

# HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

City and County of San Francisco

*Edwin M. Lee, Mayor*

Thursday, July 12, 2018  
Regular Meeting Minutes  
5:350 pm  
City Hall #416  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place

## ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Susan Belinda Christian, Chair  
Melanie Ampon, Commissioner  
Eva Chan, Commissioner  
Theodore Ellington, Commissioner  
Hala Hijazi, Commissioner  
Mark Kelleher, Commissioner  
Maya Karwande, Commissioner  
Jason Pellegrini, Commissioner  
Abigail Porth, Commissioner  
Michael Sweet, Commissioner  
Joseph Sweiss, Commissioner  
Sheryl Evans Davis, Executive Director

**SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION**  
**REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**  
**JULY 12, 2018**

Susan Belinda Christian  
Melanie Ampon  
Eva Chan  
Theodore Ellington  
Hala Hijazi  
Mark Kelleher  
Jason Pellegrini  
Joseph Sweiss

Absent:  
Michael Sweet  
Maya Karwande  
Abigail Porth

00:00:06 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN  
Good evening. It is 5:35 p.m. on Thursday, July 12<sup>th</sup>, 2018, and this is the regular meeting of San Francisco Human Rights Commission. Madam Secretary, would you please read the roll?

00:00:20 COMMISSION SECRETARY  
Chair Christian.

00:00:20 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN  
Present.

00:00:22 COMMISSION SECRETARY  
Vice Chair Sweet. Chair--excuse me, Commissioner Ampon?

00:00:26 MELANIE AMPON  
Present.

00:00:27 COMMISSION SECRETARY  
Commissioner Chan.

00:00:28 EVA CHAN  
Present.

00:00:29 COMMISSION SECRETARY  
Commissioner Ellington

00:00:30 THEODORE ELLINGTON  
Present.

00:00:32 COMMISSION SECRETARY  
Commissioner Hijazi.

00:00:33 HALA HIJAZI  
Present.

00:00:34 COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Karwande. Commissioner Kelleher.

00:00:39

MARK KELLEHER

Present.

00:00:41

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Pellegrini.

00:00:42

JASON PELLEGRINI

Present.

00:00:44

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Porth. Commissioner Sweiss.

00:00:47

JOSEPH SWEISS

Present.

00:00:48

COMMISSION SECRETARY

We have quorum.

00:00:49

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. And before I call for public on items not on the Agenda, I just want to note tonight that in the last election, there was legislation passed regarding whether commissioners--whether someone can sit on a commission while they're running for office. That--as I said, that legislation did pass, but it has not yet been certified by the secretary of State, and so it's not effective. Also, it--there--it needs to be interpreted, whether it applies to people who filed, at least in one respect, about whether it applies to people who filed for office before the legislation went into effect. And so to the extent that there's anyone on the Commission tonight who is running for office, that legislation does not yet apply to them. So, any public comment on items not on the Agenda? This is an opportunity for members of the public to address the Commission on matters that are within the Commission's jurisdiction, but not on tonight's Agenda. Seeing no requests, Madam Secretary, would you read the next item on the agenda?

00:02:05

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Adoption of minutes dated June 14, 2018.

00:02:09

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

You know, actually, I'm going to take some privilege of the chair and move that item past some of the regular business that we want to get to in a timely fashion. And so, colleagues and members of the audience, we are moving item number five, discussion of federal policy regarding of separation of families at the border, travel restriction for predominantly Muslim countries, and recent HRC statements, up to the first item in our regular business. And with that, I'm pleased to note that we have our colleagues from the Immigrants Rights Commission and the Office of Civic Engagement here with us, and I would invite them to the podium to just let us know a few things about what they're thinking about these issues right now, and to help me and help us set the stage for

working together on these issues moving forward. And I see that we have the president of the Immigrants Rights Commission, Celine Kennelly, with us. Welcome.

00:03:15

CELINE KENNELLY

Thank you. Thank you, Chair Christian, commissioners, and Director Davis. Thank you for inviting us to participate tonight. We're delighted to be here. So the Immigrant Rights Commission has been working on the impact of federal policy since 1987, and we find ourselves today, as we all know, at a precarious time in our immigrant communities, and for our immigrant communities. Since our last joint hearing in 2009 with the HRC on comprehensive immigrant reform, there has been no congressional action, very little progress, and we find ourselves today facing an increasing number of threats, attacks, and actions against immigrants, communities of color, the poor, and our LGBTQ communities. In the past six months, the IRC has convened hearings with community members on DACA, the Muslim travel ban, and impacts of the current administration's executive orders and department actions to undercut safety net programs for our most vulnerable communities. The hearings have been well attended; the community has been vocal and engaged, and we have gotten excellent feedback on how they are feeling, what is happening in the communities, and their fear and uncertainty in their everyday lives. Most recently, commissioners were involved with the city hall rally held after the U.S. Supreme Court issued its final ruling on the travel ban. The separation of children from their families at the border has been universally condemned, and I think both of our commissions have made a statement to that effect. We must do more than making statements about San Francisco being a sanctuary, because the reality is our civil liberties and human rights, whether we are immigrant or born here, documented or not, are at risk. Our sense of being the people of the United States, from all walks of life, are being ripped apart by racist, xenophobic, and inflammatory rhetoric that is repeated over and over. So we applaud your important efforts and appreciate your interest and partnership in working together. I am going to hand it to Director Pan, who will provide a brief update of the two issues you identified for this evening--the children and family separation, and the Muslim travel ban.

00:05:24

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you, Madam President. Welcome, Director Pon.

00:05:29

ADRIENNE PON

Thank you. Good evening, Chair, commissioners, and Director Davis, and I wanted to thank you for your partnership and your leadership in ensuring that immigrant issues are recognized as human and civil rights issues as well. This is just a basic, really basic, overview of what's happened so far on the two issues that you were interested in. To frame the issues, I wanted to start by saying that there is an ongoing global migration crisis happening, with over 244 million migrants and 22.5 million refugees fleeing national disasters, civil war, violence, and economic turmoil. They seek a safe and better place for themselves and their families. That is so important to remember. They're only looking for a safe and better place for themselves and their families. The UN has called

nations to shape a global compact for safe, orderly, and regular migration, and this is in the interests of every nation, including the United States. However, obviously, the current administration has ignored and withdrawn from these efforts, so human and sensible policies don't appear to be of any interest to this president and his supporters. Please keep in mind that as early as 2015, the current president indicated his intent to demean and criminalize immigrants, people of color, LGBT communities, just about everybody else who didn't look like him, and to invoke a zero-tolerance policy against any form of immigration, legal or not, including immigrant families who are fleeing violence, natural disasters, and warfare. So although the previous administration--the Obama administration--did say that children should only be detained as a last resort, we believe that no child should be detained or separated from his or her or their families. In March 2017, the current administration indicated that it was considering separating children arriving at the border from their parents and families, and on June 1<sup>st</sup>, 2018, on International Day of the Children, the IRC and the Office of Civic Engagement and Immigrant Affairs did issue a joint statement warning about the escalating situation at the border. Now remember, at the time, there were maybe about 600 children who were already separated from their families since April of this year when the administration announced the zero tolerance policy. Three weeks later, over 2,300 children were reported separated, and just a week ago, HSS reported that the number was nearly 3,000. So we're not confident that even that 3,000 is a low number. There may be many more. But following global condemnation and outcry, the president did issue an executive order on June 20th to stop the separation, but this EO does nothing for the children that are already separated from their families. In a nutshell, this is a big, giant mess, and still not resolved. The administration claims that at least half the separated children under five have now been reunited. We believe that the American people are being lied to. So our immigrant children and youth are clearly being used as pawns to build a border wall, to stop all legal and other immigration into the United States, and that's the bottom line. Now if we go to the travel ban--we refer to it as the Muslim travel ban--it started in early 2017 with a leaked executive order, right after the administration took office. After three iterations, the EOs were challenged in court in *Hawaii v. Trump*, which was decided recently on a 5-4 decision by the U.S. Supreme Court. That was June 26. So the court basically endorsed the president's power to exercise his broad authority in suspending the entry of foreign nationals, but the ruling kind of fell short in granting him unquestioned power to do so. So while presidential authority was supported by the decision, the door is still open for future challenges and litigation. So bottom line, the 3.0 version of the ban is still in effect. And I am not the expert on waivers and what happens next, but there is a really good fact sheet prepared by Advancing Justice Asian Law Caucus that in two pages just really clearly explains what's happened with the travel ban and what comes next, and where people should go to get help. And I strongly recommend, if you know of anyone or anyone comes to the Commission for assistance, that that's the place to send them first, because they'll get good, credible information. And we also plan on the Immigrant Assistance Hub, on the city's website, that we developed with a lot of partners to put that information there so people have a one-stop place to get information. So just

as concerning to us are all the multiple actions ranging from sudden changes in forms, like--and processes, such as public charge policies, that have the effect--or, you know, changes in USCIS policies around requests for extensions of visas. All of those things have the effect of dissolving the safety net for basic things, for the right to entry, for things like food, shelter, the care for our most vulnerable people. So starting with the immigrants, we're going to dissolve the safety net, just take away any form of support. We will be relying heavily on our community-based partners, because that's the place that people go to and trust. But we've got--the city has got to make a commitment to keep them up and running. So as the IRC and the OC we've seen that this immigrant policies have far-reaching effects on all communities. Whether you are a citizen or not, whether you're documented or not, this is going to affect all of us, because it creates such a sense of fear. With the 2020 census coming on, we have other issues, compounded by digital divide, we have many of our communities, particularly the African-American community, and language minority communities, who don't have access to the tools to participate. And then they're going to make it double hard. But if we don't get counted, we'll lose the funding and the representation. So these are really serious issues. Our power is really standing together, working together, against the attacks, getting the right, accurate, and timely information out to everybody in language, and working with a cross-section of partners. And we're really honored to be here today and partner with you. We look forward to fighting the good fight with you. Thank you.

00:12:54

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you, Director. And so yes, obviously, these issues impact directly the issues of human rights and the most basic human rights that we all share. And so we are so looking forward to joining forces with you to do the work that we need to do for the community and with the community, and to understand what useful actions we can take to try to help protect people's human rights, and also just give them the tangible assistance that they need. And also I'm hoping that we can do this from a regional point of view as well, because obviously, it makes sense to do this regionally, if not nationally, but definitely regionally. Is there anything else that you wanted to--I know that--thank you so much for making time at such short notice to come. And again, this is just the beginning of a conversation that I just wanted to set the table for, and we're looking forward to scheduling some joint meetings, perhaps in August or September. We need to look at our schedules and see, but as soon as possible, so that we can see what's what. Would you like to say anything else before you head out?

00:14:09

CELINE KENNELLY

Nope. I think, again, we're delighted to be able to partner with you all. It's a huge issue. It is changing daily, as we all know. Trying to stay on top of the changes and understand them and be in a position to advise our communities is going to take the city as a whole. It's going to take all of the commissions coming together and having accurate information that can be divided--or distributed to our communities. So we're delighted to partner with you.

00:14:38

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Great. I know that you need to leave, but I'm going to give my colleagues a chance to ask you some questions. Commissioner Hijazi.

00:14:43

HALA HIJAZI

I just wanted to make comments. I want to commend you and thank you for the leadership, both on the Immigrant Rights Commission and also the Human Rights Commission, especially to the chairs and the executive directors. As a public servant, as an immigrant, as a Muslim, as the eldest of six children, as the aunt to 11 nieces and nephews between the ages of two to 16, this hits me home on multiple, multiple levels. So we have to fight even harder. This makes me cry every single day, and if it wasn't for the leadership of the city, regularly and all the time, standing up for our rights, for those people that don't have anyone to stand up for them, we have to do more. I'm looking at the youth behind us. I don't want them to think this is normal, that this is okay. This is temporary. This is we have a president who has hate in his heart and his soul. We have Supreme Court justices that are politicizing this matter. And there's few of them and more of us that believe in human rights and civil rights, and working together. And I just want to work more closely with the leadership of this commission and yours to do more engagement, more outreach, so that we can engage the youth and have them ambassadors out in the communities to talk about the importance of partnership, the importance of respecting each other's civil rights, the importance of having different friends from different cultures and from different religions. We're doing that in the interfaith community, but we also need to do it in the immigrant communities. We also need to do it in the school systems. And we also need to work with the police department and the district attorney, because all the stuff that's happening is affecting and causing more bullying, more hate crimes. There's a rise right now in hate crimes and bullying, especially in San Francisco, where you would think that's not where it should be happening. So I'm saying all this to say thank you for your leadership. This is just the beginning. We have to do more. But if it wasn't for your leadership and also the leadership of Commissioner Nima Rahimi as well as Supervisor Ahsha Safaí, and also the Asian Law Caucus in San Francisco, we wouldn't be at the forefront of this, as well as the ACLU. So from the bottom of my heart, thank you for all that you're doing to corroborate with the Human Rights Commission to move forward on this and to protect the civil and human rights of all our constituents. Thank you.

00:17:14

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. We will be in touch. Have a great evening, thanks. And so just continuing this item, you saw, colleagues, that on June 22<sup>nd</sup> of this year we issued a press release regarding the--calling for the reunification of families at the southwest border. And then, of course, the travel ban decision came down a few days later, and with the Immigrant Rights Commission we issued a joint statement regarding--we issued two joint statements, I believe, actually. And Commissioner Hijazi did contact us, wanting to--for the HRC also to issue a statement, and I was in complete agreement, as was the director.

So we did ask Commissioner Hijazi to write some words for the statement. So I wanted to give this--the podium to her right now to help us, again, lay the groundwork for the work that we're going to be doing in the future, and our discussions about it. Commissioner?

00:18:29

HALA HIJAZI

So we're in talks right now with the different civil rights organizations--ACLU, Asian Law Caucus, Council on Islamic Relations. We're going to be trying to do more monthly meetings with the different stakeholders in San Francisco. Right now, just because it's summer, we're just trying to kind of use this as an organizing period to talk about different ways to go out to the different districts in San Francisco, district by district, community by community, but also, as you mentioned, Chair Christian, is also to do it through the region, help with regional support, also help with congressional leadership, and also working with the different Department of Justice's people that are actually helping us. Certain areas within that department are actually going to be useful. We're going to need to hold them responsible for their actions and inactions. So the layout for this one, one of the main reasons we wanted to do a press release is because it's important when a certain community is under attack, we all have to stand together and say this is not okay. Any time--it's just a press release, but people need to know, especially now that we have a mayor like Mayor London Breed, who is all about diversity and inclusivity, and making sure that we are at the forefront of this fight in San Francisco, that we also do our job, even the youth do their job, and to protect your own friends when you see people being hurt in your schools or being bullied, or being talked down or being made fun of because of what they wear or how they wear it, or who they love or how they look like. So we're going to do more. This is one of the things that we decided to do. I spoke, again, with different commissioners on the Immigrant Rights Commission as well as here. We really love this idea of collaborating more with the Immigrant Rights Commission. It's more stronger, it's more powerful, we'll have more of a stronger voice, and a platform. So we're going to also look to you guys, our future leaders, with ideas on how to reach out more to our diverse communities to talk about these issues. So thank you very much, but this is just the beginning. This is just one of the press releases. And I'm so grateful for the chair and the executive director for making this happen.

00:20:33

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you, Commissioner Hijazi. Very, very gratified that you are so involved in this, and grateful for your work. And colleagues, on this issue and others, also wanting you to be aware that you are appointed commissioners, and the things that you find important for us to be working on in the community, I really want to know and want to support you and encourage you in any way that I can to bring those things to our attention, so that we can act appropriately. Director Davis.

00:21:11

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

I just wanted to--you know, I know we had some conversations in the past, and Sneha Rao was able to draft a policy for us around press release. But I just wanted to really

encourage other commissioners to consider ways that they can help us think about how to amplify a voice, and to engage in conversations and recognize that Commissioner Hijazi actually brought to our attention the need to kind of have the conversation and to be present. And so just wanted to recognize that. And then at the same time, I'm realizing as I look at Commissioner Chan I owe you a response to an email, so.

00:21:53

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So being cognizant of the time, I'll ask if there is any public comment on this item. Seeing none, we will now go back to our regularly scheduled program on the regular business, at least, and invite the Community Safety Initiative's HRC cohort to present.

00:22:21

MACKENZIE ZUBAR WILLIAMS

Thank you.

00:22:31

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Welcome.

00:22:34

TARALA MITCHELL

Good evening, commissioners and Director Davis. My name is Tarala Mitchell.

00:22:39

MACKENZIE ZUBAR WILLIAMS

I'm Mackenzie Zubar Williams. We're here to represent the Human Rights Commission cohort with the CSI program. Our group has been working on two projects in the past month, the first being a proposed program for homeless childcare and hygiene in the Bay Area. And Tarala will talk a little more about that.

00:23:01

TARALA MITCHELL

And with that, tomorrow we will be visiting the St. Anthony's Foundation, where we will be feeding the homeless and also providing them with various hygiene products.

00:23:11

MACKENZIE ZUBAR WILLIAMS

And we have another program called Teens for Change, which is a website we've created for youth who feel underrepresented in society. The site will--with the site, youth will be able to voice their opinions on current issues, globally and locally, just different events taking place. So, yeah.

00:23:35

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Anything further?

00:23:37

TARALA MITCHELL

Not for you today.

00:23:40

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Are there any other members of your cohort who would like to address us?

00:23:47

LAURA BAGSIC

Hi, good evening. Thank you for this opportunity for us to speak to you about our project and issues that we're handling and solving problems for. My name is Laura Bagsic, and with my other co-lead is Tiara Hall. So we've been doing this program with our youth of eight, all together with my co-lead, 10, for a couple weeks now. And for the whole program, we are looking for an issue, for problems around the community and city, and seeing what's the problem. We pointed out homeless people, and with lack of resources they have, we would like to provide them with more resources and try to improve other shelters or hygiene mobile sources, and just improve that for the better. So we have them research different resources and see what they can improve, and then with that, we make up a center. They've wanted to see if they can fundraise for a center and also a website for freedom of speech for youth advocacy. And have their voices to be heard.

00:25:10

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

All great initiatives, thank you.

00:25:13

LAURA BAGSIC

Thank you.

00:25:15

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Colleagues, any comments or questions for our youth colleagues? Commissioner Hijazi?

00:25:25

HALA HIJAZI

I just want to say I'm so proud of you guys. You guys are amazing.

00:25:29

TARALA MITCHELL

Thank you.

00:25:29

MACKENZIE ZUBAR WILLIAMS

Thank you.

00:35:29

LAURA BAGSIC

Thank you.

00:25:30

HALA HIJAZI

Most of us at your age didn't do any of this stuff. So thank you so much for your leadership. Thank you for your passion and compassion, and thank you for moving forward and helping, and setting examples to other people before you and after you. So thank you so much. We're so very, very proud of you and grateful for your contributions.

00:25:48

TARALA MITCHELL

Thank you as well.

00:25:48

MACKENZIE ZUBAR WILLIAMS

Thank you.

00:25:51

NICOLE ELMORE

Good afternoon, I'm Nicole Elmore. I'm a chemistry major at the University of Nevada--Las Vegas. I'm a first-time cohort lead. I have a co-lead, his name is Jeremy Traylor. He attends City College of San Francisco. So our cohort is a first year, and we're community engagement. And so we have an open infrastructure, so we decided to focus on mental health. So we want to destigmatize the negative stigmas and misconceptions around mental health through promotion and prevention, through the experience of strength and hope. So we will be putting on a community conversation on July 25<sup>th</sup> with the Human Rights Commission, and so our cohort, we want to maybe do like a call of action. But to really educate the public on what mental health is, and that you need--mental health is just like physical health. So I have a cohort of 13 students, and we meet every day at the Human Rights Commission. And we have a field trip on Thursday and Friday where we get to partner with local mental health facilities and facilities that offer alternative therapies. So that's just the gist of my cohort. So, thank you guys.

00:27:14

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. I mean, you're tackling some of the most basic and critical issues that we have in the city right now and as a country as well, but certainly in our own community. So--and you guys always come up with great solutions, and I'm really excited to see what you come up with and the things that you propose. So enjoy. I'm really impressed by the amount of time and the effort and the intelligence and ingenuity that you have brought to past projects and are clearly bringing to these as well.

00:27:51

NICOLE ELMORE

Well, thank you for your time, and a special thank you to Director Davis for having us. So, thank you guys.

00:27:56

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

You're always welcome. We always love to hear from you. Colleagues, any--oh, we have another presentation, fantastic. Come on up. Did you--

00:28:05

DECARI RUSSELL

Hello, my name is Decari Russell. I am the lead of the SFPD groups under Director Davis, and the CSI cohort. So like the previous presentations I've been talking about, a lot of perception--we have a lot of perception issues between either the community and the police department or even appear in the youth behind me. So our project this year has been trying to bring the diametric ends of all perceptions, and kind of bring them to the middle. So we have a lot of our officers who are coming in to give us their perspective on whenever they go out on a call, how they approach situations, and the thought process behind their actions and why they do that, as well as the citizen side of any kind of interaction with an officer, or just any interactions period, to see how both sides can kind of come together to have more of an understanding. I know there's a lot of these national videos that are coming out with--where there are unarmed black men or getting shot or whatever the case is, where a lot of people want to kind of say the officer should have never done this, or if the citizen would have done X, Y, and Z, then nothing would have

ever happened. So our goal is really to kind of try to bring both sides of those people to the middle to understand the other side. So we really want to have people that are on more of the policy-making end, to be able to understand what we're coming from, and then we want to understand where you guys are coming from. So at the end of the day, like Commissioner Hijazi was saying, that we could kind of figure out the people that are kind of being disenfranchised or anything like that, for them to have a voice, and for us to understand where they're coming from, and understanding what they're trying to say as well as the police's side. So at the end of the day, we're just trying to get everybody to understand the other side's perspective. Thank you.

00:29:50

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And maybe you mentioned this and I missed it, but--so what are your proposals for getting the people together and fleshing out these issues and these questions?

00:30:00

DECARI RUSSELL

So currently we have two different projects going on. We have one that is geared just straight for perception, and so we're bringing in--we're interviewing different officers and interviewing different community leaders to kind of see where they're coming from, and when they, like I said, when they approach different situations, their thought process behind it, whether it's officer safety or a community person just being scared when they yank away or run away, they think--the officers--it's now a resisting arrest situation. So to understand that they're not trying to resist arrest, but they're kind of coming from a stance of like "what's happening to me," in a way. So we kind of want to just get that out so that more and more people can understand that, as well as not necessarily getting arrested or detained unnecessarily for things that they don't really know what's going on.

00:30:43

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Right--for instance, understanding why someone would have the impulse to run--

00:30:46

DECARI RUSSELL

Exactly.

00:30:47

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

--instead of, you know, just staying and explaining.

00:30:49

DECARI RUSSELL

And then the second aspect is a lot of First Amendment audits. So what we want to do is we want to go around to different stations, whether--with any and all kinds of people, to audit the police station. We would like to, in a way, weed out the bad apples. And through these audits, we will do everything that's completely legal, everything that's protected under the Constitution, so that once we arrive at whatever location we're at, we are protected not only from the law side, but also under Chief Scott, so everything is sanctioned throughout the entire time. So if there is an interaction with an officer that ends up being negative, we can go back and say okay, well, we can reprimand or we can retrain or we can fire.

00:31:29

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Mm-hmm.

00:31:30

DECARI RUSSELL

So that's what we would like to kind of start.

00:31:32

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you.

00:31:33

DECARI RUSSELL

Thank you.

00:31:37

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So if there's a question from one of the commissioners on a presentation, should we take it now or hold it until the end? Commissioner Pellegrini has a question for one of the previous--

00:31:47

JASON PELLEGRINI

I had a question for the first cohort about their homeless services. Sorry, I couldn't figure out how to work the thing.

00:31:55

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Not technically competent.

00:31:57

JASON PELLEGRINI

Yeah.

00:31:57

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yeah.

00:31:58

JASON PELLEGRINI

I was wondering if you've partnered with like Lave Mae or any of the other homeless groups out there that do hygiene kits and bring them to the homeless. Have you looked at them at all

00:32:08

TARALA MITCHELL

Oh, yes, with actually Lave Mae, we are actually going to start that initiative to contact them and do what we can to partner with either Lave Mae or Mission Neighborhood Health, or with the other services program.

00:32:24

JASON PELLEGRINI

Okay. Yeah, if you need any contact at Lave Mae, they're a great organization. I can help you out with that.

00:32:29

TARALA MITCHELL

Okay. Thank you so much.

00:32:29

JASON PELLEGRINI

Yeah, no problem.

00:32:31

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Director Davis?

00:32:32

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

No, I was just going to say that Commissioner Pellegrini is on the list for them to reach out to, and that we also have been working with reaching out to one of the churches that has a shelter that Lave Mae comes every Tuesday. So we've been trying to figure out-- but they are going--tomorrow's Friday? They're going on Friday to St. Anthony's, and continuing a partnership from the school year with a different group, where they put together some kits and they'll deliver those at St. Anthony's tomorrow.

00:33:03

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Welcome.

00:33:04

DANETTA

Hi, everybody.

00:33:04

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Hi.

00:33:06

DANETTA

My name's Danetta, and I'm the lead of SFPD2. So like what Decari was saying, like we all come together, but like their group is doing that thing for their group, but my group, we're focusing on youth programs that the SFPD takes kids on hikes, and takes them to NASCAR. So this summer, a lot more kids went to NASCAR. They took us on our hike earlier this summer, because they felt like the kids would want to do it earlier instead of later in the summer, just to do more team-building activities. We met Officer Carl Ma, and another officer Mike Rivera. And he actually volunteers, right? He volunteers. He's not paid for it. So we were talking to them, oh, why isn't there more officers that come and take the kids, and they say a lot of officers sign up but don't follow through with it. So we have two kids in my group that went on the Africa trip with Officer JJ. So he takes kids to Africa. So we thought, okay, what can we turn this into. You guys went and actually experienced it. and another one of the cadets that work with us at the SFPD headquarters went on the Africa trip, and now he's a cadet. So we tried to implement that in our project with youth programs that the police department intertwines with. So we're going to talk about that, we're making a video on that, and we're going to have the two young men that went to the Africa trip talk about their experiences. We're going to interview some officers on why they do what they do, and just show appreciation for it and show why the children and youth of all ages need these programs. Because they get opportunities that they will never have without it.

00:34:59

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Great, thank you.

00:35:07

NICO BERMAND

Hi.

00:35:07

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Hi.

00:35:38

NICO BERMAND

My name's Nico Bermand, and--

00:35:11

ALADRIANA JONES

My name is Aladriana Jones.

00:35:13

NICO BERMAND

Yeah, and we're in the leads for the storytelling cohort. We have a very special type of program, because we work specifically with youth who are in summer school all day. It's very difficult for our students to get jobs, because they're at school until 3:00 p.m. every Monday through Friday. So we have a cohort that is designed to teach the students that storytelling is one of the most effective ways to convey a message, specifically a social justice message. So by them collecting stories and telling their own stories, and through several different ways of telling a story, like songs, dance, video documentation, photography, poetry, spoken word--we do that every Monday--even cooking, or interviewing, writing, all these kind of different ways to tell a story. We are really trying to pull out the social justice ideas that they all keep inside of them, really. They have--they all know what's going on in the city, but it's just the way that they convey that message that's really important. And doing it in a fun way, and they way that they want to express themselves. So it's been a really interesting summer, and can't wait to show you guys the different projects that we have in store.

00:36:55

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you.

00:37:01

ALADRIANA JONES

Well, that's--we pretty much do work with a lot of kids that are experiencing the--well, they have been around to see the gentrification that's been going on in their community, and they also have friends that are going through things with the immigration. And just--it's very personal for them. It's not like they're outsiders. They're very aware of what's going on. So for us to come up with--well, for them to actually come up with these different ways to express themselves and say what they're feeling and what's been going on, it kind of amazes me. Because I come from the same thing they do, but I was able to go to college and make it. So for them, they still have to stay in their environment, so they're still trying to fight to make it. So I just hope that when you guys do see their

stories, you guys take heed to what they're actually trying to express, because it is realistic.

00:37:51

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

We will, we promise you. Thank you so much for your work. Director Davis?

00:37:58

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

So I just wanted to thank the groups that came out. There are 12 cohorts, I think, of students that are doing--three of them are SFPD specific, and focused and working at police headquarters three days a week. The other groups are throughout the city, working on different projects. But all of the leads come every Monday from 3:00 to 5:00 to the HRC for us to work with them on how they're building out their projects, how it really speaks to equity, equality, and social justice, and then we will have a--July 27<sup>th</sup> at Fort Mason, all of the groups will share their presentations. And then this week, on Monday, the Oakland cohort launched, and we were fortunate, I mentioned before, to really think about the regional approach, and that the San Francisco Foundation had given us funding to do work with Oakland and with Urban Strategies. And last week, East Bay Community Foundation committed funding to actually support that cohort as well. So they--Danielle and I met with five of the students and one--the college age lead that is working with them, they will come to the HRC offices tomorrow for us to continue to build out with them, and talk to them about what the Oakland project looks like. Have been in conversation and have got commitment from the Silicon Valley Foundation. They will fund a cohort in San Jose, so I've been working and talking with the San Jose police department. It's too quick for us to kind of make it happen this summer, but we are going to work with them and build that out between August and December to launch that pilot. And hopefully, once those three cohorts have kind of finished out the summer, we'll have a plan for working together regionally to have some of these conversations. So really grateful for the young people that are doing this work, and for their involvement. And it has been enlightening on Mondays to meet with these young people who are in college or working in community to come back and really talk to us about what it really looks like to move social justice, and not just have it be this conversation that we kind of have in-house. So if you all are available July 27, 9:30 to 5:00, I think we'll be at Fort Mason. And then 5:30 p.m. there'll be a reception. I know that Rebecca Prozan from Google is one of the people that we'll be recognizing, as well as Meredith Essalat from Mission Dolores, and Lieutenant Dangerfield from SFPD. And Lori will share more information, but just really excited to see the project grow, and for people who have seen it over the years, just--I think you'll be really impressed at the end of this summer with the presentations. They've just improved each year.

00:41:03

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Well, and I just want to say that sometimes, I think people have--initially may have a difficult time associating this work with the Human Rights Commission and human rights, but I just want to say that it is, once you think about it and hear what's going on, it becomes clear that what is happening through this initiative--and I again, you know,

thank you so much for bringing--creating this initiative of several years ago, and continuing to build it--is that we're engaging with young people, our future in the community, different--a range of ages. In engaging them on issues of human rights, understanding what those issues are for them and what they always have been for the community, and having them define them and explore them, and creating social justice warriors, but also creating, you know, citizens. You know, people who really do take the citizenship requirement that we have as people who are fortunate enough to live in the country that we do, even as bad as things have gotten now, and taking responsibility for ourselves and for our communities and for our futures. And so as somebody who is no longer young, I do want to thank you for stepping up in this incredibly powerful way. I know that it's something that you're just going to build on the older you get. So this is on-the-ground human rights work, I--no question. I was going to say I think, but I know. So thank you so much for helping us make a difference in our community. Colleagues, any other questions or comments right now? Any public--

00:42:58

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Commissioner Karwande?

00:43:01

MAYA KARWANDE

I just wanted to echo the comments that have already been made, and just thank everyone for your really excellent presentations and updates on the work that you've been doing, as well as just commend you for the time that you're spending, and the effort that you're putting into this. It's really impressive and inspiring.

00:43:21

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

These concrete impacts that you're having in the community--thank you. So fabulous. Thank you. Is there any public comment on this item? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you please read the next item on the Agenda?

00:43:35

COMMISSION SECRETARY

AB931, use of force by peace officers.

00:43:39

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And you know, I'm not sure if people from the cohort have to leave, but this is something that I think you'll find interesting, this presentation regarding the proposals for changing the use of force standard with police officers in the state of California. So I'd like to welcome to the podium Amanda Young from the ACLU.

00:44:12

AMANDA YOUNG

Hi, everyone. Thank you so much for having me. I'm here to talk about AB931. As most of you know, it's police accountability and the community protection [inaudible] that we have right now in the California legislature. And so basically I'm just going to talk about an overview of what this bill is and what actions that the ACLU and our partner organizations would love for you all, as a human rights commission, to move forward. And part of this presentation is also some community education, in case there

are any people in the room who are interested in learning more about this bill and how you can advocate to your legislators on behalf of this bill. Okay. So the major problem that this bill is addressing is that police in California right now are killing civilians at an alarming frequency. There was a report released just a couple of days ago that in 2017, California police killed 172 civilians, which is a 10 percent increase from 2016. And right now, under current law, police can use deadly force whenever an objectively reasonable officer would have done so, which is a very vague definition of--that a police officer can use to justify almost any act. And this is regardless of whether there was an immediate threat to life or bodily security. So the solution--this bill will change California's legal standard for when police can use deadly force to match the best practices that are already present in a lot of police departments, including in San Francisco, and I'll go over a little bit of how those policies intersect later on in the presentation. And it will clarify that police should use deadly force only when there are no alternatives. This slide tells a little bit more detail about the bill. The first major clause is that it'll establish that law enforcement should use de-escalation practices before moving to using deadly force, and these de-escalation practices include warnings, verbal persuasion, and other non-lethal methods of resolution. And then the second clause that's important, it'll determine that any homicide by a peace officer is not justified if the officer's criminal negligence contributed to making this force necessary. So that means that officers--if officers act with blatant disregard for human life in carrying on an action, then they'll be liable for that action if it results in a death that was otherwise avoidable if the officer had been more careful. And then number three, it'll affirm that police departments can discipline or fire officers who use deadly force, and in some cases, local district attorneys could also file criminal charges.

00:47:28

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Can I just clarify something? And so if there's a situation begins kind of normally, and the officer herself or himself escalates the situation into a point where they feel that lethal force is the only option at that point, under this legislation, what would be the analysis of that situation?

00:47:55

AMANDA YOUNG

So basically it would--we would have to look back. It's really hard to measure this in the moment, and it would really be looking back at what happened in that situation, and was there a reasonable way for the officer to have used other de-escalation methods. So that's why this first clause was really important, thinking about what are specific ways that police officers can confront the civilian before moving to using force.

00:48:24

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So the jury would be required to consider whether the officer--

00:48:26

AMANDA YOUNG

Yes.

00:48:47

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

--themselves escalated the situation in an unnecessary way.

00:48:30

AMANDA YOUNG

Yes.

00:48:31

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you.

00:48:32

AMANDA YOUNG

Sure. So the big reason why this bill is really important is that we believe that this higher standard for deadly force will kill fewer people, and police officers themselves will also be less likely to be injured or killed. And then in the next--the next slide shows how AB931 compares to the San Francisco police department policy. San Francisco's actually in a really good position, because our department here is already in compliance with AB931, whereas current California state law hasn't been amended since 1872, and it's the oldest unamended statute on police use of force in the country. So it's very far behind, and San Francisco right now is actually far ahead. But because there's only a San Francisco police department policy, it can't actually govern what happens in criminal cases. So they have no jurisdiction over whether a civilian who is injured by a police officer, they can't file criminal charges in San Francisco, even though the police department has this policy in place. So AB931 would create that policy, not just for San Francisco, but statewide. So this slide tells a little bit more about how California looks as a whole, in terms of police brutality. We have some of the highest rates of killing in the nation, and of the 15 police departments with the highest per-capita rates of police killings in the nation, five of those are in California. And last year, the LAPD shot more than three times as many people as the New York police department--even though the LAPD has only a fourth as many officers. And right now, we've just really reached a tipping point. The way that this bill was brought about by Weber and McCarty was right after the Stephon Clark shooting in Sacramento that gained a lot of national attention, there'd already been momentum moving behind writing a bill of this type. But then that really just pushed California forward, and this is now a really great opportunity for our state to stand up and take a strong stance against police brutality. This slide shows a little bit about who supports AB931. So the ACLU of California has partnered with other organizations, such as Communities United for Restorative Youth Justice, PICO California, and a couple of other organizations listed there. And we also have great support from labor unions, and the legislators listed there are the ones who are in support. Mark Stone is the one who's from the Bay Area who is a sponsor. And we've also gotten support from a couple of newspapers who have published editorials--"The Sacramento Bee," "The San Francisco Chronicle," and "The San Diego Union Tribune." So the big action that we're asking for from you all, and then also of members of the general public, is right now AB931 needs to pass both the senate floor and the assembly floor by August 31<sup>st</sup>. That's the deadline. And right now, it's in the senate appropriations committee, so we're really urging everyone to call their state senator and their state assembly

member, and to schedule in-person meetings to talk about the importance of this bill. So everyone who lives in San Francisco, Assembly member David Chiu is our key target here. He has not released any statements about how he'll stand on this bill yet, but we think that he can be moved to be a really strong proponent for this bill. That's why we would be really interested in potentially partnering with the Human Rights Commission to schedule any meetings with him, to ask him more about this stance on this bill, and if he has any questions or concerns. So if anyone in the general public is interested in calling their legislators on this bill, this is a sample call script that we have. And then this slide shows some effective lobbying tips for everyone. And I can also leave the extra copies of the presentation on the desk over there.

00:53:24

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

That would be great.

00:53:24

AMANDA YOUNG

Sure. Thank you so much for your time. Does anyone have any questions?

00:53:31

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So we have another speaker after you.

00:53:33

AMANDA YOUNG

Yes.

00:53:33

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And perhaps this may be more something that he could handle. But could one of you-- could you--would you be the person to tell us a little bit about why--who opposes the bill. And I do know that there is law enforcement that at this time does not support the bill. Can you give us, in a nutshell, why, or should I leave that for Mr. Alden?

00:53:57

AMANDA YOUNG

I can talk a little bit about it right now. So the California Police Chiefs Association and then the Peace Officers Research Association in California are the two main groups that are opposing this bill. Some of their arguments--most of their arguments are regarding--they think it's dangerous to create this new standard because a lot of the ways that police officers decide when to use force are in those split-second decisions, and they're worried that this will now put the police officers more in danger, because they'll be more hesitant to make those tough calls during those times. And this is the rhetoric that's been used by a lot of people, not just in California, to push back against legislation such as this one. And the Peace Officers Research Association, they also say that they don't want to re-train their officers on how to comply with this new law, which is--well, we think that the re-training could help save lives, and so it'd be worth it.

00:55:01

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you.

00:55:02

AMANDA YOUNG

Sure.

00:55:04

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Commissioner Karwande.

00:55:05

MAYA KARWANDE

Hello. Thank you for your presentation. I had one just quick follow up question. In your presentation you focused on sort of changing the standard for bringing criminal charges as a result of inappropriate use of deadly force. How would this law affect bringing civil cases for excessive force, those types of civil lawsuits in California courts?

00:55:36

AMANDA YOUNG

So this law, it allows--it would allow civilians to bring forth the criminal charges, but it actually wouldn't change anything about the civil cases. So this is really a first step for us, and we think that after--if this bill is passed, we can build on it, and hopefully move forward the needle on other things, such as civil proceedings.

00:56:03

MAYA KARWANDE

Thank you.

00:56:04

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you.

00:56:04

AMANDA YOUNG

Sure.

00:56:06

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Commissioners, any other questions or comments for the speaker? I don't see any. And is there any public--well, actually, I was going to save that. So thank you so much for being here tonight.

00:56:19

AMANDA YOUNG

Thank you.

00:56:19

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And we look forward to seeing you again and hearing from you again. And I would just note that it's my understanding from our city attorney that the city of San Francisco has not yet taken a position on this legislation. And so we as a Commission cannot take a position. But it's my understanding that we can urge city officials and the board to take a position, so we will be discussing--and this is simply a discussion item tonight. But that is something that we can discuss doing going forward.

00:56:55

AMANDA YOUNG

Great. Well, thank you so much. And my email is on the back. If you all have any other questions, we'd love to talk further.

00:57:02

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And can you provide--maybe you've already done this, but if you haven't, could you provide us a PDF of this--

00:57:08

AMANDA YOUNG

Sure, I can send the PDF.

00:57:09

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you.

00:57:10

AMANDA YOUNG

Thank you.

00:57:11

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you so much. And Mr. Alden?

00:57:22

JOHN ALDEN

Good evening, Chair Christian, members of the Commission, Director Davis. Thank you for having me tonight. My name is John Alden. I'm an assistant district attorney here in San Francisco under our district attorney George Gascón. I manage our independent investigations bureau, which is charged with investigating cases like the ones that Ms. Young was just describing--cases in which officers have used force or even deadly force here in San Francisco, regardless of what agency they might work for. As you may know, this is an initiative that D.A. Gascón has pushed over the last few years and that we've been implementing over the last about year and a half to make sure we're doing a everything thorough job of assessing those kinds of cases. And because of that, we're using these statutes that Ms. Young just spoke about on a regular basis, and it is, I think, a fair statement to say that California has a set of criminal statutes about when an officer can use deadly force that are exceptionally broad--much older than those in other states, much broader, and much more permissive. This is a significant challenge in several ways. One is that people will often ask us why have officers not been charged in shoots that the public perceives as unnecessary, and one reason for that is that California law provides such tremendous discretion to officers with very little supervision in the criminal law arena because of the statutes we're talking about tonight. This bill would change that and provide a great deal more guidance. It is true that it would increase the kinds of situations in which a prosecutor might charge an officer with a crime, but I think perhaps more importantly it would change the parameters, the rules, for officers to use force here in California. And it's the position of D.A. Gascón that that would cause police departments to then train differently, to equip officers differently, to prepare them differently, for these kinds of events, so that in the long run we would see fewer shootings, less use of force, fewer injuries amongst the public, and even fewer amongst law enforcement. And I think that's a goal worth striving towards, even though there are some who have some concerns about the approach we've heard tonight. This was one reason why D.A. Gascón is, the last I checked, the only district attorney in the state of California that's endorsed this legislation, and I think that's a very bold step on his part.

One of the things that concerns us about current law is that the standard of reasonableness is simply so broad. It does not require officers to provide warning, or to retreat, or to attempt to deescalate. One thing that I think is particularly admirable about 931 is that it explicitly requires officers to attempt to deescalate situations in which force begins to look like it might be a possibility. It still provides some discretion to officers, but it requires them to at least make the attempt, and that, I think, is one of the most important parts of this bill. Under this rule, departments will be required, effectively, to train their officers to think about ways they can slow down these situations, to create more physical distance, to create more time to communicate with the subject that they're interacting with, to create the opportunity to find nonlethal ways to end the encounter. That's simply not required today, and candidly, when I've seen training in some departments other than San Francisco, it's actively discouraged. And I think that's one reason why California sees the rate of force that we do, as Ms. Young had described in her statistics. I am happy to answer any questions you might have about the bill or how it might apply to some of our work. Thank you for having me.

01:01:21

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you for being here. Really appreciate it. Commissioner Ellington.

01:01:24

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Yeah just real quick--thanks for the presentation, and Ms. Young, thanks for the information. This is the first time I've seen this in length, so I do have a lot of questions. But I just want to reserve one for this time. Under AB931, the sort of no-alternatives clause, how is that defined or how does one determine that there were no other reasonable alternatives in a case where someone's shot and killed, or deadly force is used?

01:02:00

JOHN ALDEN

Right. That particular provision, as I see it, is an amendment to section 835(a) of the penal code, and in the proposed language, that reads "police officers shall attempt to control an incident by using time, distance, communications, and available resources, in an effort to deescalate a situation whenever it is safe and reasonable to do so." So that's one of two parts that I think are central in this regard, so it explicitly calls out to the officer that they need to use time, distance, communications, and whatever other available resources they may have to attempt to calm the situation. So that's one way in which the officer is specifically called to attempt these alternatives before they go to lethal force. Another is that in this legislation, in again, penal code section 835(a), there's an explicit requirement that the force may only be used if necessary. And the term "necessary" is defined as follows: "Given the totality of the circumstances, an objectively reasonable peace officer will conclude there was no reasonable alternative to the use of deadly force that would prevent imminent death or serious bodily injury to the peace officer or another person." So we're asking the officer there to think not just is deadly force one of the tools I could use, which is how the current standard works. The officer may go to deadly force straightaway, frankly, if that is one reasonable alternative. But

here, they'd have to be able to point out that I really didn't have any other alternative. You know, that certainly does require the officer to think about the encounter in a different way than they do today, and that certainly is going to require re-training of officers. That's not going to happen overnight. There will certainly be a period of time in which every officer in California would have to adopt to this standard. But you know, that said, officers today do think carefully about their training. They are trained repeatedly on how and when to use deadly force, so that they can make that determination very quickly. And so I'm confident that, moving forward, departments will be able to train officers in this regard, just as we're starting to do now in San Francisco at the local level.

01:04:14

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Just a quick follow up. The reasonable alternative--is that determined by the peace officer, or is that determined as just sort of the jury or regular individual? The only reason why I ask that is because as all of this sort of discussion has--how it has played itself out, I think police officers have a higher level of responsibility than, say, your normal individual who happens to be walking down the street or sitting as a member of the jury. So how is that determined?

01:04:55

JOHN ALDEN

Well, we certainly would be--well, there are two ways. One is that the reasonable alternatives are also defined in the statute to include verbal communications, warnings, de-escalation, and the phrase used in the legislation is "tactical repositioning," meaning basically backing up, retreating where necessary. So those specific alternatives are called out in the legislation, so the officer would have to explain why those would not have worked or didn't apply. Now in addition to that, we believe that this legislation would create a clearer path to also comparing the officer's behavior against the training at their department. If their department provides additional alternatives, like for example the crisis intervention teams we use here in San Francisco when we think that the subject might have a mental health issue, that would be another tool that the officer would have at least here, and would need to be able to explain why that tool didn't make sense or wasn't available at the time. And so we think that being able to compare local training and resources to the officer's response, and having a path to doing that in the legislation, would be a great help. Today, it's not really very clear that a prosecutor can do that in the course of assessing one of these cases.

01:06:14

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Last question--has there been any assessment on, if AB931 passes, is there a standard practice of what training should look like, and does that leave either the city or the police department liable in any way where, example, if a police officer was to say I was not trained correctly for this situation.

01:06:41

JOHN ALDEN

Right. Well, you know, a great benefit that we have here in San Francisco is that we're already pioneering this training. You know, as Ms. Young mentioned, this bill is remarkably similar to current use of force policy here in San Francisco, and roughly a year to a year and a half ago, San Francisco's police commission moved us to a policy that explicitly requires de-escalation in language very similar to what you see here in the bill. And during that time, the police department's created a syllabus of training in that regard, and they've been moving officers through that training. So if this bill were to become law, say at the end of this calendar year, I think a great thing for San Francisco is that we would already be one step ahead, and that we would have about a year, a year and a half worth of training specifically to this standard already under our belts. And that would reduce the chance that there would be the sort of liability you were describing. For other jurisdictions, that might be more challenging.

01:07:37

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Thank you.

01:07:37

JOHN ALDEN

You're very welcome.

01:7:39

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Following up on Commissioner Ellington's question, so it seems to me that if this did pass in California, it would also be a level toward pushing departments to retrain in certain ways because they could well be open to liability, you would think--civil liability, if not criminal negligence, for failing to train officers to follow the law, right?

01:08:11

JOHN ALDEN

Yes, exactly, and I think that dovetails with the question that Commissioner Karwande, if I'm pronouncing it correctly, had asked earlier, about whether this bill affects civil liability. And it doesn't directly. This bill doesn't have anything in particular that would amend the civil code or causes of action. It does change the standards under which officers can use deadly force in California. So if someone were bringing a state law claim in California, the officer would have to show they complied with this language as opposed to the old language we have on the books now. So in that regard, it would set a different stage, if you will, for a civil case, in much the way that you just described, Chair Christian. And so I think that would create a lot of pressure on other departments to then train to this standard. Before I worked for the district attorney's office, I worked for the Department of Police Accountability, and before that, for the police department, and I do believe from that experience that departments do very intentionally and proactively attempt to train their officers to state law standards, as a first principle. So if this policy--if this law changes state level policy, I'm very confident that local policy will follow in the way that you described.

01:09:27

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And given the--when we had a real Justice Department, they laid out hundreds and hundreds of pages about what policing should look like in the century that we live in. so there is--there are resources, and there is a roadmap for departments to train their people.

01:09:48

JOHN ALDEN

Absolutely. You know, President Obama's commission--task force on 21<sup>st</sup> century policing talked about de-escalation in some detail, and so other departments in other parts of the country have been trying to work on how to build training around those issues. And that would help address one of the questions that Commissioner Ellington was asking, about how you put together a training program. We're certainly not the only department that's working on creating this sort of training.

01:10:13

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Great--I've been wanting this presentation since I heard about this legislation, so I'm so glad that we can begin this conversation now, and that we had such great presentations to help us think about and understand where we are. Are there any other questions or comments right now? Is there any public comment on this item as a whole? Director Davis.

01:10:42

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

I just wanted to thank both the presenters for coming out tonight, but I also just wanted to recognize Snay Ral helping to coordinate and organize the presentation. He has been really helpful in this, and engaged with this as well as the work that's been going on around fines and fees and just a lot of the work around criminal justice reform with the city. So just wanted to acknowledge the work and effort that he's been putting in.

01:11:13

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And I appreciate you bringing that to the fore. Seeing no public comment, I believe we're finished with this item. And thank you again to the speakers for coming tonight. Really appreciate it. Madam Secretary, would you read the next item on the Agenda? I believe it is item six.

01:11:33

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Comments on the Legacy Museum. Presenter, Monique LeSarre from Rafiki Coalition.

01:11:42

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Welcome. It's great to see you.

01:11:45

MONIQUE LESARRE

Good evening--good evening, everyone.

01:11:48

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE

To the chair, can I just--

01:11:49

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yes.

01:11:50

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

I just wanted to thank Monique. We've heard from a lot of people that they've been going to Bryan Stevenson's museum and have a lot of thoughts and comments on the museum and its relevance, and the chair had asked that potentially we could hear from someone who had visited, and I think it's something that we'd like to consider how the HRC is engaged, and whether that's taking a group of people to see it, or to just be a little bit more engaged, both with that and some of the other museums in D.C. that are really historical, and that we need to be thinking about the work that we're doing. So I just wanted to acknowledge--I know Monique came in, I didn't have a chance to really check in with her. But she went with a delegation when the museum was opened, and it was the same time as the event that we had with Cornel West, and she and I have been talking a lot about faith, hope, and healing, and this idea of how we as a community begin to acknowledge all the hurt that communities have felt. And as we do this work around human rights and civil rights, how do we acknowledge that there's a pain that also needs to be recovered. So Rafiki is actually going to host one of the groups tomorrow, and Nicole is here to go and see the practices that they've been doing around mental health and supporting communities. But just thank Monique for coming out tonight.

01:13:16

MONIQUE LESARRE

So, thank you, Director, thank you--

01:13:18

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

Dr. LeSarre.

01:13:20

MONIQUE LESARRE

Yes, Ms. LeSarre. So--and thank you to the Commission. I didn't actually expect to be here when Sheryl said--Director Davis said come by. I thought she meant the office, [laughter] to talk, so I'm madly underprepared. So please note that, and just bear with me. I did--I don't know, can you see the screen on my iPhone here? Did I put it up right? Can you see it? A little bit. I don't know if I can get it any bigger. Even if you see it a little bit, so this is--let me set the tone a little. So Glide Memorial and Rafiki Coalition, and then the Kitchen, which is a Jewish collective as well, all partnered to go to the Legacy Museum and the opening of the national monument. And it's basically mass--from enslavement to mass incarceration. And what Bryan Stevenson has done in this museum and in--this is actually the memorial, the peace memorial. So there's two sites that are deeply important. In the Legacy Museum itself, you couldn't take any pictures, so I don't have any of those. But you can check out--Oprah did a piece with Bryan--walking through with Bryan Stevenson, and it's really incredibly beautiful. One of the things that we've been looking at is that there's this piece of grief, of stories, that have never been--some of them have never been completely told. There's--Toni Morrison spoke about it when "Beloved" came out as a movie--there's no space, there's no tree, there's no memorial, there's no bench by the side of the road that you and I can go to think about or look at. The idea of the passing of all of the folks in the Middle Passage,

but also those who lost their lives--and there's four different segments of enslavement in the United States. And I really encourage you to understand those different parts of the legacy, because they're all very--some of them are much more brutal than others, and in those types of types, life expectancy was less than seven years in captivity, literally. Folks' bones being pulled off, their muscles being pulled off bones in some of the cases. And I say this to say that there's so much of that that never got to be grieved, those stories that never got to be heard, those lives that never got to be honored. And so part of what Bryan Stevenson is doing with this museum which is so incredible is not only--so this is the memorial, and these are all--what you begin to think about is these are all--because this is the lynching memorial, you start to think about these as the bodies, right? Strange fruit, blood on the fields, fruit in the trees, which was Billie Holiday's song about lynching. But what you begin to see is on each of these columns are names of folks who they know were lynched, and these are all representing counties. And they go throughout the entire museum. And--let me see if I can give you another sense of them. They are--so there's a way that you walk down into the passage, and you begin to just understand what it would be like to see a body, and just start to imagine what was going on at that time. So the Legacy Museum itself is very powerful, but also what you begin to see is that the museum, they've collected soils from all the counties in the sites where there were lynchings. And you begin to see that these lives--and the idea is that they will be reclaimed by the counties, and they will go back to their counties and they will be taken care of. They will be mourned. But there's also so many stories that were left untold. And so some of what we don't--we get to see in his museum and in the memorial is that you begin to see really what racial terror was. So lynching wasn't lynching on its own, I don't like you. Lynching was you don't have a right to exist in this space unless I say you do. So the lynchings were anything from somebody knocking on a door for a direction, to being in a cab--if somebody else couldn't get somebody else that offended them for some kind of way, and they pull a black man out of a cab and lynch him. But it was also entire families. So as you walk through, you'll see names or whole families with the same last name, and you'll wonder what happened on that day. So it's a way to really make this racial terror that Bryan Stevenson talks about, and make it understandable today. Because a lot of our folks out here have legacies and roots in these counties in the South, and they left because of racial terror. They left because of these incidents. So if you couldn't get to one person, you would get to the entire finally. And so this is a way where folks just left in the night. So there's so many folks--cousins, uncles, aunties, brothers--that were just gone. So they would either be killed, and maybe you didn't even know that they were killed, or they would be gone, off to another environment, whether up North or out West. And so the last thing I wanted to say which is so profound, and why I think folks from here need to go, is because you start to understand the psychological impact of what would happen when you know that you can only go in this one area. Right? Does that remind you of anything? So whether it's Devil Rock, Harbor Row, Hunter's Point, wherever you live, you begin to understand you can only go in this place. So there's a way that what has been internalized psychologically, that terror of I'm not safe has now been internalized into the community, and into the psyche of our

children, and into our own psyche. So you begin to see how much more freedom we could have if we started to say oh, I don't like you, not because I don't like you, or you live on that street; I don't like you because the government and because white supremacy said that I shouldn't like you. Does that make sense? So in essence, visiting the museum, visiting the legacy memorial, folks get a really deep sense of the history, and literally, you're walking--when you're in the museum, it was a place where they kept folks enslaved, where they literally were chattel slavery in the room. So it was really--it was super-deep, and also really grief-invoking. But there's so many stories that need to be told, so I do really strongly encourage HRC to figure out a way to bring youth, to bring adults, to bring mixed groups of folks, and build curriculum around that learning. So just want to say thank you, and I hope that was okay, because I wasn't ready for it.

01:20:14

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

No, it was fantastic, and resonates on so many levels. You know, you talk about the young people who are growing up in the city and feel like they can't leave a neighborhood or they'll be killed if they go into a neighborhood. I mean, I think there's--I find it difficult to believe that there's any black person of any generation living in this country that doesn't have some degree of that memory of terror, which circumscribes the way that we act and the way that friends who are not black or who didn't come from a background where there was this kind of community terror placed upon them, they don't understand why like, you know, why don't you just go trespass here, why don't you go running down the street in this neighborhood, or why don't you just go jump in somebody's pool when they might be--somebody--the neighbor might see you. You know, because you know, even if you don't know intellectually, you know that you're putting your life at risk. So thank you for this, and I'm so grateful to the executive director for having you come today. Because I do think that you're right, and I really do want the HRC to partner with other agencies, or people who will pay for it. But even if we can't partner, I think we should definitely start some trips to D.C. to see this place, the Holocaust Museum, the African-American Historical Museum, also which has these spaces in it as well. So thank you.

01:21:49

MONIQUE LESARRE

Thank you.

01:21:49

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Commissioner Ellington?

01:21:51

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Yeah, thank you for that. I mean, I--you know, just through your story, there was so much emotion that I think was transmitted to everyone up here, but everyone in this room as well. Chair Christian, I mean, I think you touched on a very important point about this idea of fear and terror. I think particularly amongst black folks, having to see that and live that twofold, you mentioned a couple streets in Hunters Point, and the first thing that

sort of came to my mind was the fear that we have to have for ourselves and through ourselves, and then the fear we have in other people. And this idea that--

01:22:46

MONIQUE LESARRE

They're not safe.

01:22:47

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Exactly, folks are just not safe. You mentioned in the beginning--and I know you do this in your everyday life--but there was a healing piece to this. Can you share a little bit about--briefly; I know we're on time restriction--but just about the healing piece of your experience at the Legacy Museum?

01:23:09

MONIQUE LESARRE

Yeah. I think that when you walk in, especially into the space of the memorial, I spent about three hours there. I would have spent longer if I'd had longer. And literally just walking in, it's just the magnitude of it, and the grief. It provides an opportunity and a space, and a place to hold it, where we might not in a normal day. So it's just you can take that time to be there, to honor. There's different--and the way that it's set up, there's a waterfall, a water fountain, where you can just sit there and think and be. But then there's also a path out, and the path out is over a hill, where you can see that you're not in that any longer. So it is just sitting with and telling the stories, and then it's also the idea of bringing that back to each of the counties where lynchings happened. So what would happen if counties brought back some of these names and honored these names, and said--and in some way, there was some truth and reconciliation process. So like the TRC that South Africa went through, we need to actually do some of that here. I know that Dr. Fanya Davis and some other folks are talking about doing some of that work, and I think it's something that we deeply need here. We have to tell the stories, we have to weep together, we have to--when Desmond Tutu came here about 10 years ago, he talked about that racism in this country is like a wound that's festered inside, and it's poisoned, and it's like a boil, and it needs to get lanced. And we need to clean it out, and you need to pack it, and clean it out some more, and pack--I mean, it's kind of graphic, if you think about what the boil is, but we need to lance the boil. We need to go there together, all of us. It's all--anybody that lives in this country has a legacy related to this.

01:25:01

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Yeah.

01:25:02

MONIQUE LESARRE

So then yeah, there's many healing practices, and we can talk more about that another day, maybe, asking Director Davis. But that's one of the ones that I think is just being together, telling the stories, feeling the feelings.

01:25:15

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And then there's that very real connection between what you're saying and mental health.

01:25:19

MONIQUE LESARRE

Exactly.

01:25:19

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And psychological health, and physical health.

01:25:22

MONIQUE LESARRE

Well, and you imagine systemic racism, right, and how folks--how we, our own stories of it, get treated when we have that moment, and that moment is--that maybe it's not real, maybe something is wrong with you, something's wrong with me. And then when we start to understand it in the system, we understand I'm not crazy. It's the system that is supremacist, it is the system that's homophobic, it's the system that is transphobic, it's the system that's racist. And we begin to see that, right, and it's a different--it's a whole different ballgame.

01:25:54

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Commissioner Chan.

01:25:55

EVA CHAN

Thank you so much for sharing this with us. It was very helpful just seeing your pictures. It reminded me a lot of the Holocaust Museum in Berlin, where you have the obelisks coming up from the ground. And having this come down from above, and picturing the victims, it's very graphic and it's very invoking. What I'm kind of curious about is, as part of this exhibit, was there something that would lead people to kind of examine their ancestors', I guess, role as perpetrators of this violence in terms of how this was normalized in communities. I've heard stories--and it may have been in relation to this museum--of postcards that people bought--

01:26:48

MONIQUE LESARRE

Mm-hmm, they did.

01:26:49

EVA CHAN

--from their town's lynching, and people would celebrate it, and members of the community were pictured happy on these postcards. And I was wondering if there was a component where people could look back at the dark portions of their family history and say my great-grandfather did this. I need to see how that was passed down to me, and take atonement for their family, in a way.

01:27:24

MONIQUE LESARRE

It wasn't explicitly there, and in fact I think that it could be--there could be an incredible curriculum around that very piece of what that that level of dissociation takes, to remove someone else's humanity in order to be able to commit those types of crimes and those types of tortures, and to really erase someone, and just--that a dog was more important than the person, the body, the black body, that was hanging there. And so it's embedded

in the images, and some of it--but there's no opportunity to really discuss it. So I think that that would be--I would advise the next level of the work.

01:28:06

EVA CHAN

Thank you so much.

01:28:05

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yeah. Thank you.

01:28:07

EVA CHAN

You invoked Toni Morrison at the beginning, and just putting this on a continuum history, I always think back in "Beloved," the line, "This was the worst one yet." And I just want for there to be no further "yets."

01:28:21

MONIQUE LESARRE

Yeah, and unfortunately, whether it--I mean, it brought it home, right, from Starbucks, when we were in New York, to, I mean, everything that's going on. The little girl selling water. Bodies are not--we're being policed again. Oakland, Lake Merritt--there's a different level of racial terror, yet it's still racial terror. It's a modern lynching. So we're still doing some of these things.

01:28:44

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Seeing the way that a person can be in a space is being policed by someone else and defined by someone else.

01:28:51

MONIQUE LESARRE

Yes. Yeah. So we've got a lot of work to do. [laughter] So thank you all for doing your work.

01:28:57

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yeah. Well, we'll see you soon.

01:28:58

MONIQUE LESARRE

Thank you so much.

01:29:00

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you for this presentation. Any public comment on this item? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you read the next item on the Agenda?

01:29:11

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Update on projects and staff. Noah Frigault will introduce the HRC summer interns.

01:29:18

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Welcome, Noah.

01:29:22

NOAH FRIGAULT

Good evening, commissioners, great to see you again. So I am excited to introduce our summer cohort of law student interns. They will introduce themselves--Megan, Alisa, and Libna. All work full-time for at least 12 weeks on a variety of projects with different staff and in both divisions of the office. So we're really happy to have them, and without further ado, here's Megan.

01:29:57

MEGAN UNGER

Good evening. My name's Megan Unger, I'm a rising second year at UC Hastings, just down the street. I have an interest in social justice and environmental law, so coming to the SFHRC for me was really interesting, because such a wide variety of subjects that are focused on, and I wanted to kind of dip my foot in the government pool and kind of see how that operates on a daily basis. So far I've been able to write a press release for 2018 Pride, do one-on-one experience with walk-ins, work on racial equity research in the city, and also throughout the country, including handing out surveys to people in the city, as well as creating a research database that me and Alisa have been working on. And I've also been able to speak to the board of appeals on behalf of the SFHRC regarding the early day statute in the civic center. Thank you.

01:30:48

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Welcome, and thank you for your work.

01:30:54

LIBNA HAKIEM

Good evening, my name is Libna Hakiem. I am a rising second-year law student at the University of Santa Clara school of law. I decided to intern for the HRC because I was really interested in discrimination law, and also I had an interest in social justice. So I'm coming close to the end, so next week is going to be my last week, but I've learned so much throughout my internship. I've gained a lot of knowledge about discrimination law regarding housing, employment, public accommodation, and the list goes on. I've also worked on a lot of communication skills. I've been working on an Afro-centric memo to help make a better racial equity in San Francisco education, and I did research on Toronto schools, and to see how they have been implementing Afro-centric curriculums in their public school systems, and what San Francisco could do to promote a more cultural-sensitive kind of curriculum towards Afro-centric, and helping black students achieve more in school. So through that I've done a lot of in-person interviews, phone interviews. That's really helped me gain my confidence in my speaking skills. I've also led intakes, and I've also observed a lot of intakes. So I'm really grateful for this opportunity, and working with the HRC staff has been a great pleasure. Thank you.

01:32:18

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

We're grateful for your work, so thank you. Welcome.

01:32:25

ALISA DATIO

Thank you. Good evening, my name is Alisa Datio and I'm a rising three year at the University of San Francisco School of Law. So I'm primarily interested in immigration

law, particularly deportation defense and civil rights litigation. I've had a lot of experience doing nonprofit work, and I wanted to see what it was like working in the government. And I've learned a lot working at the HRC. For a lot of people who come into our intakes, we're the last agency that they can go to. So just listening to their stories and making sure that their concerns are heard makes a difference for a lot of people. So as Megan mentioned, I've also been working on racial equity work for HRC, so we've been researching different cities, seeing how they implement racial equity, and how they hold different government departments accountable to ensure across-the-board. This is a huge issue, and I'm excited to see what San Francisco will do with it. Thank you.

01:33:22

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Commissioners, any questions or comments for our interns and their work? How much longer do you have left?

01:33:32

LIBNA HAKIEM

One week for me.

01:33:35

NOAH FRIGAULT

It varies.

01:33:36

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

It varies, yeah. Thank you. Director Davis.

01:1:33:41

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

I just wanted to--they all kind of mentioned helping with intake and doing some work. I just--I think one of the difficult things for the HRC is that we really get involved and get an opportunity to see the policy work, and some of the other efforts that happen. But that we really forget that the foundation of the office is around the discrimination and the piece that actually engages with people that walk in or people that are frustrated. And I know that they have all seen varying degrees of people frustrated with the process, that come into the office, that have literally been to no less than some of them 10 different places to get help. And I just want to acknowledge and thank them for putting themselves in really very difficult situations, and still showing up, especially for a volunteer position. And then the other piece is just around the work that they're doing around racial equity. This is supporting the work that Deputy Director Polk will talk about later. But that really helping us develop and frame this, and just want to acknowledge and thank them for their work. We realized, some of us in the office realized that Noah has a very comprehensive orientation that he does with the interns, that we actually think it would be great for the Commission to go through. You would learn quite a bit about the HRC and the work that is being done. So I just want to recognize and also acknowledge and thank Noah for the effort and energy that he puts into the work. I don't know if you all have ever had to, in your work, done work with volunteers and just understand the amount of time and energy that it takes to create a space for them to work in, and so I just want to thank them. And across the board, the

office, I just think about Terry and Lori and other folks. Just I want you all to really realize that yes, there's a lot of work that goes into the policy division, but there's a tremendous amount of vicarious drama, if I look at Dr. LeSarre, that a lot of our folks go through just trying to support people who feel disenfranchised. So I just want to thank you for the work that you've done.

01:36:05

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And I think you're right. I know that I would love to go through Noah's orientation, but I think absolutely all of our commissioners should, especially when we take the seat on this Commission. And the Director is completely right--working--or even not only volunteers, but bringing on new staff, it's a huge, huge input of time that people have to give, and very thoughtful in making the experience something that people can retain and understand and creating a good work environment. So thank you, Noah, for this work. And she's given you more of it to help us too, so enjoy. Commissioner Karwande.

01:36:51

MAYA KARWANDE

I just wanted to really quickly echo the comments that have already been made, and thank you for choosing to spend your summer with the HRC. I'm also an attorney, and wasn't in law school too long ago, and I know that there's many options and ways to do social justice, and ways to spend your summer, and I thank you for spending it with us.

01:37:13

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And for checking out the government. Any other questions or comments, Commissioners? Any public comment on this item? Seeing none, thank you, Mr. Frigault, thank you, interns. Enjoy the rest of your time, and I hope to see you at the office. The next item?

01:37:36

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Upcoming events. The director will present.

01:37:41

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

So I already mentioned the July 27<sup>th</sup> event, and then I will say a couple of other things out of the director's report. So I won't go there again, because I would love to make sure you get to Deputy Director Polk.

01:37:57

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So next then it would be Deputy Director Polk to come up and talk about GARE.

01:38:02

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

And as she's coming, I just want to again just acknowledge--there's a lot of talk in conversation around equity and racial equity across the nation, and there are some best practices happening in other places, and I just want to really thank and acknowledge the deputy director for leading this effort for the city. She has coordinated and organized their--she'll tell you more, but there's several departments that are engaged in this process.

They've got a couple of workshops coming up this month. So there's been a lot of work done, and it's all to her credit. So just really grateful for the work that she's been leading.

01:38:42

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

It is great work, and it's huge. So I'm really happy to be able to start to hear about it more directly. So, welcome.

01:38:48

ZOË POLK

Thank you. Good evening, Commissioners, my name is Zoë Polk. This is the first time I'm addressing some of you. Again, I'm the deputy director at the Human Rights Commission. I've been at the Human Rights Commission for about six years. In that time, some of my signature accomplishments are authoring the Fair Chance law, which looks at how criminal background checks are used in housing and employment, and regulates those. The first law in the country that regulates criminal background checks in housing and employment. Also the implicit bias curriculum, which is the DHR now holds--there's a city-based webinar that I hope the curriculum for that all employees can take and have access to for implicit bias. And I was also one of the main architects of the Cannabis Equity Program, looking at how persons who were formerly incarcerated, and particularly black and brown communities that were criminalized by cannabis, how San Francisco's regulation of the drug that is now legal is going to actually benefit those communities that were most decimated by that. So it's been a great time here, lots of important work that's been done, and always happy to work with the Commission. Always happy to think about--to partner with commissioners about ways in which we can approach this work, to make San Francisco better for everyone. So I manage the citywide racial equity team, which is a group of about 50 city employees who are committed to looking at disparities in San Francisco. Those two documents from my report that I put in your binders, one is this document, which if you look at this document, I mention [inaudible] snapshot of racial disparities in San Francisco. So we have about 50 city employees who are looking at these disparities and thinking about where the arts commission fits in with household income disparities, where SFMTA fits in with homelessness, and thinking about what levers can we pull in our various service areas to make sure that San Francisco is a city in which everyone can thrive. Because currently, it is not. We can look at any indicator, whether it's life expectancy, education, criminal justice. And [inaudible] aggregated by race, the people who experience racism are the ones who are going to fall at the bottom, no matter what the indicator is. So this is not something to be held by one department. It's something to be held by all of us as city employees. So the Human Rights Commission is actively working with departments on how we can look at our service areas and essentially see where we're failing our communities, and how we can disrupt the status quo that says we need to look at numbers of people served, or number of people who are in the program, and actually look at whether the program is working to benefit the people that we want to benefit, but also the people who are bearing the worst burdens of systemic and institutional racism. So the structure of these cohorts is--there are two. We have an introductory cohort and we have

an advanced cohort. I manage the advanced cohort with my colleague Sami Awata, who is one of our fellows. And the introductory cohort is managed by my colleague Ariana Flores. And in partnership with Race Forward and Center for Social Inclusion and UC Berkeley Haas Institute, employees receive about eight hours of formal training per month over a 12-month period. And the focus of this training is introduction to racism; specifically, what is the difference between institutional and structural, interpersonal racism, how government created racial classifications, how government currently perpetuates racial inequity, and why it's the government's responsibility, why it's city employees' responsibility to disrupt and to end racism and structural racism. And then use a results-based accountability framework to make sure you're actually having an impact. And so all of that is packed into a 12-month curriculum, in which we are in a room with counties including Napa, Mercer, Alameda, Contra Costa, Santa Clara, and San Jose, all learning the same framework and tools and strategies about how do we address these large areas. The Human Rights Commission attends these trainings with the employees, and then we host at a formal San Francisco specific meeting at our office, in which we engage all these departments about taking what we learned that has--that's a national strategy, and how do we think about it from a San Francisco focus. So we convene that and get their departments to think collaboratively, but also think how they can be working independently in their departments on these issues. And then the Human Rights Commission staff provides ongoing support, which can look like anything from can you come to our department and present at our senior staff meeting about the [inaudible] accountability framework, or it can look like I'm getting ready to give a presentation to my department. I want to make sure that I've got this content right. Can you review my PowerPoint, can you review my speaking notes and make sure this is on point with what we want to do, to can you actually give a training for our department. So there's a wide range of technical support that we provide departments who are participating in this cohort. We've had a number of successes. We track those successes in a number of different ways, anything from how often departments are collaborating--so if SFMTA is working with their colleague at the arts commission to actually be on their panel for reviewing contracts, and make sure there's a racial equity framework in the reviewing of the contract grant recipients, we consider that as a win, to whether departments are actually institutionalizing a racial equity lens within their department so that there's an employee who's designated to look specifically at the department service areas, as opposed to an employee who's kind of doing this half--doing racial equity in addition to their full-time job. So we track our wins and our successes in this a number of different ways. Also, on the one page I've kind of put some broad ones, which include the San Francisco public library being recognized nationally as one of the top libraries in the country specifically for engaging in racial equity work, as well as the Department of the Environment, their commission passing a resolution that basically says racial equity is the tenet of--what the Department of Environment needs to do. So I put a snapshot of those accomplishments--or we like to call them progress, because we still have a long way to go to achieving racial equity--on the one page here as well. So again, we work in partnership with Race Forward and Center for Social Inclusion in hosting a formal

training for city employees, which we think is really important to give them that baseline, and we have--this is our third year in doing this, and we have about 50 spots a year. And we have generated a large demand for this, and it's not just that people are looking for training. They're looking for ongoing support. The Human Rights Commission is really trying to get out of the business of doing two-hour trainings, because we're seeing that people need a lot more support than just two hours, and we're seeing people also need to be held accountable. So it's one thing for us to come in and talk to you about how institutional and structural racism is showing up in your employment or in your workplace; it's another thing for us to be staying engaged with you over a 12-month period, ask you how you're going to identify whether you're having success on this, and then follow up with you the following month, to see if you're actually measuring that, if you're having that impact. And if you're not having that impact, how can we partner with you to change some things so that you are having the impact that you want to. But recognizing that--so one of the things that we are doing two eight-hour trainings on July 26<sup>th</sup> and July 30<sup>th</sup>, that is this document here. The reason we wanted to do this is one, to acknowledge that there are a number of people who did not get into--get one of the 50 spots that we had this year in the cohort who really want this foundational training about how do I know the difference between institutional, structural, interpersonal racism, how can I as a white person show up when I don't experience racism, how can I think about how our department perpetuates disparities. So there's a lot of people who want that baseline education. But the main reason we're doing this training is because we have people--for example, our department of--the Municipal Transit Agency, SFMTA, has 6,000 employees, and they've had six people go through the cohort with us. They have--these six employees are basically carrying--how do I get--how do we build this out for 6,000? So we are really working with all departments on how you build a committee within your department. So this training that we're doing is having departments invite people that they need to be on board with institutional and racial equity in their department. How do we get them those foundational trainings so that people who have been in the cohort can work with them from kind of this baseline knowledge that we can provide. So this training--these racial equity foundations that we're doing on July 26<sup>th</sup> and July 30<sup>th</sup> will be led by myself, Ariana, and Sami, relying on the national curriculum that does. And also infusing quite a bit of San Francisco history and San Francisco responsibility into the curriculum. We have 90 spots for both days, and right now we're sold out and have a wait list, so that's great. We essentially doubled the amount of people, because as I said, we had 50 people have gone through; in these two days, we're going to be doubling the amount of people who are getting this framework. So we're really excited about that. With that, I'll submit, and see what kind of questions or what kind of discussion we can have on this.

01:48:11

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

This is the first time you've done the foundations?

01:48:14

ZOË POLK

We actually did one last summer as well.

01:48:16

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Mm-hmm. And are there any commissioners from different commissions taking part in either of these?

01:48:26

ZOË POLK

So you know, it's--we use Event Brite, and Event Brite tells us by email address. So I can tell you--not tonight, because we just sold out today, but I can tell you in terms of it works out how--because we also give this out to community partners as well. So I can tell you how many city employee email addresses we receive versus Gmails and Hotmails and things like that. But we're going to be collecting more information about kind of what brought people to the training, actually at the training.

01:48:53

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And as we were talking a little bit earlier this evening about trainings that commissioners can and perhaps should get, this sounds like something that could be tailored for people who serve on commissions.

01:49:08

ZOË POLK

Absolutely. Our arts commission actually--the arts commission--the arts department--they did this training just for their department and all their commissioners and all their senior staff, so everyone. It was rescheduled about four times, and that's just the nature of our employees and executives and commissioners trying to get on the same schedule. But they did do it in June. I didn't present it. Our colleagues at CSI did. But I presented a small portion of it, and so yes, there is definitely an interest in that. I'm following up with them about what that accountability looks like on the commission side, the executive side, and on the staff side. But the training was on June 4<sup>th</sup>, so we're working that through.

01:49:47

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Well, I'd be interested in knowing your thoughts on doing something like that for our agency and commission.

01:49:55

ZOË POLK

Happy to do that, and if any commissioner wants to come on June 26<sup>th</sup> and June 30<sup>th</sup>, you may know someone who can get you in.

01:50:01

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay. Well, we'll see if we can exert some undue influence on someone and get let in in the side door. Director Davis?

01:50:11

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

No, I just wanted to also follow up as I was thinking, just the relationship with GARE and CSI, and really thank, again, Zoë for sticking with that and helping us develop that.

And so there was a grant opportunity with GARE and CSI to do some equity and community work, and so I submitted an proposal, and we did receive--we were awarded \$20,000 to do an equity fellowship model that we're going to do with--work with OEWD. So I've been talking with Zoë and her team about what that looks like and how we can integrate some of that work. So very excited to continue to build the partnership and expand the work.

01:51:00

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

That's great, congratulations. Commissioners, any other questions or comments at this time? This is really great--I mean, how many years ago was it when we first got contacted by the people who do GARE and we were thinking about whether we could do it and how, and what that would look like, would the mayor's office want to do it. So it's really gratifying to see how quickly, relatively, we've gotten to this place. So thank you for this work.

01:51:29

ZOË POLK

Thank you.

01:51:32

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Any public comment on this item? Moving on to letter D.

01:51:40

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Update on SHARP.

01:51:41

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

The Office of Sexual Harassment and Assault Response Prevention.

01:51:45

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

So I will just quickly say that through the budget and finance process, I know the last time we spoke I said that it was going to be moved to DPH. It has since been moved back to the HRC. Currently, it has three positions that will be housed at the HRC. We have been in conversation with the Department of Status of Women to have one of the positions be assigned or in partnership with them to be focused on policy, and to make sure that there's some alignment around the work that they've already been doing around sexual harassment and prevention and awareness. And then the other two positions will sit at the HRC. I know there was a document that was going out today from the budget office, so once I have that, I can have Lori share it with the group. But so the office of SHARP has been moved back to the HRC, at least as of tonight, and we will keep you updated on the process. But just wanted to let you know that that transpired during the budget and finance committee, with the board of supervisors on kind of the last few days of the work with that committee.

01:53:04

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And the new fiscal year will begin August 1<sup>st</sup>?

01:53:07

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

It technically begins July 1<sup>st</sup>, but the mayor signs--has until July 31<sup>st</sup> to sign the budget, and then it will be heard by the full board and voted on. So I can work with Lori to get those dates to you, so that you can know. But the budget was presented by Mayor Farrell, but it will be signed by Mayor Breed, so.

01:53:39

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Nice ring to it. Any commissioner comments or questions on that? Any public comment? Seeing none, we can move to item eight.

01:53:52

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Director and Chair's reports.

01:53:55

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Director Davis?

01:53:58

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

So I just was going to quickly say we had the event--I don't know, I think it was last week--at the MOAD, and just thanks to everyone for their support. Thanks, Commissioner Sweiss I know was able to join us, and I want to recognize again Dr. LeSarre. Rafiki actually had people there doing aromatherapy and massages, and people were lined up for all of that. And I recognize and thank the MOAD for actually allowing us to have the space to do that. We had a very lively discussion, I would say, between Anything John Burriss and the economist from the New School around reparations and whether that is possible, and whether it should be done. Attorney Harris had some thoughts about like what had been done in the past, and what was going to be possible moving forward. Conversations around the baby bond, this idea that people should be given \$30,000 at birth and then when they turn 18, have access to it. And Attorney Burriss sharing just some of the impact of clients that he's had that received large amounts of money after--so there was some discussion there as well, and then the conversation between Estella Garcia from Instituto in the Mission as well as Keisha Bentley Edwards from Duke University, as well as Belinda Ariga from University of San Francisco, but based on San Jose, just around healing amongst different communities and cultures, and what that looks like. And so I will share the--MOAD shared with us some of the surveys they got that said what about today's program provided you with new insight or learning. Some of them, the response is using the means of dance, art, music, visual art, to remedy subjugation of injustice and loss/absence of identity, reparations changing discourse from impoverished people and black and brown people. The panel in which I attended this evening, understanding our communities and what actually needs to be done, diversity of background and panelists, major takeaways, importance of involvement, acknowledge of past is key to healing, power of music, culture, and access to resources as key parts of solutions. So they were kind to share with us some of the surveys that they had, and I know that Noah and the interns also did some additional surveys that they'll share out later, just in terms of the project that they're working on around racial equity. So just

really excited to be able to be in community and have partnership. I know that we had initially only 100 slots for the event, and we bumped it up to 150, and we had 145 people RSVP for the event. So really grateful for that engagement. I've seen since then Attorney Burris several times over the last week, and he has said that he really enjoyed that, and he thought that that was a very engaging conversation, and I think what's always nice is when we have diversity of opinions on those panels. Not everybody is in agreement, and so we can have some real conversation and dialogue. And so I think that that, for me, was the most interesting, to see Attorney Burris, who is well-known for his ability to argue his opinion, in conversation with this economist, who was pretty sure that he thought that people should be able to get--because I made a reference to Dave Chappelle and I don't know if people watch Dave Chappelle, but one of the sketches that he had around reparations and people getting money back, and how people spent their money, and to which the economist said if people want to buy Cadillacs, I'm totally fine with that. And so it was an interesting exchange. But I think that that to me was just the highlight, that there was not just like we all are in agreement, but to have some kind of back-and-forth play and banter.

01:59:29

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And to be able to do that, and--because so often around issues of importance, it's difficult to have real conversations where people listen and engage without trying to shut somebody else down. Any questions about that particular item? Was that--is that preserved in any way? Was that taped, or--

01:58:51

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

I don't--I don't think so. Don did not videotape, did he? I don't think so. Sorry, we didn't think that far ahead. But the--Derrick Hamilton, the economist that we've been working with that's helping us with some of our assessment and evaluation, because he's a part of the Duke School social equity lab, he'll be back July 26<sup>th</sup>. He'll be at SPUR and I'll help with some of the facilitation. But SPUR is hosting something, Derrick will be with Fred Blackwell from the San Francisco Foundation, who actually gave us funding to cover the cost of having Derrick come out both times. And they'll be talking about do we need a jobs guarantee. So there will be a conversation around that, and it'll be another opportunity to hear from Derrick. And we've heard from several departments here in the city that they'd like for us to convene a conversation around what a jobs guarantee would look like. So maybe that will happen when Derrick returns at the end of this month.

01:59:57

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

I'm really interested in that topic, and we talked about that a little bit. And I don't--you will know whether this makes sense, but just--there's so much great work that's being done. I was so sorry that I couldn't be at MOAD. If there could just be one of the things on the checklist for all of the work that's being done, should this be recorded, can it be recorded, can we get somebody to cover the cost, if there is any. I'd really like to preserve--and not only preserve, but give access to a lot of this stuff when people--that people couldn't necessarily be present for live.

02:00:36

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

I'm just going to ask Terry and Lori, because they are like the brains of the operation, to make note of that, because they'll remember and I totally won't.

02:00:45

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Maybe just add that to the list of how we produce things, answering that question and doing it, if at all possible, if it makes sense. Any other questions or comments about that? Any public comment on that? So just the final thing here is the chair's report and joint commission meetings. And so we talked a little bit about the--this is just kind of an ongoing--I just want to have this on the Agenda every once in a while, to make sure it doesn't fall off and to keep people--keep this in the forefront of my mind, as well as in the forefront of your minds. Immigrant Rights Commission, obviously one we want to partner with sooner rather than later. Also, I think Status of Women would be a good partner soon as well. I always want to try to find a useful way to work with the police commission, and so we'll see whether that--any opportunity presents itself. So I think that's--if you have any thoughts about that. And perhaps out of the work that the cohort is doing this year, there might be some suggestions on joint commission meetings that can be held, or useful things that could come out of joint commission meetings--things that we can ask--that we can do ourselves, or things that we can urge the government to do, our city government to do, or work regionally with partners to do. So maybe if you could help us think about that as well, and we can amplify the work that you've done, and carry it forward. Any questions or comments about that? Any public comment on that item? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you read the next item on the Agenda, please?

02:02:32

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioners' activities in the community.

02:02:35

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So this is an opportunity for commissioners to report back to the Commission on work that we are doing within San Francisco communities. I'm not sure if anybody has anything they want to talk about at this moment in time. Commissioner Karwande?

02:02:53

MAYA KARWANDE

I don't think this qualifies as work, necessarily, but I attended the Families Belong Together rally in San Francisco. I forget which day exactly it was, and just felt like it was a really good turnout, really powerful. Powerful speakers and a powerful march. I think it was inspiring to be a part of, and I was happy that I attended, and that so many others did.

02:03:25

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Maybe we should change that to "activities"

02:03:26

MAYA KARWANDE

Yeah.

02:03:29

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yeah, it's really gratifying to know across the country--and I don't even think it was limited to this country, but so many people showed out in their communities, showed up for this, and it won't be the last time that we'll be required to take to the streets. But I'm glad you were there. This also doesn't require--doesn't count as work. It counted as work a little bit today, because I'm realizing that I'm not as young as I used to be when it comes to staying out during the week and trying to have a good time. But I was so thrilled, like so many other people in the city and on the Commission, to be able to be at the inauguration of our new mayor, was it just yesterday? And to continue that celebration through the evening. And while this is not a political commission, and the things that we do are not political in an adversarial way, or in a partial way, I just think that everybody in the city can recognize that we have stepped into--stepped across a historic line in a very good way, and that there--and it's not only on the new mayor's back, it's on all of us. And it's given all of us an opportunity to step into the future, and I'm really excited about it. And I haven't been excited about too many things that have been happening in the last year and a half, but this is kind of a shot in the arm, I think. And looking forward to, as somebody who lives in the city and has the opportunity to work here in government, I'm looking forward to continuing to try to be a part of change in the city. So any other thoughts? Right now it's almost 8:00, so I will ask if there's any public comment on the reports. Seeing none, I'll just say matters--the next item is matters of interest for possible inclusion on future Agendas. We covered a lot tonight, and please always know that you can send an email to me or to the director, preferably to both of us, with any ideas. Even random thoughts that you have are encouraged and welcome. But if somebody has something they want to say right now too, that's welcome. Director Davis?

02:05:49

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

Well, I don't want to put anyone on the spot, but I do know that Commissioner Chan sent a great idea that I owe her a response to. But I don't know if she wants to share or not. [laughter] You can say no.

02:06:05

EVA CHAN

I just sent Director Davis an email a while back about the incident involving the little girl by AT&T park who got the cops called on her for making too much noise selling water without a permit. And when I sent that email to Director Davis, at the time, the woman who made the call said she had not called the police, and she was just pretending. And it subsequently came out that she had indeed called 911, and they released the audio, and I just thought it might be good to have maybe a conversation about what education we can do for the community, to teach people not to call the police, even the non-emergency number, on people for very minor infractions as a way of harassing people. Number one, because it's a danger to the people who get called. Number two, as Dr. LaSarre brought up earlier, it's a form of policing people, and it's also, I've read, a form of gentrification, to make people feel unsafe in their neighborhoods because you call the police on them,

and it leads them to leave their communities because they don't feel welcome anymore. And one more point--I had heard that the woman who called the police in Oakland on the barbecue, that they actually did a 5150 evaluation on her. So it's also a lesson to teach people that they may be held involuntarily on a psychiatric hold. She wasn't held in that case, but any interaction with the police poses dangers, potentially, to both sides, if the training isn't there. So that's all.

02:07:40

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

I'm really glad that the director asked you to speak about that, because we have had a proposal from now a community member, but also a former member of one of our advisory committees, equity advisory committee, about training or offering trainings, or some kind of discussion, community discussion, for people on Next Door and things like that, but people in the communities who do these--see, I stayed out way too late last night. These community groups where each of the captains police stations, citizens advisory committees, whatever they call them, about how--like what is an emergency that's appropriate to call for, and what's not. And the racial and ethnic and all sorts of discriminatory implications and impulses that people are acting on, consciously or not, when they make some of these calls. And you know, maybe to have the police captains for their own advisory committees be required to have some sort of programming or training for people who want to join them, so that this awareness can be given, and this training can be given. So maybe this is a way for us to bring that programmatically together. I'm very glad that you asked the commissioner to speak about that. Commissioner Chan, did you want to--

02:09:12

EVA CHAN

Oh, one other thing to add from the public safety perspective, that it might also be good to do this education so that people aren't jamming up 911 with non-emergencies, as other people with more critical or real emergencies can't get the help that they need because of those calls.

02:09:28

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So Commissioner, would you be interested in working on that--kind of developing that program or presentation with the community person who brought the idea previously?

02:09:41

EVA CHAN

Yes, I would love to talk to that person.

02:09:43

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Great, great. And anybody else who is also interested, only thing we have to be concerned about are numbers. And Director, did you want to say anything else?

02:09:51

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

Yeah, I just wanted to say I think it's an awesome idea, and I would love to be able to help develop and implement that. And then it just reminded me of a couple of things. One is that the former EAC member who had asked for this to move forward actually

lives in the neighborhood where this occurred, and reached out as well. So they are hosting--and Lori will--we can share the flyer. They're hosting something--is it in--in the month of July in that community. They're having a group from Oakland come and do a workshop around racial profiling. The HRC is actually going to provide the food for that event. I'll be out of town, but it will be on the Embarcadero. It's being--the 23<sup>rd</sup>, thank you, July 23<sup>rd</sup>.

02:10:41

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

The 23<sup>rd</sup>.

02:10:41

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

And so that's the beginning of what they hope to have happen. And then just so--in terms of for future items we can share an update on that. And then second is we were--I was looped in to an email to the Giants, asking the Giants to potentially host a youth entrepreneurial workshop, or series of things for young people that kind of builds off of a way for this young lady to be engaged, but to also engage other young people that are trying to develop their skills, and what equity looks like around that. So we'll keep you posted on that as well.

02:11:19

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

The program on the 23<sup>rd</sup>, who's the target audience?

02:11:24

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

You know, I think it's meant for some of the people in that neighborhood. It's open to the public. They have a flyer. I know that--I believe Julie Tran just shared--she actually shared the flyer as well from the Bar Association. So they're trying to get people in the room. They want to have this discussion. The other hope which they are having some difficulties doing right now is to bring the two parties together, which hasn't happened. So both the young lady and her mom, as well as the woman who made the call. So there's--we've been asked to help with that, but they are still not ready to be in space together, so.

02:12:09

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

That's great news. Thank you. So any other thoughts or comments right now? Any public comment on this item? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you read the next item on the Agenda?

02:12:23

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Adjournment.

02:12:24

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

It is 7:47 p.m., and this meeting is adjourned.