place of Supervisor Safai, Monica Chinchilla from his office. For George Davis Senior Services, Executive Director Cathy Davis sends her regrets, and is unable to attend, as the George Davis Senior Service Center has been operating in partnership with the Department of Emergency Management as an emergency cooling center this week. And Hope SF Director Theo Miller sends his regrets, it is--and is unable to attend today's meeting. So we'll go, I think, back up to Monica. And Julie's here. We'll--you want to time sch--time--no? Okay. We'll take it in the order it's on the agenda then, which is Supervisor Safai's office, and then--hold on. I'm just going through the people who aren't here. And we're glad you're here. I--and I'd also like to say I'm pleased to see Commissioner Rubke from the MTA here as well, so--and former HRC Commissioner Stephen Herman, who as I walked in reminded me that I'm sitting in his former chair. So we'll hear from Monica and then Julie. Thank you.

00:07:52

Monica Chinchilla

Good evening, commissioners and community. I'm excited to be here today. I just wanted to affirm the supervisor's commitment to ensuring equity in transit within our district. He is a relentless champion in making sure that our bus lines run on time, that we're balancing the dual needs of transit reliability and pedestrian safety, has many conversations with SFMTA every day to talk about bulb-outs, introducing more bike lanes, stop signs, and just speeding or traffic calming measures, so that we can make sure that as a community transit is functioning well.

In terms of equity, we are committed, and we have been working with the companies of emerging technologies to make sure that there are employment opportunities for people within our district, so that as these companies are growing and coming within our district, that the community is benefiting not only from the technologies being available, but also from the employment opportunities.

Also, with transit lines, making sure that our equity lines are prioritized, and that we are reducing wait times. So for example, I've been communicating with a constituent today who has regularly had a 50-minute wait for a bus line, but we've been working with SFMTA to reduce that time to make it 20 minutes, 30 minutes. So that even within our community that sometimes and often gets overlooked, that we are making sure that transit works. So I just wanted to just state that there are many projects that we're working on. I'm sure that [inaudible] and SFMTA can share more about what they're doing in our districts, but with our supervisor, he is committed to, you know, making our streets safer, making sure transit works, and making sure that our community and our residents that are often overlooked are prioritized. Thank you.

00:09:51

Michael Sweet

Thank you. Any commissioner questions for Ms. Chinchilla? Very well. We'll now call on Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit for SFMTA.

00:10:12

Julie Kirschbaum

Good evening. Thank you for the opportunity to be here. Thank you to our director as well, as we brought several staff. If the MTA staff wouldn't mind just raising their hands. We're here to listen, and we appreciate the commission taking the time to do this hearing. Although I haven't heard directly from the folks in this room, we have heard from frustrations throughout the city. And I can assure that while I think we have a number of important initiatives under way, the service is not meeting my expectations for our customers, and certainly for our customers who need it the most.

I do want to talk a little bit about what we're doing around transit equity, because it is a topic that we take very seriously. For example, we're working very closely with people with disabilities on things like the design of our vehicles, as well as our fair policy. We have just started piloting a choice program in partnership with two public health clinics, one in Potrero and one in the Bayview, for folks who are having challenges using Muni, but don't necessarily qualify for paratransit, and would have access to a taxi voucher program.

We also have the most comprehensive free and reduced fare program for low income customers, which is used by over 100,000 San Francisco residents. And we're also piloting a discounted day pass, which is something that we haven't had before, but we're working with MTC to try to set up. That's in part response to feedback that we've heard about our current Clipper fare, which has reduced fare for people who use Clipper, but has a higher cash fare.

In 2014 our board passed the Muni Service Equity Policy, which made us the--really the first agency in the nation to link the equity needs with the budget process. So as part of that policy our board set out the expectation that a series of routes that we identified with social justice advocates would perform as well or better than our average. And then as we identify performance improvements, particularly around service and capacity, we've concentrated those on routes that really serve communities of concern, including the 8 Bayshore, the T Third, the M Ocean View, to name a few. And we recently received an award for a community outreach process we did on the 27 Bryant, which is a route that was identified in our equity strategy as having very poor reliability, particularly as it went through the Tenderloin and South of Market neighborhoods. So we're pleased to have recently implemented those changes.

In--as we prepared for those service improvements, we had a lot of things going for us. We had better vehicles. We had better data systems. But what's really impacting us right now is a very acute operator shortage. We're currently missing about 250 operators. With the help of operators working overtime, we're able to minimize the impact to only about 5% of our service, but 5% of service still represents hundreds of trips each day. And as you heard from Monica, if a route runs every 20 minutes, and we're missing a bus, that can create a 40-minute gap. So while we have worked hard to prioritize routes that go through our equity neighborhoods, there still have been impacts, and that is something that we're monitoring very closely and trying to get through this kind of difficult time. We've put a huge focus on hiring. We have been able to double our class sizes, but we're going to need to even further increase hiring as we move forward.

We've been very fortunate. One of the reasons that we've been able to double our class size is through a partnership with the mayor's Office of Economic Development. That is providing a free Class B permit program for anybody who's on our eligible operator list. That used to be a huge hurdle for people to have to go through the DMV process to get that permit even to be considered for hiring, and we're seeing about a quarter of our applicants take advantage of that program. And we are also publishing--we're doing much more frequent classes of new operators, and we're publishing those dates in advance, which is really helping a lot of our nonprofit partners do recruiting for operators. Because it is a really wonderful job opportunity. It's something that you're becoming part of a family. You have a really wonderful job trajectory. A lot of the folks that are current managers supporting me today started as operators and went through that process.

I also anticipate today that you may hear questions about the Chase Center. We have had a very successful implementation of a strong transit first program to the new arena. We did that investment because we felt it was critical to not have that area become a huge congestion bottleneck, particularly as we think about access to the UCSF hospital. But also didn't want to congest up freeways that some of our routes, like the 8 Bayshore and the 14 X, rely on.

In the most recent article I did incorrectly state that we were diverting service from equity lines. That was a very poor choice of words. We did not remove any service from routes. But we didn't see initially as much overtime interest in the services we expected, so some of our extra board operators, which we use to fill gaps throughout the system, went to our Chase service. So that's--the feedback though I think did prompt us to provide even stronger monitoring tools on some of our routes, particularly the 8 Bayshore and the 19

Polk. So I--while I wish I had communicated better on the topic, I think that there was a silver lining to it, that it provided even more heightened focus.

So anyway, my intent in sharing these remarks is to not make excuses or invalidate some of the experiences you're going to hear today, but to assure you that despite some of our current shortages, we are doing everything that we can to provide excellent Muni service. And what we'll do is listen, and come back in October with what I hope to be a meaningful and actionable response to some of the input.

00:17:35

Michael Sweet

Great. Thank you for those remarks, and we appreciate your coming and listening. And as I said, it's great to have a member of your commission here as well. I think there's on--are there other MTA commissioners? Okay. I will recognize the first speaker. And why don't you--Ms. Kirschbaum, why don't you stay up there? Because I think you may get some questions. Commissioner Porth?

00:18:04

Abigail Porth

Thank you for your presentation. The articles in the paper about what happened at the Chase Center were deeply concerning. And I understand your comment that you misspoke, but I'm not sure I understand what really--from MTA's perspective what did happen, if the article is incorrect?

00:18:26

Julie Kirschbaum

Yes. So we had a day on the 8 Bayshore where we were balancing a lot of last minute sick calls and other issues on the route. And Supervisor Walton reached out, which I appreciate, and in my email response to him I said that we diverted service, which we did not do. It was just a poorly worded email. We have a pool of operators every day that are not assigned to any routes, and we use them to fill gaps and vacancies. And we prioritize them based on things like making sure we deliver the first and the last trip every day. We focus on our equity routes. We focus on filling the rapid routes, which go through many of our neighborhoods that are low income. And on that day we also used some of our extra board to fill the Chase Center service, so that's what I was referring to.

00:19:27

Abigail Porth

And when you say that there was a silver lining in that lessons were learned, what were the lessons that were learned?

00:19:33

Julie Kirschbaum

We are trying to anticipate problems earlier in the day. So because we are--now I'm getting daily reports, for example, on the 8 Bayshore, on the 19 Polk, which is another route that we were seeing starting to slip in terms of service delivery, and we're able to use all of the tools that we have to make sure we're minimizing this service.

00:19:59

Abigail Porth

Okay.

00:20:00

Michael Sweet

Thank you, Commissioner Porth. Commission Ampon?

00:20:04

Melanie Ampon

I was wondering how do you prioritize improvement in services for neighborhoods that need them the most?

00:20:12

Julie Kirschbaum

We do it in part by feedback and dialogues. We're currently working, for example, in a neighborhood planning process in the Bayview. We've also gotten kind of from a lot of different constituent groups requests to focus on the 29 Sunset, and to look at a potential skip stop service that would get people to school and to connections like BART and City College more quickly. We're also constantly reviewing our data, looking where we have crowding and other service needs. And then we also look at the performance

of a route. So for example, on the 27 Bryant, that is a route that we don't see a lot of crowding, but it is a very important route, making connections across a number of different neighborhoods, and it was having really really poor reliability because of the--kind of all the turns it was making through the Tenderloin.

00:21:24

Michael Sweet

Commissioner Locado [sic]?

00:21:27

James Loduca

I think that's me. My name is misspelled here. Thank you so much for your presentation, and thank you for your service. I'd love just to spend a little bit more time--

00:21:37

Michael Sweet

Commissioner Loduca, I'm sorry.

00:21:39

James Loduca

Thank you, friend. I'd love just to take a minute to understand the operator shortage.

00:21:46

Julie Kirschbaum

Yeah.

00:21:46

James Loduca

What caused it? What impact are you seeing it have on the system? How are you mitigating that? And what steps are being taken to catch up with a fully staffed department?

00:21:58

Julie Kirschbaum

The operator shortage was initially created because we weren't training large enough classes, and we weren't keeping up with attrition and all of the other demands that we had on the system. And then when we went to increase the classes, what we saw was that we had a pipeline problem that the smaller classes hadn't made visible. And what I mean by that is that we would take an operator list, and it would appear to have, you know, kind of an ample number of people on it, but as we started calling, what we found was that the list was exhausted. Either people hadn't gone through the commercial B permit process, or they'd gotten other work. So what we've done is work in a number of different areas to solve the pipeline problem.

The first thing we did was we started doing classes every two months instead of every six months. In the past we used to do a class every, like, 15 months, and thousands of people would sign up to be Muni operators. And this is just not the job market that we're in. So we did classes every two months. We also scheduled those classes 12 months in advance, so that everybody that we were partnering with to market the job opportunity knew when a class was coming, and could work with their different clients. And then the third thing we did was the city drive program that I talked about, which helped people get through the class B permit. But this is--the operator shortage is--it's not unique to Muni. It's something that across the Bay Area and across the country we're facing. But ours is worse, I think, because we were slow to react to it.

00:23:56

James Loduca

And what impact are these reactions--these steps you've put in place, what impact are you seeing on the sort of backfilling of those roles, and what are you doing in the meantime to ensure reliability?

00:24:09

Julie Kirschbaum

So what we've started to see is a stabilization. So we were going, you know, fewer and fewer and fewer trips were being delivered. We've now been able to stabilize, and we're starting to see a kind of eating away at our shortage. We've increased the class sizes. We were doing classes of about 25 to 30. We had a low class in last December, where we could only get 14 people in it. Our most recent three or four classes have started anywhere from 55 to 60 students, and are graduating between 40 and 45 of those students, so we've more than doubled the amount of people that we're putting through the pipeline.

In the meantime, as I said, we're, you know, doing our best to spread out the pain, and to make sure that the routes that need the service the most are getting it. We do not always have great choices. We're also--we do some line management. So instead of having a bus come in 20 minutes and 40 minutes, sometimes we'll split the different and have--try to have it come 30 minutes, 30 minutes, to be a little more regular. And we are trying to communicate better also where we are having a bad service day, and letting customers know through, you know, 311 or through our website or through the NextBus displays on our--at our stops.

00:25:47

Michael Sweet

Thank you, Commissioner Loduca. If--I want to follow up on something you said, and then I'll recognize Commissioner Porth. You said you were trying to communicate better. What--you said 311, the NextBus on the--

00:26:01

Julie Kirschbaum

Displays. And then through the website and social media.

00:26:06

Michael Sweet

So 311 is inbound, right? Someone has to actually call?

00:26:10

Julie Kirschbaum

Yes.

00:26:11

Michael Sweet

You don't--and then what percentage of the bus stops actually have operational boards, if you know?

00:26:19

Julie Kirschbaum

I think about a third.

00:26:22

Michael Sweet

Okay. And can you tell--do you know where those operational boards actually are in the city?

00:26:31

Julie Kirschbaum

Yeah, I'd be happy to bring a map at our--

00:26:33

Michael Sweet

I mean, are they there--are they spread across the city, or are they more in the center of the city? Are they in the neighborhoods that are most, you know, that we're actually talking about, or are they--

00:26:44

Julie Kirschbaum

Yeah, they are. They are in--there are some cases if we haven't been able to successfully get power to a shelter, you might not see one. But we typically do have them pretty well distributed throughout the city, and that is one of the things we monitor for.

00:27:04

Michael Sweet

And that relies on the NextBus technology?

00:27:07

Julie Kirschbaum

It does.

00:27:08

Michael Sweet

And is the NextBus--I know there was an update of NextBus, or an update in process when RFP went out. Is NextBus now accurate and current? Because I believe early in 2019 I heard or read something somewhere that NextBus was not reliable because they were waiting for a rollout of new technology.

00:27:26

Julie Kirschbaum

The new technology will certainly give us a lot of enhanced communication that we don't have. Solar powered displays is an example of it. Better predictions at terminals is another example of it. The technology, I think it's been transformative in how people travel, but it is very old.

00:27:51

Michael Sweet

So it hasn't yet--the--

00:27:52

Julie Kirschbaum

It hasn't.

00:27:53

Michael Sweet

--update hasn't rolled out?

00:27:53

Julie Kirschbaum

No, it ha--it--we're still in the contract process.

00:27:58

Michael Sweet

So from getting a contract signed to rolling out new technology that's actually working, what's the--once that process starts, how long will that take?

00:28:07

Julie Kirschbaum

I'll have to get back to you, but the--improving the algorithm and the predictability is the highest priority.

00:28:13

Michael Sweet

And do you have a--data on how inaccurate NextBus is right now? I mean I know--I live about a mile from the end of a line, and, you know, I--since I now understand how it's working, and that it's picking up an expected run instead of the train when it leaves, I now know how to tell when there's actually a real train there and it's just a phantom train that's on the schedule. But I'm wondering do you have actual data on how inaccurate NextBus is in disseminating information into the city right now?

00:28:48

Julie Kirschbaum

I don't know.

00:28:49

Michael Sweet

What percent of the--what percent of that one-third of the bus stops or train stops in the city that actually have boards, actually have accurate information on those boards?

00:28:59

Julie Kirschbaum

I'd be happy to come back with that.

00:29:01

Michael Sweet

That would be great. You said you also communicate through social media, and can you tell me a lit--talk a little bit about that, please?

00:29:08

Julie Kirschbaum

Yeah, we have customer information officers that are in our control center, in our transportation management center, so they're basically on the pulse of what's happening. So they are the ones that send our alerts via the NextBus system, alerts to folks that have submitted emails, as well as both posting and responding to feedback on Twitter.

00:29:35

Michael Sweet

So is there actually an email address that people can use to communicate with the--well, you said the operation center?

00:29:43

Julie Kirschbaum

Yes. There--you can sign up for an alert on either multiple lines or the line that specifically affects you. And then when there's a service disruption, you get pinged with information.

00:29:56

On a mobile phone?

Michael Sweet

00:29:57

Or at a--

Julie Kirschbaum

00:29:58

At home?

Michael Sweet

00:29:59

--computer.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:29:59

Right. And are the--and you said you communicate via Twitter. Can you talk a little bit about that, the Twitter?

Michael Sweet

00:30:10

What is your question?

Julie Kirschbaum

00:30:11

Well, h--so how does--you put messages out on Twitter?

Michael Sweet

00:30:16

Yes. As I said, we put messages out through the email alerts, on our website, on NextBus, and on Twitter.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:30:22

So in order to communicate real time with your operations cen--now when someone dials 311, they don't actually get to the operations center, do they?

Michael Sweet

00:30:30

No. But we also are in constant communication with 311. And there are times, particularly if there's--they're in--311 operators do have direct access to our control center.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:30:45

Is that a new development, or has that always been the case?

Michael Sweet

00:30:48

It has always been the case.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:30:50

Okay.

Michael Sweet

00:30:50

For example, we've had instances where, like, a child gets separated from a parent, and they would call 311, and that is immediately connected to our control center so we can react.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:31:02

And what if someone calls 311 and says, "I've been waiting for a bus for a half hour. Can you tell me what's going on?"

Michael Sweet

00:31:08

And what they would do is look at the same alerts that we're posting online.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:31:12

Michael Sweet

They--but all they have--they don't see what they see in the operation center. They just see the NextBus, correct?

00:31:18

Julie Kirschbaum

They see the alert, yeah.

00:31:19

Michael Sweet

And if the NextBus isn't accurate, then they don't have the information?

00:31:22

Julie Kirschbaum

Well, they would see the same alert that is posted to the customer.

00:31:26

Michael Sweet

You said that you're constantly monitoring data. That's based on the real time movement of the vehicles?

00:31:33

Julie Kirschbaum

I was talking, no, about--I was not talking about real time data. And we do that as well, but I was talking about looking at trends related to reliability, crowding, on-time performance.

00:31:44

Michael Sweet

You say that about 5% of runs are still missed due to driver shortages every day. Are those--what is the frequency with which it's always the same run? In other words, is that spread out? And do you do something to make sure that if, you know, the 7:00 a.m. bus doesn't run one day, that you make sure you pick it up the next day, even if that driver is out for two days?

00:32:10

Julie Kirschbaum

Not necessarily. For example, if a run is not signed on at a signup, it might not be filled.

00:32:20

Michael Sweet

And that could repeat over multiple days?

00:32:22

Julie Kirschbaum

It could. But we do our best to make sure that we're not missing two runs in a row, again, to avoid a big service gap.

00:32:37

Michael Sweet

Is there--aside from phones or, you know, handheld devices, and I guess the boards and the shelters, that's kind of the only way that people can be made aware of disruptions or delays in the system, correct?

00:32:57

Julie Kirschbaum

Without calling through on one, yeah.

00:33:00

Michael Sweet

Okay. Commissioner Porth?

00:33:03

Abigail Porth

Two questions. The first is in what neighborhoods do you have repeat days of delayed service due to operator shortage or other circumstances?

00:33:13

Julie Kirschbaum

We have operator delays throughout the system on a daily basis.

00:33:18

Abigail Porth

And it sounds like you're tracking where those are happening. So tell us a little bit about the statistics about which neighborhoods this kind of situation arises in.

00:33:29

Julie Kirschbaum

So I don't understand the question. There's--every route in our system is currently impacted by some small amount of service--misservice.

00:33:42

Abigail Porth

So our concern as the Human Rights Commission is to make sure that there is a lens of equity and inclusion that's applied to all kinds of city services, from Muni to other things. So we're concerned with making sure that there aren't marginalized communities that continue to be marginalized with compounding problems. So it'd be helpful to know, since you collect data on where these things are arising, it'd be helpful for us to be able to assess whether this is continuing to negatively impact day after day certain neighborhoods and populations.

00:34:18

Julie Kirschbaum

I'd be happy when I come back in October to share what our statistics are by route, and also which neighborhoods they go through. That might give you a better sense of what you're asking.

00:34:30

Abigail Porth

Great. And the second question is what percentage of your operator workforce will be retiring in the next five years?

00:34:40

Julie Kirschbaum

I'd be happy to provide that as well. Because we have been doing extensive hiring, our overall operator median age has reduced, but I'd be happy to bring you that information.

00:35:04

Abigail Porth

Similarly then, it'd be helpful to see information on the diversity of the workforce that's going through the pipeline, through the classroom trainings that you're bringing in, and how that relates to the aging part of the workforce at the other end of the line. Okay.

00:35:23

Michael Sweet

Commissioner Loduca?

00:35:25

James Loduca

So I don't think there's a San Francisco Muni taker alive that has not experienced being stuck in a tunnel, and what we know about getting trapped in a tunnel is it disproportionately impacts low age shift workers who may or may not have the ability to arrive late to their job, and oftentimes can result in penalties or loss of job. So I'm just curious to understand how you are thinking through increasing accessibility within the tunnels. What's the plan for WiFi and connectivity, so that if you are stuck in a tunnel you have the ability to notify your employer or your loved ones that you may be running late? Because as we know, the most marginalized communities have the least amount of flexibility with their schedule.

00:36:11

Julie Kirschbaum

BART is working on a cellular connectivity project that would go through the entire Muni metro tunnel. It's a fairly extensive process. I believe it has almost a two-year timeframe, but I think that would get at the issue you're speaking to.

00:36:32

James Loduca

When did the two years start?

00:36:35

Julie Kirschbaum

It hasn't.

00:36:40

And is the same true for WiFi?

James Loduca

00:36:43

They're not--we don't have current plans for WiFi.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:36:49

Why not?

James Loduca

00:36:50

I think because cellular is more universally accessible.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:36:58

Is the--is there any provision in the new tunnel of WiFi or cellular?

James Loduca

00:37:03

I'd have to find out. I don't know.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:37:05

The tunnel that you're building right now, the brand new one.

James Loduca

00:37:09

I don't know.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:37:10

Commissioner Clopton?

Michael Sweet

00:37:13

Okay. Well, I think the first thing I'm concerned about is we really do still have a digital divide, and so this reliance upon a cell phone itself is inequitable. If you're only communicating that no bus is coming, more than likely beyond a half an hour, right, and you are only communicating that to people who have access to your website or to dial 311 or 511, or if they're lucky enough to actually have a NextBus sign in the shelter. The bus stop that's near me doesn't have that, and the number of the bus is van--has been vandalized, and that's been for a couple of years it hasn't been fixed the num--what number of the bus stop.

Karen Clopton

00:38:21

What is the location? We will get it fixed.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:38:23

I can tell you that privately, right?

Karen Clopton

00:38:25

Thank you.

Julie Kirschbaum

00:38:28

Yeah, it hasn't been for a couple of years, right? So if I don't have a phone, and I want to know when the bus is coming, and I don't know what the number is, how would I get that information? I mean, I'm concerned about that. I'm concerned about the driver shortage, and do you have supervisors and others who are filling in? Is that possible? Have you brought back retirees? I mean, there's a lot of things that can happen, and it--also in terms of outreach in the Greater Bay Area for prospects. And what kind of training in addition to these classes? You talked about the pipeline. What does that look like? And then finally, I'm--I am concerned about the cellular, WiFi, etcetera. What's more accessible? And you're relying upon the BART system to include cellular service in the Muni metro tunnels. I don't know that that's really enough. And so in terms of budgeting and asking the city and that sort of thing, this has to be on the agenda, and on the greater agenda. Because I don't think cellular is more accessible than WiFi, and the city has

Karen Clopton

provided free WiFi service in various locations. So I am concerned about that as well. When you report back, I'd like the answers to those three areas of concern. Thank you.

00:40:19

Michael Sweet

And before I recognize Commissioner Loduca, let me just roll off of that a couple of thoughts. I've had--and, you know, I am more fortunate than many in the city in terms of, you know, things that are accessible to me, but I've had, as has everyone, frustrations with Muni. And I can tell you as a Muni consumer, that when you call 311 you don't get feedback from anyone who has any--indicates they have any direct communication with the control center. What you get is someone looking at the same failing NextBus advisory or NextBus prediction that I can look at on my phone, because I have a phone. I also do communicate with Muni on Twitter. I happen to have a Twitter account. I happen to be okay with the whole world knowing what communications I'm having, where I'm getting on a vehicle, where I'm waiting for a vehicle by myself, maybe where I'm waiting for a vehicle late at night. But one has to buy into that and be willing to do it to even have the direct interaction with the control center, as far as I understand. You know, I don't think that is right. I don't know what the solution is. I understand that somewhere along the line someone had an idea that communicating with Twitter would be cool, and look, we're here in San Francisco and there's a lot of people on Twitter. But the people who are most reliant on your service aren't, and the people who are the most vulnerable in our community are probably not the most interested in logging into a public network and a public social media network to talk to Muni, in a way that doesn't ever go away, about where they were, where they were going, and what they're waiting for and why wh--what information they want. I don't know what the solution is. I don't know if anyone has ever said this to you, but I would hope that somewhere along the line someone would've figured this out, because my understanding is it's been a number of years that's been the primary mode of direct communication from--I see the tweets coming out, you know? Thanks for letting us know. You're our eyes and ears out there. Well, that's great, but the people with the eyes and the ears are only on the certain routes where hipsters who have Twitter accounts go, and that's not the communities that we're talking about here. Because those people can also, you know, pay to park downtown or get an Uber or, you know, work at home, because they have WiFi, and they can work at home, and their employer will say that that's okay. So, you know, that's--and I don't know if you have any--if I've misconstrued anything, if I've misunderstood the use of Twitter, if I've misunderstood how the call center works, if you want to comment on any of that before I call Commissioner Loduca.

00:43:09

Julie Kirschbaum

No. I think it's good feedback. The Twitter is the primary way we're doing real time two-way communications. We do rely on 311 for a lot of people that submit complaints and concerns, and we're able to follow up and track that, but it's not the real-time back and forth that you're describing.

00:43:30

Michael Sweet

Well, and even the Twitter people will tell you that if you want to make a complaint you have to fill out a form, and you have to do that through 311. I mean, and that's not an instant process. Commissioner Loduca?

00:43:45

James Loduca

I'm listening to all this, and I'm struck by the fact that we live in one of the most innovative cities in the world.

00:43:49

Julie Kirschbaum

I'm sorry. I didn't hear you.

00:43:50

James Loduca

I said I'm listening to all this, and I'm struck by the fact that we live in one of the most innovative cities in the world, and that there's rarely a problem that we've not set ourselves to solve that we haven't been able to solve for. And yet I'm concerned that the same level of innovative thinking and creativity of some very grave problems that exist in SFMTA, that level of creativity and innovation isn't being applied. And unfortunately, without that application I'm increasingly concerned that the people on the losing end of the stick are the people who are most desperately reliant on SFMTA. And so what I'd also--I'd love to hear first

of all do you have an innovation committee or an innovation council that helps you think creatively about how to solve some of these really serious problems that disproportionately impact the marginalized and underrepresented? And if not, when you come back in October, I'd love to hear some thoughts about how you might go about doing that.

00:44:46

Julie Kirschbaum

Thank you. We're currently working with a committee that's co-sponsored by the mayor's office, Supervisor Peskin and Supervisor Mandelman, working with industry leaders to look at some of the hard Muni problems that you're talking about, and I think does lend some of that lens of innovation. One of the things that we've been talking about is this customer experience. Among kind of other challenges is organizationally the customer experience sits in many different spots within our organization, and I don't think it's as holistically stitched together as it could be. So that's one of the things that we've been getting input on. We do have a pretty incredible staff working through very tough problems, but we don't have anything called an innovation committee per se.

00:45:52

Michael Sweet

Do we have other questions or comments for Ms. Kirschbaum? Let me just ask another question. I suspect this isn't something you can answer now, but if maybe you can bring this back when you bring back the other list and--is there a metric, like, an overall percent of on-time operations? Do you give--have a score, like a number on any current date? Or do you have to go by line or by area or something like that? Can you say we're 87% today?

00:46:24

Julie Kirschbaum

We track our on-time performance systemwide and down to the kind of ha--you know, three-quarter mile segment of a route. So it--

00:46:37

Michael Sweet

And that--

00:46:38

Julie Kirschbaum

--rolls up and it rolls down.

00:46:39

Michael Sweet

And could you tell, I mean, and do you give yourself a daily score or percentage, or monthly? Can you say our on-time percentage for the month of August 2019 was?

00:46:49

Julie Kirschbaum

I can, and our on-time performance has been fairly consistent and I would say fairly low. But--

00:47:01

Michael Sweet

Low--by low you mean not on time?

00:47:03

Julie Kirschbaum

Not on time.

00:47:04

Michael Sweet

Did you have a--do you know what the number is for August 2019?

00:47:07

Julie Kirschbaum

I apologize. I don't. But I'd be happy to bring that back.

00:47:09

Michael Sweet

I'd be curious to know, like, any specific date--you know, specific date going back three years. Because again, as a Muni rider who has other alternatives, I'm witnessing degradation. A commute that used to take me 25 minutes takes about 45 now reliably. Which, yeah, okay, another 20 minutes, that's 50%. And I

wonder if that can be extrapolated over the entire system, and is Muni 50% worse for 50% less on time today than it was before they redid the tunnel?

00:47:51

Julie Kirschbaum

I'd be happy to share all that information.

00:47:52

Michael Sweet

Thank you. Commissioner Loduca?

00:47:55

James Loduca

My last one, I promise. Do you maintain service level agreements, either with your stakeholders at the city or service level agreements about average commitments to on-time rates or service rates, any standards that you set for yourself that you hold yourself accountable for in order to hit certain metrics associated with--

00:48:18

Julie Kirschbaum

We have an on-time performance and service delivery targets that are established in the charter. We are not currently meeting them, but I will include those targets when I come back. What we've--what I've also been doing, because Muni, as I said, has some big challenges, but we also need to break them off into bite-size pieces, is we've been creating 90-day plans that create implementable achievements, but stretch achievements through the system and targeting kind of incremental performance targets as well. And I will share that when we meet also.

00:49:02

James Loduca

Yeah, I'd love to understand what's in your charter, and then how you've performed against that charter, let's say, over the last 12 months. I want to acknowledge that you probably have one of the hardest jobs, and God bless you.

00:49:17

Julie Kirschbaum

Harder tonight than some nights.

00:49:18

James Loduca

Because I could never do it. So thank you for your service. But I also just need to acknowledge it's staggering to me that you don't know off the top of your head what your on-time rate was for the month that just ended. It is, in my view, and I only have a very rudimentary understanding of transit, but it is perhaps one of the most important metrics that someone in your role could know. And--

00:49:49

Julie Kirschbaum

I--as I said, I'm reviewing performance daily. I just--I don't want to in a public setting say it's--

00:49:57

James Loduca

Fair.

00:49:57

Julie Kirschbaum

--59 when it was 57 or 58. But I don't want to give the impression that we're not running a very data oriented operation, because we absolutely are.

00:50:07

James Loduca

That's fair. Thank you.

00:50:11

Michael Sweet

Thank you. And I will piggyback on what Commissioner Loduca said. I, you know, you're here, and that says a lot. And you're listening. And I've had other experiences with you in other context in the city, and I saw Julie's name on the agenda and I said, "There. We're gonna have someone here who's actually listening and will process this," which we appreciate. Having said that, I think it's clear there's a lot to

process. And I think you're going to hear now from the community some things you've heard before, but maybe some other things you can take back with you. And so I want to thank you for doing your job and sticking with it, and for being here. And I'll recognize Commissioner Sweiss, or are you just saying that you're leaving? We're about to--

00:50:54

Joseph Sweiss

No. I was going to say before we open it up to public comment that I do think about ways when you do have such a hard job, and we do serve so many communities, how we actually solicit feedback from those communities who can't just come to City Hall as, you know, easy as it is for most of us to take Muni and burden the delay. So I would love to know come October, when I understand you're coming, what MTA does reaching out to so many diverse communities with regular outreach meetings, CACs, etcetera, and what more can be done? And maybe to see ways that the Human Rights Commission can also solicit feedback from communities that maybe aren't as engaged, although they depend on MTA for so many--for their day-to-day services, that maybe we can find ways to engage and get the right feedback for. So I'd be curious to see what MTA does in terms of public outreach and engagement, and then what more we can discuss and do come October to reach those communities that can't just tweet or even call or come here.

00:51:57

Julie Kirschbaum

I'd be happy to. Just as a quick summary, we try to meet people where they're at. Sometimes that's on the vehicle. Sometimes that's an intercept in the sidewalk. Sometimes it's partnering with different community groups that have built-in relationships with stakeholders. But the Human Rights Commission is a tremendous resource, because you all represent stakeholders. And having your input and having your partnership is--would be tremendous. It would be fantastic.

00:52:29

Joseph Sweiss

Thank you.

00:52:31

Michael Sweet

And with that I think we're gonna lose the quorum in a minute. The meeting won't end. Well, the meeting will end. The listening won't. And we appreciate Ms. Kirschbaum staying, and I believe she'll be here through the duration. And I've got some public comment cards now. I know there's some invited speakers here. So momentarily we'll lose our quorum, but we will continue the discussion. And I wonder can we leave the tape on, so that we continue to get a transcript, even though we won't be in session? That's great. And with that we--so we have--I have a bunch of cards, but the next item on the agenda is invited speakers. So what I'd like to do is go to the invited speakers, and we'll collect the cards. Ms. Kirschbaum, will you be able to stay until the end?

00:53:24

Julie Kirschbaum

Yeah, I'm just specifically [inaudible].

00:53:30

Michael Sweet

And we appreciate that. You're a committed diligent civil servant who probably doesn't get enough thanks in her life. But I will say thank you, and we'll now move on to the next portion of the agenda. Actually, before we do that, let me just add one more thing. I think what is gonna happen here, and I'm glad Ms. Kirschbaum is able to stay, and to what Commissioner Sweiss said in his last comment, we want to partner with you. And we have--you get to people where they are. We get to people to I th--maybe we get to other people. You know, I'm sure that if it isn't the number one favorite thing of people in town to gripe about, it's near the top of the list. But that doesn't mean that there's anyone up here, or hopefully in the room, who doesn't believe that we can help make it better. And what I hope will come out of this will be recommendations, which we would love to collaborate with you on, both in terms of gathering and then implementing. You know, w--tentatively we'll be hearing again from MTA in a month, but we could do it differently. We could go out together. We hold meetings out in the communities. Maybe our holding a meeting in the community will draw a different audience, and we're happy to work together that way. So we appreciate the openness of MTA, and the willingness to work together, and we're looking forward to collaborating. And clearly you, you know, you can't turn around a strained transit system overnight, but if

there are things that we can do to help, we would love to be a part of that. And with that, I will ask the commission secretary to read the first--read down the list of invited speakers.

00:55:25

Commission Secretary

Item 3C, invited speakers. One, Department of Aging and Adult Services, Shireen McSpadden, Director. Two, Homeless Prenatal Program, Malia Chavez. Three, Mayor's Office on Disability. Four, SF Transit Riders Board and City College Trustee Thea Selby. Five, Department of Public Health, Cheryl Thornton.

00:55:51

Michael Sweet

And I think--is it--is Diane Lawrence here? Is that--yes? Come on up.

00:56:08

Diane Lawrence

Good evening, commissioners. I'm Diane Lawrence. I'm the president of the Advisory Council to the Aging and Adult Services Commission. I've been asked to make a few comments about the work of the council that we've been doing on transit and pedestrian issues for seniors and adults with disabilities.

I wanted to just briefly state what the council does, because we're probably not well known within the city. So we advise the commission on all matters relating to the development, administration and operations of its area plan, which comes out of the Older Americans Act, including needs assessments, priorities, programs, budgets and other matters relating to the well being of the population served within the scope and spirit of federal, state and local regulations, laws and ordinances. We're made up of 22 members, one from each supervisorial district, and 11 appointed by the commission at large. So there are 22 of us on the commission--on the council.

So what I was asked to do was provide some demographics, because I think this speaks to what you've been talking about. So older adults are the fastest growing age group. Nearly 30% of San Franciscans will be a senior, that is over age 60, by 2030. Currently about 1 in 4 San Franciscans are seniors, and we have one of the most diverse senior populations within the country. About 1 in 10 San Franciscans report a disability. That's approximately 94,000 people. About half of those are under age 65. So you can see that transit equity is a--addresses--hits a big population of San Francisco. Mobility and independent living are among the highest reported challenges and concerns.

So over the past year, year and a half, the council has had an ad hoc group that's made up of a commission member and council members discussing primarily the issue of pedestrian safety, and that's accessible and safe sidewalks, safe intersections, considerations when planning upgrades, the Van Ness Street project. The Geary Street holes, you know, uneven sidewalks, all of those have been discussed. Paratransit availability and reliability are critical issues. We've had Paratransit come to speak to us two or three times. The ease of loading onto and off of Muni buses and streetcars are an issue. Often mentioned amongst these two groups are bus shelters. Many of them have been taken away or don't exist, and this becomes an issue with the populations where they're not protected from rain. They're not protected, and they can't sit while waiting for their bus or streetcar. And the accessible bus stops in front of nutrition sites, churches and stores have also been raised often as concerns. So that pretty much speaks to the comments I have on both the population and what our concerns are with transit issues.

00:59:42

Michael Sweet

Thank you. Does anyone have any questions for Diane?

00:59:48

Diane Lawrence

And I'll just say I am a Muni rider. I got here on Muni with my Clipper card today.

00:59:54

Michael Sweet

Did you arrive on time?

00:59:56

Diane Lawrence

And I did, and because the bus signage did work on the L Taraval, which can be a problematic line.

01:00:05

Great. Thank you.

Michael Sweet

01:00:07

Thank you.

Diane Lawrence

01:00:07

And we appreciate your coming. I'm gonna move Nicole Bohn up. She's from the mayor's Office on Disability. I'll move her up next.

Michael Sweet

01:00:40

Good evening, commissioners. Can you hear me okay? I'll try to get a little closer here. Okay. Good evening. I'm Nicole Bohn. I'm the director of the mayor's Office on Disability. Thank you for inviting me here today. What I want to do is talk for a minute about what our charge is, and how we work together with SFMTA. There's a lot that we're focused on that is very positive, and I don't want to lose those thoughts, but I also want to take some time to make you aware of some of the things that we are also hearing. And you'll hear some duplication from Diane's comments, and I think it's really important that we hear--we're hearing from some of the same communities, so I just wanted to highlight some of those things.

Nicole Bohn

So first of all, the charge of the mayor's Office on Disability specifically is as the city's overall Americans with Disabilities Act coordinator on behalf of the city. So as part of that charge we work very closely with our ADA coordinators in our various city departments. And SFMTA has a fairly robust ADA coordinator team in SFMTA Accessible Services, and we work very closely with them on a number of initiatives.

Many of the complaints and concerns that we hear from individuals with disabilities or older adults are channeled directly to our colleagues in SFMTA Accessible Services. But also, part of our charge in the mayor's Office on Disability is to help to, similarly with HRC, to make sure that our complaints and concerns are responded to in a timely way, so we do a fair amount of grievance monitoring as well. So to the specific items that the mayor's Office on Disability hears about quite frequently related to transit are specifically around removal of bus stops seating, types of seating used, especially on our light rail vehicles, concerns about parking protected bike lanes, and our messaging around parking in general, especially for folks who use accessible vehicles as their primary mode of transit, crowding on bus lines. And also some concern that's been happening recently as we're thinking about transit equity and what does that mean, that the concern is that our buses, especially our above ground buses and transit lines, becoming vehicles specifically for older adults and people with disabilities only, and then what does that mean. So those are some of the basic things.

Another thing that we hear fairly frequently is that we really want to work with our colleagues in SFMTA to figure out the best way to do broader community outreach on those issues that are impacting people with disabilities. In particular I think that SFMTA does a really good job at ma--using the tools that we have. Our web and Internet based tools are used very well, and also, they do a good job of engaging with our Multi Modal Accessibility Advisory Committee, which consists of folks with disabilities, and also engaging on occasion with our mayor's Disability Council, which also has broad representation of disability. However, we--I am really wanting us to find ways that we can reach even more people, and especially those folks who might not have immediate access to the Internet.

One of the things that I am working on with some of our colleagues in SFMTA right now are accessibility improvement fact sheets, as it were, for some of our transit improvement project, that help to highlight what's happening to the project, the accessibility enhancements that will result from the work, and that kind of thing. And we're just starting this, and I'm finding that people are responding to those well. And I'm hoping that we can utilize those on all of our transit projects.

Let's see. I think that that's--those are the main things that I want to highlight. Again, we're doing a lot of work that I didn't mention today, and I want to encourage the commission, and also anyone in the audience

today, that wants to learn more about what the mayor's Office on Disability is doing to definitely contact us. Because there are many MTA related issues that aren't specifically related to bus line transit that I haven't mentioned that we are working on, and so I really want to make sure folks know that we're a resource. And also, to encourage the HRC commissioners to partner on some of these issues with our mayor's Disability Council. The mayor's Disability Council is specifically also interested in issues of transit, housing, and employment. So to the degree that those issues also over--intersect with you, the mayor's Disability Council is interested in working with you and sharing thoughts on how to make improvements in those areas too. That's where I'll stop for now I guess.

01:07:05

Michael Sweet

Thank you, Ms. Bohn. I--do y--can you tell me a little bit about what you hear from the communities you serve about how they'd like to see improvements in transit in the city specifically?

01:07:20

Nicole Bohn

I think--

01:07:21

Michael Sweet

Or shortcomings that are identified for you, things that people--what do people bring to your attention?

01:07:26

Nicole Bohn

Well, some of those things that I mentioned that are the most common, which I'll mention again, which are specifically bus stop removal. When we're changing the--when we're changing our street plan and certain bus stops have been removed, we hear about that quite frequently. Bus stop seating being available or not, shelters being available or not, broken or not. That's a very common one. Another very common one that I men--I'll mention again is concern around where--with all of our street changes, for folks that need access to accessible parking, and especially van accessible parking, where is that? There's a lot of misunderstanding on that particular issue, because SFMTA does have a--as part of their strategy, they are not removing blue zones. But because they move, it's--it doesn't seem like they're not removing them, right? So we spend a lot of time talking with folks about that. And then also specifically around accessibility and our parking protected bike lanes, we're hearing about that quite frequently. And there is a team that is working specifically on helping to make improvements there. And then crowding and access to buses, being passed up on bus lines because of overcrowding. That kind of thing is also quite common.

01:09:10

Michael Sweet

Thank you.

01:09:11

Nicole Bohn

Sure

01:09:12

Michael Sweet

Other questions from up here on the desk? Okay. Thank you for your time.

01:09:18

Nicole Bohn

You're welcome.

01:09:19

Michael Sweet

Thank you for your work. And we look forward to partnering with you on this initiative.

01:09:22

Nicole Bohn

That's great. Thank you.

01:09:23

Michael Sweet

And others.

01:09:24

Nicole Bohn

Great. That's perfect.

01:09:28

Michael Sweet

From the Homeless Prenatal Program, Malia Chavez. Ms. Chavez?

01:09:37

Malia Chavez

Hello. Good evening. My name is Malia Chavez--

01:09:39

Michael Sweet

Oh.

01:09:39

Malia Chavez

--and I'm the Deputy Director at the Homeless Prenatal Program. And our center serves approximately 3,500 families a year, and of those we serve about 800 pregnant individuals a year. So just wanting to highlight one of the main issues that came up recently, Supervisor Stefani actually sponsored a hearing on food insecurity on September 12, and one of the main things that continued to come up was accessibility around transportation so that people can get to the food pantries or different food opportunities, including grocery shopping, and some of the accessibility issues around bus stops. So that was one of them, and access to Paratransit or Paratransit Lake, shuttles and taxi vouchers as well.

So the biggest ones that came up were some of the barriers and obstacles to service, included the reliability around on time. I really appreciate the commissioners' comments, pretty much all of you, around the reliability and need for reliable transportation for people who rely on Muni to get to work. That is a large part of our population. We also have people who experience real hardships when buses are not reliable. Or they're delayed for court appointments for child care is a big one, because people are charged additional fees when they're late for picking up child care, or in some cases can have, you know, other people, family members call and just cause a lot of drama, especially if they're reunification process. So just thinking about some of those real impacts on people's lives when a bus is 30 minutes late, and somebody doesn't know that it just disappeared from NextBus.

And then also looking at really accommodating strollers and grocery carts, so being able to transport items and that accessibility I think is a similar theme to what we just heard from seniors and disabled individuals as well. The ease of boarding on and off is huge. Also, the reception by bus drivers is a big one, people not balking at the fact that, you know, a person is entering the bus with two small children under the age of five, might be pregnant, carrying groceries, may or may not have a stroller in addition, and just, like, the patience that it takes to kind of manage that. We hear a lot of feedback around that. We also have a lot of clients who are reluctant to report that kind of behavior, because they don't want to get their bus drivers in trouble and/or they don't want to be banned from the bus. So those are other just things to consider, since we have a wonderful Muni captivated audience today.

And then I think the last thing I will also highlight is the removal of bus stops. One of the consistent complaints from the Family Resource Centers across the city, which are mostly in the southeast and southwest part of the city, are around the accessibility of bus stops. So HPP, for instance, in on 18th and Potrero, and our bus stop that was right outside, which was one of the main reasons we purchased the building, was removed last year. And so even though it's only a couple of blocks to walk up to Potrero and 8--sorry, 16th, it is still a trek when you're dealing with strollers and all of the other things that I mentioned, and especially when you have multiple children. So just yeah, considering those things when making those decisions would be fantastic.

I am also a Muni rider. Love it. My mom rides Muni. She's also a nanny, and she experiences some of these challenges with onboarding too. And I do want to say that I appreciate the weekly bulletin from MTA, especially now with the Chase Center. Because I live in the Bayview, and it really does impact traffic getting to UCSF, like, all of that, Kaiser appointments, all of those things. So any questions?

01:13:52

Michael Sweet

I want to recognize Commissioner Da--Director Davis, former Commissioner Davis. Before I do, was there--when you said--so you purchased a building next to a bus stop to serve your community, and the bus stop moved. Did you--were you aware if there was an entire process around that? Signs up, "We're moving the bus stop."

01:14:12

Malia Chavez

Oh, we knew that the bus--well, so the building was purchased, I should be really clear, 13 years ago now. So we had the good fortune of being there for a while. But one of the reasons that site was selected by not only our organization, but our board of directors, was because of its accessibility to major transit lines, as well as the proximity to General Hospital. And so, I mean, the building is still a wonderful location, but just having that removed last year has really impacted people's ability to get to appointments on time. And also, in some cases, when moms or pregnant individuals are further along in their pregnancy, it makes it harder for them to actually show up without us paying for a taxi, because they don't want to walk those extra two blocks kind of uphill. It's a hardship for them.

01:15:01

Michael Sweet

So my question was more were--Muni, my understanding is before Muni mo--changes around or moves a bus stop, there's a process. There are signs. There's community meetings.

01:15:11

Malia Chavez

Yes.

01:15:12

Michael Sweet

Ms. Kirschaum might've come to the community to meet you. Did that happen when they moved your bus stop?

01:15:17

Malia Chavez

Yes, there were. And we had opportunity to comment, and I think we also submitted letters and comments from the community. So yeah, it was a very open process. It's just still at the end of the day we lost it.

01:15:31

Michael Sweet

Great. Okay. Thank you. Director Davis?

01:15:34

Director Davis

Yeah, I just wanted to the--I'm trying to make sure we get to communities, so I haven't been speaking up. But the two things that you mentioned that I just wanted to drill down on, and also think about how we address and think about partnering with SFMTA, first around the reception on the bus or even at the bus stops. I did last year just a little bit later than this time with the mayor, we did a visit to Hilltop, the school for parenting teens. And one of the things that they talked about were buses passing them up when they have strollers to not let them on the bus with the stroller, and people being upset with them for having to lower the ramp to get the bu--the strollers on, and that sometimes that they're told to just pick them up and bring them on, which is often difficult to do with an individual. So that was a thing that we heard. And I know that at that time the mayor had said for us to potentially work with young people around making suggestions and recommendations around addressing some of the challenges that people who have strollers and babies receive. And then I was on Muni the other day, and someone got on with a stroller. And just the way that they were treated once they got on the bus and told, like, they were just making it inconvenient for everyone else, and shifted and moved in multiple spaces, and that there was no real support for them.

And then just with the bus stop removals or moving, I think that that's another piece for us to really think about how to do engagement and how we define equity. Because the issue is not necessarily about the majority wins in something like this, which would be more about equal than equitable. And the challenge is that a lot of times those bus stops being moved become a public safety issue, they become a public health issue, because again, we've seen it. And I think Cheryl Thornton may speak to this, but about a person's ability to travel uphill, whether they're older, whether they are suffering with other, like, asthma or other ailments that might impact their ability to move. So I think that those challenges of things that we've tried

too in the past working with different groups to think about what it looks like to be equitable, and not just necessarily, like, looking at the number of people who speak out. And understanding a lot of times the mailers and things that go out do not get to the folks that are actually living in the residence or that connection. So I just bring that up because those are two issues that I think hit across the spectrum of age, abilities, and really I think the most marginalized communities are most negatively impacted by it.

01:18:26

Michael Sweet

Thank you, Director Davis. Commissioner Loduca?

01:18:30

James Loduca

I'll be quick and direct this actually to our director, who is coming back in October with a further report out. I'd like to understand what--how the community feedback process works, and specific to this process and just in general. Because it seems like, based on the testimony we've heard, that there was a rather engaged disenfranchised community that spoke out and were verbal, and yet did not result in any change of ultimate decision. So I just want to have a better understanding about how that process works, how this decision was made, and how it might impact other marginalized communities.

01:19:09

Malia Chavez

Can I just say one other thing around highlighting that for the Family Resource Centers there's 26 of them across the city, and oftentimes people who are accessing them are also not necessarily just from the neighborhood. Like, we provide unique services for pregnant individuals, and so we get people from all over the city. And so even though it may just be one address that is in fact providing the feedback, it's impacting many lives. So I love that point, and just wanted to highlight that. Thank you.

01:19:39

Michael Sweet

Thank you. Next we have San Francisco Transit Riders. I have Cat Carter. Is that right? Yes.

01:19:56

Cat Carter

Hello. Good evening, commissioners. My name is Cat Carter. I'm the acting executive director with San Francisco Transit Riders. We are a membership based independent nonprofit advocating for better transit around San Francisco. We are very small, but we are getting bigger. And what we're focusing on these days is a sort of transit priority.

As we've been hearing, too much of the Muni system is too slow and too infrequent and too unreliable, especially in communities identified in the equity strategy and in the outer neighborhoods. And we also worked, not me personally, but our organization, worked with Muni with the SFMTA to develop that equity strategy back in 2014, so we do have a basis in that. And we've worked with them very well on some transit improvement projects in some of those equity neighborhoods.

As I don't need to tell you, frequent, rapid and reliable transit means access to resources and to economic opportunities. To get frequent, rapid and reliable transit means that we need more transit improvements that bring us transit priority on the streets. We have increasing traffic congestion that is slowing down buses. I'm hearing that Muni has to put more buses and more trains on the streets in order to try to keep up with service, just because they're getting slowed down so much. So our focus is on getting more transit priority on the streets. We have a campaign called Thirty by Thirty, the Rapid Rider Network, where we want a network of rapid routes that really criss-crosses the city and really connects all neighborhoods, so all neighborhoods are really accessible, where the rapid routes go end-to-end in 30 minutes by 2030.

We have a network of rapid routes. It mostly focuses on getting people downtown, and not serving a lot of the outer neighborhoods. And where it works, it works really well. We've seen increases in ridership of 22% on a survey on the 5R Corridor. They found that 15% of the new riders were getting out of their private cars and onto Muni. And that makes neighborhoods safer, and that reduces congestion, and that reduces accidents and crashes and incidents. And the challenge often is that to try to do these improvements there are these years of community outreach. And I think community outreach is very important, and not to dismiss anything that just was discussed. We are working on rapid transit--rapid bus service, rather, on the

29 Sunset, which serves the southern neighborhoods and the western neighborhoods, and on the T 3rd, which we all know legendarily has problems with service. And the thing is that transit improvements can take these years of outreach and planning, and in the meantime riders are suffering, and they're standing at bus stops waiting, and they don't know when their vehicles are coming.

So we want to actually recommend identifying a quick build process for Muni, the way that we have with vision zero improvements and with bike lanes. We need to cut through some of this red tape. We need pilot projects, and make that part of the outreach with communities wherever that's possible, and in more neighborhoods across the city. This would mean that we could get crucial common sense improvements that would provide relief for riders much quicker. It would also allow for real world evaluation of impacts, and determine whatever modifications are needed. But we really need to put Muni first on our streets. It's an equity issue, it is an access issue, and it's a safety issue. If we want reliable service for all riders, and for Muni to be accessible to all riders, SFMTA needs to prioritize Muni on our streets on all routes, as dictated by our transit first policy. Thank you. Any questions?

01:23:32

Michael Sweet

Thank you. We have questions?

01:23:34

Cat Carter

Thank you so much.

01:23:35

Michael Sweet

Thank you for joining us and for joining this dialogue. I have--I heard, although it's not on--yes, Thea Selby from City College?

01:23:47

Unidentified female

Oh, no.

01:23:48

Cat Carter

That was me.

01:23:49

Director Davis

That was who just spoke.

01:23:50

Michael Sweet

Oh.

01:23:51

Director Davis

Thea just spoke.

01:23:52

Unidentified female

Cat spoke for her.

01:23:53

Michael Sweet

Oh, Cat spoke for Thea. Got it. I--so okay. I see. So then I have Cheryl Thornton.

01:24:03

Cheryl Thornton

Hi. Good evening, commissioners. My name is Cheryl Thornton, and I work for the Department of Public Health. I've worked in District 10 for the Department of Public Health for 28 years at Potrero Hill Health Center, and now I'm at Southeast Health Center.

Transportation barriers are often cited as barriers to healthcare access. Transportation barriers lead to rescheduled or missed appointments, delayed care, and missed or delayed medication use. These consequences may lead to poor management of chronic illness, and thus poor health outcomes. Transportation is a basic but necessary step for ongoing healthcare and medication access, particularly for

those with chronic disease. Chronic disease can require clinicians visits, medications, and access, changes to treatment plans in order to provide evidence based care. However, without transportation, delays in clinical intervention results. Such delays in care may lead to a lack of appropriate medical treatment, chronic disease exacerbation, or unmet healthcare needs, which can accumulate and worsen healthcare outcomes.

Many studies have been done and have identified that transportation barriers can lead to early death for those with chronic disease. In addition, San Francisco Muni prices have consistently risen, and are now up to \$3 per ride. The rides provide a transfer that is good for 120 minutes from the time of purchase. If Muni is late or encounters delays that are out of the patient's control, the transfer still expires, and the patient has to pay another \$3, their trip now costing up to \$12 round trip.

The Alice Griffith Housing Complex is home to many of the San Francisco Health Network public clinic patients. These patients have to take two to three buses to visit their provider at Southeast Health Center, and four buses to get to San Francisco General. Wait times are 10 to 15 minutes for the first bus, with an additional 10 to 20 minutes for the second and third bus, and then walk. A low income household is generally unable to pay \$12 for bus fare, and commonly becomes fare evaders, causing them to acquire fees and penalties. Our most vulnerable populations need and require immediate attention and sustainable solutions on SFMTA equity lines in order to improve their health.

I want to say that we had--we have women who come prenat--pregnant women who come, or with their newborn babies, who have just had--well, they just had newborn babies. They're on the bus, they're late to their appointments, and then they can't be seen. Many of these patients are black African Americans. The SIDS rate is highest in the black African American population. And so we do need change in District 10 for around equity on the lines.

I was part of the s--Potrero Hill lost their bus about four years ago. It was at 53, I think, Southern Heights. It was a community bus that would drive people. It would go around Potrero Hill. Potrero Hill is a very hilly terrain. So people who live down in the public housing in Potrero Hill really need to take a bus just to get to the top of the hill to the clinic. Well, bus lines were moved. Bus lines were removed, and people could not get to the clinic. So we've had some people who probably have lost their life prematurely due to the fact that there is not equity in the bus lines in District 10. So that's what I wanted to say. So I don't know if there's any questions, but thank you.

01:28:14

Michael Sweet

Thank you. I--let me ask, and we could address this now or at a future meeting. But are there specific items that you think, you know, bring back bus stops or a line, but are there specific items that you could think of that would help alleviate some of the issues you've discussed?

01:28:34

Cheryl Thornton

Yeah, so many of our patients use Paratransit. But Paratransit you have to make an appointment 48 hours prior to the appointment. And if you get sick, if you're a diabetic, if your sugar goes awry, you will not be able to use Paratransit if you have not booked an appointment within 48 hours. That's the first thing.

The second thing is oftentimes Paratransit runs late to the appointments. Sometimes they're an hour late. So when the patients get there, we try to see them. Next thing you know, Paratransit is back at your door saying, "If you don't get on the Paratransit now then you're gonna miss your ride." You have to call in, and you might wait there for three or four hours to get picked up.

The other thing is the Paratransit card that you get where you load 18--you pay \$18 for taxi vouchers and they--I guess Paratransit will--Muni or Paratransit will match it with \$72, so you have a total of \$90. The problem with that is if your Paratransit card is empty, you have to go to the office. There's no online way to load the card, so they have to go to the office, oftentimes paying the regular cab fare just to get to the office, so that they can acquire the Paratransit card to get the reduced taxi fees.

So I think that Paratransit needs to be looked into. It needs to be more--it needs to be on time. It needs to be more thoughtful about the patients and how they book them. They need to have an emergency where you can book within less than 24 hours if you're going to your healthcare provider, and you're sick, and that's your only means of transportation. And I think the Paratransit card needs to be, again, needs to be able--you should be able to load it online versus going to an office somewhere.

01:30:37

Michael Sweet

Well, and as you're saying that, and then I'm thinking about one other thing you said, it struck me that, and Ms. Kirschbaum, tell me if I've got this wrong, the cash fare for Muni is \$3, but if you have a Clipper card it's still \$2.50. Is that right?

01:30:49

Julie Kirschbaum

Yes. Clipper [inaudible].

01:31:00

Michael Sweet

So--and I'll say this so it ends up in the transcript. What Ms. Kirschbaum said is, "Which is why they're working with MTC on a discounted day pass." Currently they only have a discounted monthly pass. So this would be something that someone could pay \$5 cash and then have a pass good for a day?

01:31:16

Julie Kirschbaum

That is their current [inaudible].

01:31:22

Michael Sweet

It'd be a discount below that. And--but would you be able to do that with--without the Clip--would you still have to have the Clipper card?

01:31:30

Julie Kirschbaum

I don't know.

01:31:31

Michael Sweet

Okay. 'Cause I'm hearing, like, you know, it occurs to me, you know, I've got a Clipper card. It's tied to a Visa card. I swipe it. It goes and gets more money when it needs it, and--'cause that's--I can do that. There's other people who can't, and they end up paying cash, so they pay more. And they have to pay twice because they miss a bus, and they have to pay because they have to come back because they can't get a Paratransit. So it strikes me that, you know, maybe there's another connection here in terms of--I know why Muni is moving away from the cash fares, but it's probably, you know, it's affecting certain communities in ways that maybe weren't considered at the time that the decision to move away from the cash fare was made. And I see Commissioner Clopton.

01:32:21

Cheryl Thornton

There was one more thing I wanted to just bring out, a point.

01:32:24

Michael Sweet

Sure.

01:32:24

Cheryl Thornton

So the--I guess SFMTA is working with Potrero Hill and Southeast Health Center. It's called the Choice Program. So that program basically is going to take 25 of our patients at Potrero Hill and 25 of the patients at Southeast Health Center who don't qualify for Paratransit to have maybe Flywheel vouchers to get to their doctor's appointment. But this problem is so long standing, to only have 25 patients to be admitted to that program at Potrero Hill and 25 at Southeast is really not acceptable at this point. So I just wanted to make that point that I think Choice Program needs to be expanded already. So thank you.

01:33:11

Michael Sweet

Thank you. Commissioner Clopton?

01:33:12

I did have a question.

Karen Clopton

01:33:14

Oh, sorry.

Cheryl Thornton

01:33:16

That's all right. Okay. So my question was about the 53 line. So before that was, I guess, discontinued, did people have to take four buses to get to, you know, from Alice Griffith to the services?

Karen Clopton

01:33:43

So well, the 53 bus was in Potrero Hill, and that was removed. That's a very hilly terrain up there, and so that bus circulated from 16th and Potrero up to Potrero Hill all around. So many people who lived up on those hills could not get to their doctor's appointment.

Cheryl Thornton

01:34:00

I see.

Karen Clopton

01:34:01

And Alice Griffith, that's a new, I guess, new housing development. They've rebuilt it. So yeah, no. It--I guess it's always taken two to three buses to get there, because--

Cheryl Thornton

01:34:14

I see.

Karen Clopton

01:34:14

--you have to take a bus down the hill, then you've got to get on the T train, and then you've got to walk.

Cheryl Thornton

01:34:18

I see. I see. So is their solution currently the Paratransit and this Choice that you were just talking about?

Karen Clopton

01:34:29

So SFMTA is offering 25 patients who do not qualify for Paratransit to be part of the Choice Program to get to and from their medical appointments. But that's only 25 patients. I believe Southeast has 5,000 patients. Again, we're in District 10 where some of the most vulnerable and lowest income residents live in San Francisco. So 25 people in the Choice Program to get to their doctor's appointment is not adequate for a patient base of 5,000 patients. That's just not adequate.

Cheryl Thornton

01:35:09

So I would say to the Muni representative that this entire issue about the healthcare disparities and access to healthcare in District 10 needs to be reevaluated. Because this is not the first, you know, you're, like, the third person today to talk about access to healthcare, and the impact, the negative impact, can be fatal. And so we are talking about people's lives, and there must be a different solution than the stop gap measures described in the Choice Program. And it also sounds like there are enough people in need of public transportation that there should be a wider solution, and I don't think it's a--it should wait 18 months or 12 months or even six months. It seems like it's an immediate and urgent issue.

Karen Clopton

01:36:25

And the last thing I wanted to add is a statistic that San Francisco has the worst mortality for African Americans in the nation. We live 12 to 15 years less in San Francisco than any other city. And the average income of a black person in San Francisco is \$29,000. The average income of a--their white counterpart is \$110,000 a year. And with this being said, that--many of our pa--our residents, our black African American residents, are dying just because they don't have access to healthcare, adequate healthcare. So I think, you know, we're a progressive city, the city of St. Francis. We're very innovative. So to have the worst

Cheryl Thornton

health outcomes in the nation for your black African American residents is not acceptable. And we need change, and we need it now. Thank you.

01:37:21

Karen Clopton

Right. Thank you.

01:37:23

Michael Sweet

Thank you. I understand that we have another--yeah, we have another commissioner's request for comments. Thank you. I understand we actually do have representatives here of SF Paratransit, and so we'll just add that to the list, and come on up. We'll take all comers here.

01:37:45

Marc Soto

Good evening. My name is Marc Soto. I'm with Transit of North America, and we manage the SFMTA Paratransit Program. And I really didn't have any prepared remarks. I just have been listening to some of the comments that have been made, and I wanted just to start by making a few clarifications.

The SF Paratransit--SFMTA Paratransit Program has many components, many moving parts. The van transportation, which is approximately about 60% of our service, is guided by all the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act. So the reservations, they had reser--or excuse me, the scheduling ahead of time that was referred to in the previous speaker's comments, is day ahead. It's not 48 hours. It's not even 24 hours. It's day ahead that you call and schedule a ride. The ADA prohibits us from giving priority to medical trips. It says all trips have to be accommodated. So it doesn't matter if they're medical, if they're work, school, recreation. It doesn't matter, so there are no provisions for prioritizing trips.

Same day trips are accommodated on an as space available basis, with preference then given to medical needs. So if a rider has for some reason an urgent medical need, they can call and try to schedule for that same day, and priority in that case is given to medical needs. Or if, for example, someone's service animal became ill and they need to get it to the veterinarian, that qualifies as well. That's where the priorities are given for same day. 40% of the service is taxi. And just to clarify on the way the taxi Paratran--the Paratransit taxi card works, it's for every \$30 worth of value that you add to your card, you get for ev--we charge \$6. So for every \$30 of value you get, you pay \$6. That gives you \$30 of taxi rides. Those are also--those don't require, obviously, a day ahead. You can--those are on demand. You would call on the day you need service. So that works well for many of our patrons.

I also wanted to mention that on the Choice Program I think she said--the previous speaker said it's 25 patrons. It's actually 75. That's the way the pilot is supposed to start with 75 patrons. And we've been working very collaboratively with the Department of Health on that program. So it's not to say that it won't need more resources at some point, but it hasn't even started yet. I think it's scheduled to start next month, and we'll see how that works out and if--I'm sure MTA will be very closely in communications with DPH on what resources need to be added.

I want to just mention on the taxi card we did launch a by telephone, so you can call if you have a credit card. You can call and add value to your Paratransit debit card. She mentioned the need for online access. That's actually being pilot tested right now. You do need a credit card to be able to purchase online, but we did open that up to pilot participants, and that's being tested right now by our pilot participants. We're doing a soft launch for the general public that uses Paratransit. So those are some of the things that we are and have been working on.

I wanted to mention that we--I heard Julie talk about the chronic operator shortage. We had a similar chronic shortage earlier this year. We have pretty much resolved that. It's never totally resolved. You're always recruiting for operators. But because we've been able to address it at least to some level, our on-time performance has steadily improved to over 90%. This is on the van service. That's with a five-minute before, 15-minute after promise time. It's called a performance window. So our drivers are delivering the on-time performance 90%--that means that 9 out of 10 rides are on time within that performance window.

We did expand the Paratransit dedicated fleet by 18 new vehicles. That included 10 cutaways and 8 hybrid sedans. They're plug-in hybrids. We also conducted our 2019 independent Paratransit satisfaction survey. This survey is a statistically significant sample of Paratransit consumers both on the taxi side, on the van side, on our group transportation side. And there was an overall 81% were very satisfied or somewhat satisfied with our services. 90% satisfaction rate regarding the survey trip. 93% satisfaction with the administration of the San Francisco M--the SFMTA Paratransit Program.

So those were just a few things I wanted to mention. We also did launch new incentives for ramp taxi operators who are transporting wheelchairs in ramp taxis to make the initiative a little bit more attractive for our drivers. So I just wanted to make those remarks.

01:42:43

Michael Sweet

Thank you. Commissioner Da--Director Davis?

01:42:46

Director Davis

And I just wanted to say again as we think about partnership with SFMTA and Muni, like what it looks like to make sure that everyone is clear on that. Because again, that sharing the clarifying remarks here may not change where or how a community communicates that information to the people that they meet or work with at the clinics. So I think part of this for us is to really think about, like, the people that are most impacted, how they get truth in what they've experienced versus what we say is on paper. Because a lot of times people take advantage of folks not having in hand, and they're told something very different. And that's why these things get perpetuated, because they call and somebody says, "Oh, you know, they--" for whatever reason. And so I just think that there's a need for us to really be in community and sharing, and have the pieces of paper so that people aren't just doing it by word of mouth.

01:43:46

Marc Soto

Thank you, commissioner. We are--I just want to assure you that we work very collaboratively with the SFMTA staff. We're working on a relaunch of the website, so that it has more current accurate information for our riders, and we'll continue to focus on those kinds of issues, commissioner.

01:44:01

Michael Sweet

Are you--you do this under contract with MTA?

01:44:04

Marc Soto

With SFMTA, that's correct.

01:44:05

Michael Sweet

It's SFMTA? And what's the length of that contract?

01:44:08

Marc Soto

It's five years. We're in--let's see, 2016. We're in year three, on our way to year four. It does have a five-year extension option, so it could go--the maximum is 10 years.

01:44:20

Michael Sweet

And is this the first contract? Have you been in--was--is this the first term of the first contract?

01:44:25

Marc Soto

No. The first term was April of 2000, so I've been here managing the SFMTA Paratransit Program since April 1 of 2000. So I have a little seniority.

01:44:38

Michael Sweet

Okay. So I'm curious. What percent of--if you--do you have a good sense of who your riders are, who your users are, what--

01:44:49

Marc Soto

Generally.

01:44:50

Michael Sweet

--they--what's available to them? What percent of them also use Muni, do you know?

01:44:55

Marc Soto

I know that was a question we asked in their survey. So I didn't bring all the survey results with me, but I can certainly provide you that information from the survey. From--every year we survey our riders in a statistically significant way.

01:45:09

Michael Sweet

And do you have a sense of what percent of them have access to a mobile device?

01:45:14

Marc Soto

That's also in the survey, and it's been going up every year. We've been asking that questions since about 2015, and we've seen an upward click. It's actually pretty impressive the way it's grown in terms of access.

01:45:27

Michael Sweet

Is the survey published somewhere?

01:45:29

Marc Soto

It is. It's at--available through the MTA. They have the executive summaries.

01:45:34

Michael Sweet

Okay. So that's on the--is that on the website or just--

01:45:37

Marc Soto

I don't believe it's on the website, but it is available.

01:45:41

Michael Sweet

If you--I'd be interested to see that data as we continue this discussion. I'm wondering as I'm hearing this, as I'm talking about the fact that not everyone has a mobile phone, I'm also thinking about, you know, the fact you can get Uber and maybe more reliable and maybe less expensive Uber or Lyft or, you know, I guess we don't have Sidecar anymore, but ride sharing, rides from the ride sharing platforms. Is--do you have any interface with ride sharing platforms?

01:46:08

Marc Soto

Well, we do have the Flywheel app that we have sort of--

01:46:12

Michael Sweet

Which is a taxi?

01:46:13

Marc Soto

It is for taxi, 'cause we only have relationships with taxis on the Paratransit side. We don't have relationships with TNCs. And so we have worked very closely with the app developer to create--to make it easy to use by riders in wheelchairs, so they can access the ramp taxis quickly, 'cause that something that they really felt strongly about. So it's still something we're working on and trying to--we're always trying to improve that app.

01:46:38

Michael Sweet

And are they able to pay seamlessly through the app?

01:46:42

Marc Soto

It's not yet the seamless--the payment is not yet seamless. You would still present your Paratransit debit card to the driver upon completion of the trip to pay for the trip, but you can hail it using the app.

01:46:54

Michael Sweet

Is w--do you have a sense of what premium is paid for a taxi as opposed to using a--what, you said TNC? Is that--what does that mean?

01:47:05

Marc Soto

Those are your, like, your Lyft and your Uber.

01:47:06

Michael Sweet

But what does that--what does TNC stand for?

01:47:08

Marc Soto

Oh, transportation network companies.

01:47:11

Michael Sweet

Okay.

01:47:12

Marc Soto

So actually the Paratransit rider that uses the app does not have to pay for using the app. It's free. It's totally free to the end user, so they will not pay anything extra because they e-hail a taxi.

01:47:26

Michael Sweet

I understand, but the--a tax--I'm--I haven't ta--I admittedly haven't taken a taxi in a while, because it's just easier to use the other, but if I'm not riding the K of course. But if one did, taxis are more expensive than TNCs, correct?

01:47:42

Marc Soto

It depends. They also don't have the search pricing issues and so forth, so it depends. I don't think a study's been done exactly on that yet.

01:47:50

Michael Sweet

Okay. I--and maybe something since you do have users who have access to technology, and since it sounds like you're working towards incorporating the payment module into the technology--

01:48:03

Marc Soto

That would be the next step.

01:48:04

Michael Sweet

Because there's, you know, there are carpool opportunities available through the apps as well, and that may be a way for someone who has little extra time to get somewhere with a card or a voucher. It may open up a lot of opportunities to people, assuming they have the device, that aren't open today.

01:48:24

Marc Soto

So we'll never go back to vouchers. We came from vouchers, right? So everything's electronic and--

01:48:29

Michael Sweet

Right. The card then.

01:48:30

Marc Soto

Right, the card. So--and that gives us just lots and lots of data that's very helpful to us in terms of planning. So even, for example, if the MTA says--comes to me and says, you know, they want to install a speed bump between this block and this block on this street, "Can you tell us how many Paratransit riders are using that particular block?" We can tell them how many van riders, how many taxi riders are using that particular block. So the card is definitely the way to go, because it gives us a lot of data.

01:49:04

Michael Sweet

Commissioner Loduca?

01:49:07

James Loduca

So I recognize this is maybe outside of your area of responsibility, but since you seem to be working on the app and love the app, and are making enhancements to make it more accessible, more versatile for people who have transit constraints, I'm curious if there is any contemplation of functionality to request a taxi with a carseat.

01:49:28

Marc Soto

Taxi with a carseat?

01:49:30

James Loduca

A carseat.

01:49:30

Marc Soto

Like for a child carseat?

01:49:32

James Loduca

Yes.

01:49:33

Marc Soto

No, we hadn't contemplated it. But it's not something we--and, you know, when we get feedback from our riders we don't--that's not something we generally have heard. But I'll look into it.

01:49:44

James Loduca

So it's if you work with populations that have a large cohort of either young mothers or expecting mothers, they acce--the availability to hail a car that has access to a carseat is something that usually tends to be in high demand.

01:49:59

Marc Soto

Okay. So I know if I'm--and I'm--I need to go back and look at this, but if I remember the rider policies for Paratransit, we do tell our riders that if they're traveling with a child, they provide the carseat. And of course the drivers will assist with, you know, setting it up. So--

01:50:19

Michael Sweet

Commissioner Clopton?

01:50:23

Karen Clopton

I have more of a comment than th--about the TNCs. So the TNCs are largely unregulated, and because they are personal cars they generally do not--are not accessible. So that's a major drawback with them, and so that's something that we need to be cognizant of. It's a problem. In addition to their vetting processes, the limited background checking, etcetera. It's not really advisable to include them at this stage. But I'm glad that you're doing Flywheel.

01:51:06

Michael Sweet

Thank you. Other questions for the speaker? Thank you for joining us, and thank you for stepping up.

01:51:15

Marc Soto

Thank you, commissioner.

01:51:17

Michael Sweet

I have Director Davis.

01:51:18

Director Davis

Yes. I just wanted to piggyback on Commissioner Clopton's comments, and then after speaking with Director Bohn. There is a working group with supporting--I don't know if you want to just say really quickly, but just to clarify around some of the challenges and concerns with the TNCs or ride share apps.

01:51:42

Nicole Bohn

So the mayor's Office on Disability and SFMTA and SFCTA are currently engaged in rulemaking process with the California Public Utilities Commission on the TNC Access for All Act, which is mandating wheelchair accessible transportation by 2024 across the State of California. So right now in San Francisco Uber has a pilot with wheelchair accessible vehicles that are actually being contracted. Those vehicles are not privately owned vehicles. They're contracted through a provider. And Lyft has a similar program that's not as expansive as Uber's right now, as they're trying to lay the groundwork for equity around Uber and Lyft transit. And those ride costs are the same as the standard Uber costs right now. But we're in a very engaged rulemaking process that's providing comments to the CPUC to regulate the TNCs, so many acronyms, I know, to help give them guidance on how to best implement this in our county and across the state by 2024.

01:53:01

Michael Sweet

Thank you. So e--that's the end of the list of speakers I have on the agenda. I have a number of speaker cards, and I'll start going through those now. Were there any other--are there any other representatives here of organizations that had been invited to speak but hadn't yet come up? Okay. So--oh, I see Aaron Goodman again.

01:53:43

Aaron Goodman

Evening, commissioners. Again, I'd give a little more disclosure. I did work on the San Francisco Housing Authority Potrero and Sunnydale projects, and that was one of the prime issues we pushed repeatedly with SFMTA is the future vision for connectivity for these districts and neighborhoods, especially in District 10, District 11, District 7, where a lot of the housing is going. I was on the Balboa Park Station area as CACS Chair repeatedly for a couple terms, where we were looking at the City College and the Balboa reservoir issues and other developments coming. Before that I worked on the 19th Avenue transit planning issues, which once again, we haven't--we've just seen SFMTA start back up their initial stuff on connectivity at the west portal on the tunneling.

There are a lot of concerns, and I hope that this committee can actually get out of the weeds of the smaller issues, but also look at the bigger issues of transportation planning in the city. Because there was back in 2000--I'll give you guys some maps that maybe they can circulate between you. This was in 2000, the *SF Chronicle*, an article about a 30-year plan and where we would be hopefully in 30 years. We're at 2019, and we are nowhere near a sufficient network, as Cat mentioned from the Transit Riders, that actually will suffice for the amount of people that are going to be boarding these trains in the future.

There were also maps in 2016, the San Francisco Subway Vision, and in there there was a transit equity strategy in communities, the areas that are highlighted right here, which talk about distinctly the areas that need transit connectivity. I worked on the Wellness Centers for Hope SF as--for the Sunnydale facility. That came in under budget and on time, which was a great thing. And I think there was also ones for Potrero and Alice Griffith that we helped with the DPH to start working on. I think there are some definite solid moves that can occur from SFMTA to get people to the hospitals. There's links, loops and connectivity that can occur on bus transit, bus rapid transit. That's at Van Ness. It stops at Van Ness. Could go south a little further and connect up to Cesar Chavez and shoot down, or connect to the T line. There's ways you can link the major hospitals, SF General, St. Luke, CPMC, UCSF, so that people have more direct access to these areas quicker. And then we're not just relying on more agreements on the side with TNCs and other proposals. We'd have some actual hard track being laid, so that when we have new LRVs that are purchased, there's track that actually they run on. So hopefully that's something that you guys can look at as you get out of the weeks and get a more bird's eye view of transportation issues in the city as well on this. Thank you.

01:56:21

Michael Sweet

Thank you, Mr. Goodman. Next, Eileen--is it Boken? Come up, please.

01:56:36

Eileen Boken

Eileen Boken, Coalition for San Francisco Neighborhoods, here on my own behalf. The Breda light rail vehicles have been in service for over 20 years. Although they are easily accessible for seniors and people with disabilities in the metro tunnel, they are not easily accessible in the neighborhoods. When the MTA was working with Siemens to design the new LRVs, they both had the opportunity to fix these equity issues. Both of them failed to do so. In most respects the Siemens cars are basically the same as the Breda cars. By using the same basic design, the MTA will be locking us into another 20 years of the same equity issues.

More than two years ago the Taraval community urged the MTA to move forward with low floor LRVs. The low floor LRVs will be easier for seniors to board system wide, and some manufacturers even have onboard wheelchair ramps, which would create wheelchair access system wide. The MTA is now in phase two of its LRV procurement. I would urge the Human Rights Commission to insist that the MTA use this opportunity to address equity issues for seniors and the disabled by purchasing low floor LRVs.

Besides LRV design, another equity issue for the MTA is the elimination of LRV stops in the neighborhoods. On Taraval the MTA has eliminated a significant number of stops, which has created equity issues for seniors needing to walk additional blocks to catch an LRV. I should note also that District 4 where I live has the highest percentage of seniors in the entire city. And then when, as other people have mentioned, when the MTA eliminates stops, it impacts certain communities disproportionately. Thank you.

01:58:41

Michael Sweet

Thank you. I have Angelina Romano.

01:58:55

Angelina Romano

Good evening, commissioners. My name is Angelina Romano. I'm a school social worker and district coordinator for SFUSC's Refugee and Immigrant Supports and Education program, or RISE SF. I want to thank you for holding this hearing on transit equity.

While my program is charged specifically with supporting refugee and immigrant students, we at SFUSC are committed to working towards racial equity. I want to state first and foremost that we know our black students and families are disproportionately impacted by inequitable access to transit, especially because of the use of criminalizing enforcement officials on public transit, and especially for those who live in southeast neighborhoods who have limited access to buses to take them across town to schools in the northwest section of San Francisco.

We strongly believe that when we center the needs and strengths of black youth, all youth benefit. We are thrilled that San Francisco offers free Muni to qualifying youth, which is what I'm going to talk to in the next minute or so, and we have found that the system for obtaining Clipper cards is inequitable, leading to a great deal of truancy, as well as harassment by transit officials. The Clipper card application is relatively easy to fill out. It asks for nothing but verification of age and a caregiver's signature. And yet it is still difficult for our families to access, assuming they even know about it, which particularly for our newcomer families they often don't know that this is an option for them. And somehow it still takes weeks for the cards to be approved and mailed to their addresses. While young people and families wait for their free Clippers, they have to choose to either not go to school at all, or risk being--getting ticketed by SFMTA.

I regularly get calls stating that families are worried about free Clipper and public charge. Hopefully you guys know about public charge in the federal administration. Caregivers keep their little ones home, because they have no bus fare to take them to school. As adults, parents taking their young kids to school, if you don't have bus fare, then you can also get ticketed. And undocumented families are afraid that they're being placed on some kind of list when they hand over their birth certificates or passports to SFMTA. I've also heard about SFMTA officials, while I'm sure it's rare, but it has happened, asking youth for their immigration paperwork and searching their backpacks. Some attorneys are now encouraging

young people to carry red cards on their bus on the way to school to give it to SFMTA officials. If you know what a red card is, traditionally it's for ICE agents.

So I have some suggestions. For SFUSC to be able to get Clipper cards handed to us that we can then distribute to families, and then we can hand the paperwork over to SFMTA for approval on the backend, rather than them having to wait. Also for SFMTA officials not being able to question youth without a caregiver present, caregivers to be able to get passes when they're transporting their young people. And if none of that is possible, then make Muni free for all. Thank you.

02:02:00

Michael Sweet

Thank you. James Johnson.

02:02:11

James Johnson

Yes. Hello, my name is James Johnson. I'm just a regular guy. I just have a quick story. I'll start with--and I have a video of something that's very horrible that happened. I was assaulted by a Muni bus driver multiple times. So I've never had any problems with the Muni. I was coming from my drug program, which was a requirement for me to have the surgeries. Because under the insurance, if you've had any prior substance abuse, or you live in a shelter or a drug program, and you need something that's orthopedic, a serious surgery, you have to do a vetting process, which is a drug program, and stay clean and sober for six months to a year. Since I was the latter, I had to do a year.

And so I was coming from my drug program and would not be allowed to get on a bus for the simple fact the bus driver pulled up in front of two poles, and then would not let me on the bus. She said she seen me coming out of the building as I was rolling up--as the bus was pulling up I'm rolling up, which I do anyway, 'cause you have to catch up with the bus, because there's no exact place where they stop. But she happened to pull up in front of two poles. So when I said, "Can I get on the bus, ma'am?" She says--she looked and seen she was in front of two poles, and would've had to power down and then let the ramp down. So she says, "No. I seen you coming out the building, and you can't get on the bus," and took off.

So a week later I happened to be coming out the same time, 1:30, coming out of my drug program. And she says, "Well, I seen you coming out the building," and took off. I immediately called 311. I have four reports prior to what you're about to see where I filed with the 311 process. So the 311 process has to be flawed. I called and told them I was just assaulted by a bus driver. The bus driver took off, did not wait for the supervisor, and this happened. And I have four instances where I called, and I have the reports all right here. These are all the reports. 311 called, same bus driver, same bus line, same everything, and then this happens. It's only 47 seconds. [Plays video]

So anyway, she did it. So anyway--and now this is just a video of prior to it, just so you know it wasn't staged. It wasn't phony. It's just been happening. And I--[plays video]. So now this is the conclusion. [Plays video] So just so we can, you know, yeah, this went on for another minute. She did not allow me on the bus. She had to take it out of service, because she closed it on my arm. She did it previously three times. And then the video doesn't show, but at this instance all those people--she had to take it out of--they got off the bus, and I was spat upon by three different people. That's why she did not want--'cause she seen the pe--heard the people in the back getting riled up. So she thought I would be intimidated, and she was using that for somebody to come beat me up. Because they got off the bus, surrounded me, "Get your handicapped ass up. Excuse me. Get your butt out the way there, yeah," and spat on me. And I sat there and waited all this time and filed a report that day. So there's four previous on this driver. I've seen her since. And that's what they did. Excuse me. And that's what happened to me. So I would just like to say that the 311 process does not work, because it was the same incident. So they should've immediately contacted me. I was assaulted. The door was closed on my arm. That's an extension of her arm. Now, I did file battery charges on this officer. I have that report too.

02:06:52

Michael Sweet

Thank you, Mr. Johnson.

02:06:53

James Johnson

Thank you.

02:06:53

Michael Sweet

So I'm not sure if you've shared those videos with MTA, but maybe--

02:06:57

James Johnson

I sent them all over [inaudible] social justice forum everywhere. Everybody's got it.

02:07:01

Michael Sweet

Great. Thank you. I have--is it Ms. Lacoste? Lisa Lynn Lacoste? Yes.

02:07:16

Lyslynn Lacoste

It's Lyslynn Lacoste. Thank you, commissioners, Director Davis. Again, my name is Leslynn Lacoste. I am a San Francisco resident and daily Muni rider. During the day I run a program called B Magic. We primarily serve the community of Bayview Hunter's Point. I am not a transportation expert. However, we worked on two occasions with the two transportation authorities here in San Francisco, so that being the SFCTA on a project, a community shuttle project called Bayview Moves. It was an 18-month pilot project. As well as most recently with the SFMTA with the Bayview Community Bay's transportation project, specifically the participatory budget process, and that was recently.

That being said, Bayview has five main transportation lines: the 19, the 54, the 44, the 29, and obviously the T line, which you've heard a lot about today. For the four bus lines Bayview happens to be the end of the line for those four bus lines. And as you've mentioned, Commissioner Sweet, with NextBus Muni, when you're at the end of the line, most likely it is not on time. And so we experienced that a lot on the Bayview, particularly on the 19, the 54 and the 29. Also, as was mentioned, similar to Potrero Hill, there's a lot of topography issues, which creates isolated communities which cannot get to the main bus lines, which is one of the reasons why we started a community shuttle program, which was targeting seniors particularly and young people.

As well as the unreliability of Muni, particularly in the evenings and on the weekends. In the evenings, starting as early as 4:30, I experienced this daily on myself. If I do not--if I need to come downtown like today and get here by 5:30, I will have to leave my office before 4:30. Because after 4:30 the 19 is a tossup whether or not you're gonna have to end up waiting five minutes or even up to a half an hour to 45 minutes. This happens more often than not on most of the bus lines. Now, the project that we have been involved with SFMTA was an infrastructure project, but we heard from the community time and time again when we did house community meetings throughout the last fiscal year, and recently about the service issues. Unfortunately, the project that we were a part of did not address the service issues, 'cause it was not part of the grant for that budget.

I want to get to some solutions. Some solutions that would be great, more bus shelters, and those shelters actually having the arrival times for Muni. Also, I mean, at the very least improving service, so not having people more often than not waiting 45 minutes or a half an hour. Obviously there's going to be variation. You might have to wait five to 10 minutes. But if Muni was actually on time and running on schedule, people wouldn't have these waits. They wouldn't need a NextBus Muni, because they would actually be following the schedule that has been provided. I'll just leave it at that for now. Thank you so much for your time.

02:10:23

Michael Sweet

Thank you very much. I have Robin--is it Crop or Coop? Crop.

02:10:38

Robin Crop

Hi, I'm Robin Crop.

02:10:39

Michael Sweet

And one second. Ms. Lacoste, if you want to leave your recommendations, we could take them. Maybe Ms. Kirschbaum would take them directly, but certainly we do want to get that information to the right place. Thank you. Go ahead, Ms. Crop. Restart the clock, please. Thank you.

02:10:57

Robin Crop

I--Robin Crop here, San Francisco resident, and I'm also now with Save Muni. I want to talk about two issues tonight. The first one is Julie Kirschbaum's discussion of drivers. I wanted to say that I had a driver on a bus last week who told us he had had no break for 8 hours, and he was driving hungry. And the whole bus wanted to bring him food, and he says, "Well, I'm on camera. I can't eat anything, 'cause I'll be written up." So then I talked with somebody with Local 250 about that, and he said, "Wrong. That driver could've taken a break to get himself some food." So I want to ask the question to Julie. I want to know about whether the drivers are getting good communication about their rights as drivers, that they actually could take a break to get food. Because the whole bus was concerned he was driving hungry.

Then a second driver had a conversation with me this year that he says the drivers aren't getting adequate breaks, including bathroom breaks, and not enough time to eat food. And so I want to raise the issues whether labor laws are being followed by Muni for their drivers, and whether this would be a deterrent towards getting new drivers. Because I know that you're very concerned about having enough drivers for your force. So this is directed to you. Thank you, Julie, for your report, but I want to ask you those questions.

02:12:06

Michael Sweet

Thank you. So--

02:12:07

Robin Crop

So that's one thing. I want to do my other feedback. I get two minutes?

02:12:12

Michael Sweet

You do.

02:12:12

Robin Crop

Okay. So my second issue is Muni accessibility. I am a disabled person who has Paratransit and also uses Muni Rail. And in answer to your question, some of us do use the Muni also. But Muni has not been accessible for me. I got injured on a bench in the 68 new cars last summer, because I can't ride on the bench. I also am not able to ride half the buses, because there was no forward facing seat in the boarding area. I don't stand. I don't sit sideways. I don't climb stairs. There is no accessible seat for me. I would like to ask for a retrofitting of all the buses, so that we have a couple of transfer seats in the boarding area for those of us who are disabled. And that's a request.

My second issue is that we're going to be looking at rail car design for the next 30 years. It's going to be very important that we have enough forward facing seats for those of us with disabilities, as well as the regular public that would like a more comfortable ride. And the plans as they stand right now with only a couple of single seats planned for the next 50 cars, those are going to fill up right away at the Embarcadero station, meaning they're going to eliminate us as riders, and they're also going to injure us as riders too. Because I did a survey of 100 people last fall, and 400 last March in Muni station, and I heard a lot of disabilities, including scoliosis. These folks are going to be hurt by going sideways. I also heard women say they were pregnant, and they would not be comfortable riding sideways. So--and people saying motion sickness. I heard about 30 reasons from disabled people saying why they need forward seats. Then about a quarter of the public says they want to sit forwards. This is a very important issue about access for our city, and I want--I would like your help too in watching this issue. I think all parties need to come to the table together. Thank you.

02:14:01

Michael Sweet

Thank you very much. Edward Wright from Supervisor Mar's office. Thank you for joining us, and thank you for listening.

02:14:13

Edward Wright

I first want to start by thanking the members of the public who are here today and sharing their insights and their thoughts on this issue. I am primarily here to listen. I wasn't planning on speaking, so I apologize for not having prepared remarks. But I did want to share some of our office's thinking on this.

So I [inaudible] transportation for Supervisor Gordon Mar. We are so thrilled to see this discussion happening and happening with this commission, and I'd like to thank the commission for facilitating that. Because we know that mobility isn't just a public good, it's also a human right. That's something we see firsthand in our district. Our constituents are diverse. As Eileen mentioned, we have the highest proportion of seniors anywhere in the city living in our district. We also have the highest proportion of schools anywhere in the city in our district. And we know that we have the largest section of above ground light rail service for the highest ridership line in our district, the N Judah, that also experiences the highest number of switchbacks now of any line in the system.

And just to shed some light on this, we--the number one topic we hear about from our constituents is Muni, and that's because people rely on Muni. That's how they get to their jobs. That's how they access their livelihoods. That's how they live their lives and how they get around. So when we talk about equity, when we talk about reliability, and we talk about surveys, I think it's also just important to keep in context what that means to people. It's the difference between making it to work on time, as you brought up, commissioner. It's sometimes the difference between keeping your job or not. And this really does make a difference in people's lives. So I just wanted to share our office's support for that.

I also wanted to highlight a topic that was brought up by Cat Carter from Transit Riders of the effort for adding a 29 rapid service. That has the enthusiastic support of Supervisor Mar and of our office, and we'd love to have the support of this commission on that effort as well. In addition to being a supervisor, Supervisor Mar is also a father. He has a 13-year-old daughter who goes to Lowell. She tried to take the 29 to school, but after repeated attempts to get on the bus, she found that it was too crowded to get on every single time she tried. She is now driven to school, unfortunately, and that's one more car on our roads that we don't need to have. So thank you.

02:16:52

Michael Sweet

Thank you. And next I have Edna James, and then I only have one more card from Michael Perkins. If there's anyone else who wants to speak who hasn't yet--we have another card. That's great. And we're nearing the end of the cards. If anyone else wants to speak, now's your chance.

02:17:12

Edna James

Good afternoon. My name is Edna James, and I'm president of OMI Community Action Organization, and I'm a nurse at the I.T. Bookman Community Center. I wrote this in May 19, 2014 to the transportation, and it hasn't changed. And I want to say that the young man who witnessed, like, leaving him at the sign, they did this to another handicapped individual in front of OMI. I was sitting in my car, and he had gotten up on the ramp at Arch and Randolph Street. And he was turned this way, but not straight in front of the car, and the bus man just speeded across him and left him there. And it was cold and everything.

And I felt so bad for that senior who was in the wheelchair that he had to sit up there for the next 15 minutes. And I sat in my car until that next bus came, 'cause I--the guy moved so fast I couldn't get the bus number and everything. And I made a complaint, and you're right, they don't respond. You know, you call 311, and I got a message return, a voice message, which didn't say anything. "We looked at your message," and then blah, blah, blah, blah, and that's it. But this is a complaint that I want--I really made on behalf of this man who was standing there.

The other thing is that I heard we had a problem with Muni talking about going underground with the M Train, and eliminating the stop at Beverly and Sargent Avenue for an overhead bridge. Don't even think about it anymore, because we're gonna fight that. 'Cause it--the small houses around there was not built to go 30 feet underground. The foundations are not good, and you would put--a lot of those homes would be

shaking, you know, for that, because the area wasn't built for you to go underground. And so those small homes would not stand the vibration there.

And design a better stop sign and safe walk paths stop for the intersection at Beverly, Sargent, and 19th Avenue. And that is really when that M car comes across 19th Avenue, that stop. You have the seniors trying to come from the tip of Methodist Church to get in there, people coming down from Jose Ortega School coming down, and then there's people coming off of Sargent. So it's three-way, and that's the Muni stop there, and that's not good.

The other one is that--provide sitting benches for the elderly and handicapped on the N car stop at Lakeview, Mount Vernon, San Jose, and Broad Avenue. This has not been done. And I'm just saying the bi--that's all. That's all I want to say. But thank you very much. Thank you.

02:20:22

Michael Sweet

Thank you. I guess we're not--Commissioner Clopton?

02:20:32

Karen Clopton

I just wanted to--thank you. I wanted to encourage Ms. James to give her list to the transit director, to give it to Ms.--

02:20:46

Michael Sweet

Kirschbaum.

02:20:47

Karen Clopton

Kirschbaum, yes. If you could, please do that. That would be great. And I wanted to thank all the members of public, including Ms. James, for all the community work and effort that you're doing. Thank you.

02:21:01

Michael Sweet

Thank you. Next is Michael Perkins, and then I have David Hooper. And then I'm out of cards, unless anyone else wants to speak. Okay.

02:21:14

Michael Perkins

Hello, my name is Michael Perkins. I work with the I.T. Bookman Community Center. And seeing that everybody has hit on most of my list, I guess I'll have to cut this one a little short. I do have some seniors that do--used to visit the center, because basically they do not have the transportation to get down there. Most of them live on top of the hills and such, and some of the conventional buses won't be able to get up to the top of the hills because of the steep grades in the street and such. So pointing to SFMTA, if it is possible, maybe you may want to look into I guess, like, purchasing or whatever, like, Paratransit type vehicles that can clear those corners and such. So that way those seniors living up and on those steep grades and such can make it on down to their appointments, or the center, or anything else that they may need to do. So I take you for your time. That's it.

02:22:13

Michael Sweet

Thank you for your input, and thank you for being here tonight. The last card I have, unless I get another one, is David Hooper.

02:22:24

David Hooper

Good evening, commissioners. My name is David Hooper. I serve as the president of the New Mission Terrace Improvement Association, and also on District 11 Council with Ms. James, who is, in my opinion, right 99% of the time.

I'm here because there was an extended outreach to bring the information about the Human Rights Commission to the community in District 11, and to talk about the transit equity. My immediate neighborhood does okay, except that it's dependent on the J, the K and the M, and BART, and the 29, 49, and 14 lines. But what I see out there, and what I also see in District 10, is that people who aren't included,

who don't have smart phones, who are not in that world, who don't tweet [sic], are not included in any of this. And it's apparent.

If Eric--pardon me, not Eric Mar. If Supervisor Mar has the wherewithal to take his daughter to Lowell because the 29 line isn't working fine, that's great. But that is the exception in our district. Parents have to take people to school, their children to school, on public transit. So what do I think is gonna happen if we don't do something? We have half as many schoolchildren now as we did 50 years ago. The huge influx in population is from people who weren't raised in town, who were raised somewhere, went away to college, have come here, ride segues, skateboards, motorized skateboards, scooters, bicycles, power assisted, or take Uber or take Lyft, and they have no experience of Muni. And their kids aren't gonna have an experience in Muni, and the customer base will evaporate. So unless we do something about this, and figure out some way to address all of the new apartments that are coming in the Greater Excelsior and over near the reservoir on the other side of the freeway, we're gonna get jammed.

I say this because I was raised in town. I worked for the post office on the street. I drove cab, and I started working for Muni as an operator when I was 26, and I retired after my last 12 years at Central Control. So it's apparent to me that some things can be improved, that the challenges today aren't as great as they were in '98 when the huge meltdown happened in the subway. These are addressable.

And the last thing I want to say is when I started, it took me, what, three months before I got full pay, and that was a great contract. But the contract that they recently got rid of had it extended, as I understand it, to five years before you got full pay. No wonder it's difficult to get operators. If you charge them three diff--if they come from the suburbs, and you charge them \$3 a day for parking at whatever facility they can do near the division, why that's \$700 a year out of their pocket. So I think we can do better, but I think it's realizing that some people aren't connected to this vibrant economy. Thank you.

02:25:41

Michael Sweet

Thank you, Mr. Hooper. Thank you, everyone. That's all the cards I have. We lost the quorum a while ago, so we will not go through the formality of ending the meeting as we usually do. However, I will note at this point there's a note that the next discussion of transit at a HRC meeting might be October 10. I--yeah, I'm thinking based on all that hap--this was a great discussion. I want to thank everyone for staying here, and to the commissioners who were able to stay, and to the staff for staffing this. But maybe we should have more time to have a more robust discussion, because as evidenced by the fact that we have Muni sitting here through the whole meeting. So let's discuss that offline and do this in a way that is gonna yield the best output. And I th--and hopefully report recommendations and a path going forward where we can join you in working to improve equity in transit in San Francisco.

So I know some people would be looking forward to joining us on the 10th, which I invite you to do anyway, but I suspect we won't actually be a meeting exclusively focused on transit. But we'll get back to people through the same communication channels when staff figures that out.

02:27:05

Unidentified female

Right. And so I just also wanted to acknowledge and thank SFMTA for being here tonight, and I know you juggled some things to be able to be here, so I want to recognize and appreciate that. And by the same token I just want to recognize Brittney Chiquatta and Cathy Mulkey Meyer. I really want to thank Cathy for her due diligence for outreach and engagement, and look forward to continuing this. So we'll follow up, Julie, to see what's the best date for the meeting. But thank you all.

02:27:36

Michael Sweet

Thank you, everyone. Good night.

