

# HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

City and County of San Francisco

*Edwin M. Lee, Mayor*

Thursday, June 14, 2018  
Regular Meeting Minutes

5:30 pm

City Hall #416

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place

## ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Susan Belinda Christian, Chair

Melanie Ampon, Commissioner

Eva Chan, Commissioner

Theodore Ellington, Commissioner

Hala Hijazi, Commissioner

Mark Kelleher, Commissioner

Maya Karwande, Commissioner

Jason Pellegrini, Commissioner

Abigail Porth, Commissioner

Michael Sweet, Commissioner

Joseph Sweiss, Commissioner

Sheryl Evans Davis, Executive Director

**SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION**  
**REGULAR MEETING MINUTES**  
**JUNE 14, 2018**

Susan Belinda Christian  
Michael Sweet  
Melanie Ampon  
Eva Chan  
Maya Karwande  
Jason Pellegrini  
Theodore Ellington  
Hala Hijazi  
Joseph Sweiss

Absent:  
Mark Kelleher  
Abigail Porth

00:00:03

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Good evening. It is 5:41 p.m. on Thursday, June 14<sup>th</sup>. And this is the regular meeting of San Francisco Human Rights Commission. Madam Secretary, would you please call the roll?

00:00:14

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Chair Christian.

00:00:15

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Present.

00:00:16

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Chair--Vice Chair Sweet.

00:00:18

MICHAEL SWEET

Aye.

00:00:19

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Ampon.

00:00:20

MELANIE AMPON

Present.

00:00:20

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Chan.

00:00:22

EVA CHAN

Present.

00:00:23

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Ellington

00:00:24

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Here.

00:00:25 COMMISSION SECRETARY  
Commissioner Hijazi.

00:00:26 HALA HIJAZI  
Here.

00:00:27 COMMISSION SECRETARY  
Commissioner Karwande.

00:00:28 MAYA KARWANDE  
Present.

00:00:29 COMMISSION SECRETARY  
Commissioner Kelleher. Commissioner Pellegrini.

00:00:33 JASON PELLEGRINI  
Present.

00:00:34 COMMISSION SECRETARY  
Commissioner Porth. Commissioner Sweiss.

00:00:38 JOSEPH SWEISS  
Here.

00:00:39 COMMISSION SECRETARY  
We have quorum.

00:00:40 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN  
Thank you. Would you please read the first item on the Agenda? Public comment on items not on the Agenda. I'll just go ahead. This is the chance for members of the public to address the Commission on matters that are within our subject matter jurisdiction, but not on tonight's Agenda. Are there any requests for comment during this time? Zack, Zack K., please approach. Welcome back.

00:01:15 ZACK KARNAZES  
Thank you. Dear Human Rights Commission, I thank you for the wonderful work you do, and I'm very privileged to have the ability to speak here before you today. I have prepared the following statement which I will leave a copy of with your staff.

As a severely disabled San Francisco resident, I face discrimination on a daily basis. There are not enough bathrooms for me to access in the city. My landlord is unwilling to install wheelchair access in my home, so I had to crawl along the floor to be here today. I cannot access many restaurants or public places. The city is littered with inaccessible sidewalks and missing curb cuts, and I often times am turned away by muni bus drivers who do not want to board me in my wheelchair. SFMTA's ADA hearings are extremely biased and I had trouble simply using the bathroom before my last hearing because it

isn't up to code. The status of people of color in San Francisco is likewise in dire need of improvement. According to San Francisco Gate, San Francisco's population of African-Americans has decreased faster than that of any U.S. city. Community organizer Rheema Calloway said it best when she said, "San Francisco has the highest displacement rates of blacks outside of Hurricane Katrina." That is a natural disaster.

Homeless shelters are running at maximum capacity, with long lines and prison-like conditions. Domestic violence groups are underfunded and understaffed with little if any funding from city government. And currently there is not one domestic violence support group for male survivors in the entire city of San Francisco. Rape counselors and trauma support services are at an all-time low. I bring these issues to your attention knowing that many of them are outside of your jurisdiction. Your wonderful staff does all that they can and I truly applaud them for it. The Human Rights Commission, however, has its hands tied. There is not enough staff to handle all the issues of discrimination we face, and there is hardly any enforcement power given to HRC. For example, HRC cannot levy fines against landlords for legal discrimination or process a formal complaint against SFMTA because it is outside of its jurisdiction. I'm here today with the hope that these things can change.

I think it is imperative for the Human Rights Commission to be given increased funding, increase staffing, more jurisdiction over public entities such as SFMTA and Home Support Services Public Authority and the ability to levy fines and have more enforcing power. Thank you for your time, and I apologize for not being able to stay for the full length of this meeting since it is outside the scope of my health currently.

00:03:37

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you very much for coming out and making public comment tonight. We will take your request under consideration definitely. And once again, thank you for bringing your concerns to our attention. And I have a card from someone whose name I believe is Monica Chinelle.

00:03:59

MONICA CHINCHILLA

Chinchilla.

00:04:00

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Chinchilla. Would you like to make comment now? Welcome.

00:04:06

MONICA CHINCHILLA

Good evening, Commissioners. My name is Monica Chinchilla. I'm a parent, a community advocate and an activist here in San Francisco. I am speaking to you today on behalf of the San Francisco Women's March, the NAACP and the Interfaith Community requesting your support for a rally that will be coming up in two weeks to fight--in support of our families to fight the unjust policies of separating children and families at the border. There are so many parents, families, communities who is on fire

and livid of regarding this unjust issue. And we're excited to have a broad coalition of support for this event. Because it is not just an immigrant. It's not an issue that affects only immigrants, it is a human rights issue. And that is why I'm here today requesting you guys' support for this event, and would like you to be a co-host if you guys agree upon it. It's not on your Agenda tonight to vote, but if it's something that you guys consider that would be fantastic. We've been coordinating right now with Senator Kamala Harris's office, as well as Dolores Huerta and other elected officials statewide in the city to really show our support as a community for our immigrant families. And so Commissioner Ellington, he has all of my information but would love you guys' support and to be a sponsor for this event.

00:05:22

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Did you--I'm sorry if I missed it. Did you say when the event is and what time?

00:05:25

MONICA CHINCHILLA

We're looking to--we're going to be finalizing the date tonight, but looking at the week of June 25<sup>th</sup> to the 29<sup>th</sup>. And so I can give you those details, or I can give Commissioner Ellington those details later today.

00:05:38

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

That would be helpful. Thank you for coming out tonight.

00:05:39

MONICA CHINCHILLA

Okay, thank you.

00:05:43

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Is there any further public comment on items not on the Agenda tonight? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you read the next item on the Agenda?

00:05:54

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Adoption of Minutes dated May 24, 2018.

00:05:58

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Colleagues, these minutes were circulated in draft form. I will entertain a motion. Commissioner Ellington.

00:06:11

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Yeah, just wanted to note for the record that I was present during this meeting. There are a couple of names on top that I believe mention all the commissioners names who were present. So I just want to make sure we can edit that page.

00:06:24

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Your name is missing?

00:06:25

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Correct.

00:06:26

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay.

00:06:28

COMMISSION SECRETARY

I will make sure it's added.

00:06:29

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Awesome. Thank you.

00:07:00

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Commissioner Sweet--Vice Chair Sweet.

00:07:02

MICHAEL SWEET

Motion to approve the minutes.

00:07:05

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Is there a second?

00:07:09

MELANIE AMPON

Second.

00:07:11

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you, Commissioner Ampon. Is there any public comment on this item? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you please read the roll?

00:07:20

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Chair Christian.

00:07:21

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yes.

00:07:23

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Vice Chair Sweet.

00:07:24

MICHAEL SWEET

Yes.

00:07:25

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Ampon.

00:07:26

MELANIE AMPON

Yes.

00:07:27

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Chan.

00:07:28

EVA CHAN

Aye.

00:07:30

Commissioner Ellington.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:07:31

Yes.

THEODORE ELLINGTON

00:07:32

Commissioner Hijazi.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:07:33

Yes.

HALA HIJAZI

00:07:34

Commissioner Karwande.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:07:36

Yes.

MAYA KARWANDE

00:07:37

Commissioner Pellegrini.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:07:39

Yes.

JASON PELLEGRINI

00:07:40

Commissioner Sweiss.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:07:41

Yes.

JOSEPH SWEISS

00:07:42

Motion passes.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:07:44

Thank you. And would you please read the next item on the Agenda.

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

00:07:51

Welcome new commissioner Joseph Sweiss.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:07:53

Colleagues, I have the extreme pleasure to welcome another commissioner to our table. And now we are 11 commissioners with the addition of Commissioner Joseph Sweiss. He is a very personable individual, so I will let him introduce himself.

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

00:08:11

JOSEPH SWEISS

Thank you so much. I'm excited to be here. My name is Joseph Sweiss. I'm looking forward to working with you all. I'm a Bay Area native. I've worked in the city almost my entire life. UC Berkley grad. Did my masters in Georgetown and worked with Congresswoman Maxine Waters for a bit on statewide human rights and conflict resolution issues, which is what helped get me here today in my current capacity. I'm the depute press secretary for the Public Utilities Commission. And I look forward to working with you all. Thank you so much.

00:08:45

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

It's a pleasure to have you and just a few of the things that you mentioned, you will add a lot of talent to the table. So really glad that you're here. Welcome.

00:08:52

JOSEPH SWEISS

Thank you.

00:08:54

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Are there any other comments right now? We'll have a lot of time, I think, to get to know Commissioner Sweiss. But does anybody else want to say anything right now? If not, I will move along. Is there any public comment on this item? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, please read the next item on the Agenda.

00:09:12

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Update on projects and staff, upcoming events, policy and legislation.

00:09:18

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And I'm going to take the Chair's prerogative and move number--letter B up before letter A, so that we can welcome Ms. Ahern to the podium along with a guest.

00:09:40

MULLANE AHERN

Good evening, Commissioners. We're going to discuss the SHARP Ordinance--I'm sorry, the SHARP Office which we mentioned last time, for the office of Sexual Harassment and Assault Response and Prevention. I'd like to introduce Carolina Morales. She is a legislative aide to Hillary Ronen and has been working diligently on preparing, you know, this office which I think will be really effective for the city and county of San Francisco.

00:10:11

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Welcome, Ms. Morales.

00:10:12

CAROLINA MORALES

Thank you. Good evening, Commissioners. Hi, Director Sheryl. So I'm here representing Supervisor Hillary Ronen and to share some words and some context on the work that we've been doing and give you and update on the sexual assault office. Sexual violence is a national epidemic. One in two women and one in six men report experiencing sexual violence. With the powerful Me Too movement, thousands of

survivors have been inspired to break the silence around abuse. The supervisor held then a hearing a couple of months ago after hearing from many survivors about different challenges and complaints they've had with city departments here in San Francisco to be able to understand what's going on in San Francisco and what was the status of how we were responding as a city on this matter.

So once we started hearing more and more stories, given the national statistics, we were not surprised, unfortunately, to hear that so many women go through these horrific experiences. What did shock the supervisor and her office was to hear about the appalling failures on the part of city systems in responding to these victims. Our office has heard enough stories that it's clear that these are not just a few isolated incidents. There is a pattern of negligence and mistreatment that we consider abusive towards rape victims. From hospital workers sending a pregnant woman home to "heal" after disclosing rape during a checkup and not offering her any services to a police officer saying that both parties involved needed to "take responsibility" as if there is no difference between victims and assailants. We see departments unable to keep San Franciscans safe from sexual violence. These are city employees who are blaming victims for their own assaults, disregarding the severity of these rapes, denying survivors their rights to an effective investigation.

But to quote Oprah's inspiring words, "time is up." We have introduced legislation, that you've heard about, to ensure that there is a dedicated team to oversee departmental accountability when sexual harassment and sexual assault cases are disregarding by the city and to help survivors find solutions that restore their dignity and sense of safety. We are creating SHARP, the Office of Sexual Harassment and Sexual Assault Response and Prevention with the goal of remedying complaints about city department failures, promoting transparency with information sharing and developing policies to improve systemic responses to sexual assault and sexual harassment in San Francisco.

We are establishing a team of three (unintelligible) for the SHARP office. One staff member will be tasked with interacting with sexual assault and sexual harassment survivors and their advocates to receive complaints and navigate survivors through their options for remedy. One staff will collaborate with city departments and community agencies to gather data, understand current patterns of violence on the ground and produce yearly reports with policy recommendations. And the SHARP director will provide mediation between survivors and city department staff and written guidance to remedy mistreatment and objectively proceed with cases. The director will also serve as the public spokesperson and liaison with the board of supervisors and the mayor's office and, of course, all of our departments.

So--and on all of this work, we want to make sure that we always acknowledge and thank survivors that have come forward to bravely share their stories and partner with our office to prevent more survivors from going through this nightmare. We also want to thank the

community-based agencies and advocates that are collaborating with us on this legislation, making sure that we are really looking at the entire system and doing work-- because they are the ones doing work on the frontlines every single day. And, of course, we want to thank every single one of the supervisors who co-sponsor this legislation. It's very historic that at the time of introduction we had already unanimous support, because clearly we all really, really care about this issue and want to make sure that we have accountability in our city family.

So right now and the legislation determines the office to be under the Human Rights Commission. We thought that it'd be important to have the expertise of the Commission, the work that you've been doing around investigating discrimination and investigating wrongdoing from city departments and from other entities. And one of the updates that I think was already shared perhaps my Mullane or by the director is that we're going to have to move the office to the Department of Public Health because current mayor Mark Farrell did not put any funding as we requested in the Human Rights Commission for this office. There was funding allocated in DPH for two of the three staff members in the department in that office. So we've been in conversation with Director Sheryl Davis and with Director Barbara Garcia from DPH around this issue and we all agree that what really is important here is to have the work occur and to make sure that it's happening effectively and that it's happening now and not, you know, waiting for a future time for whenever we, you know, might be fighting for where the funds should be at.

So we're really, really grateful for that and, you know, for the commitment that everybody is having and making sure that this is moving forward. And so we're working with the city attorney to make sure that that change, it's going to be reflected in the ordinance and we're also making a couple of other changes. One, we want to make sure that the SART team, which is the Sexual Assault Response Team that right now meets every month to look at--to do some case conferencing and also look at what are some possible changes that sometimes need to happen to ensure that some cases move forward. We want to codify that team because what we've heard from some community-based organizations is that sometimes some members of the team don't show up to some meetings. So we want to make sure we have some minimum requirements, basically that everybody--that there has to be a representative from the police department, from the DA's office, from SF General and from a community-based organization. Those are currently the members of that team. And that we always have these folks showing up every month to the meeting, and we want to add that both DSW, the Department on the Status of Women, and somebody from the SHARP Office is always there, as well, just to make sure that we are all kind of bringing our diverse perspectives and the different angles that we have to look into the work to this meeting. So we're going to be doing that.

And doing some additions to the findings to make sure that we are building on the work that has been done in the past in the city with different policy recommendations that have

come out in different reports from different departments, that this office is looking at what have been those policy recommendations that have already come forward in the past so that we can build from the work that has already been done, right, and as we move forward with the office. And with that, I am here for any questions that you may have. Thank you.

00:18:53

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you so much for coming tonight. Just a quick question. So at this moment then there is no role for the HRC in this new body?

00:19:04

CAROLINA MORALES

Correct.

00:19:05

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay, thank you. And I'm sure the Director has already voiced this to you, but certainly we completely support the immediate movement of and creation of this office. And whatever the HRC can do to assist in whatever capacity, we are certainly here and available.

00:19:21

CAROLINA MORALES

Thank you. Thank you. we definitely want to leverage key commissions when necessary to call for different hearings depending on what the issues might be at the time. So we'd love to partner in the future--well, the office. I'm not the office, but we would love for this office to partner with your commission, with the Commission on the Status of Women, with the Commission on Family--the Family Violence Counsel, right, when necessary, right, to be strategic on different pieces of whatever they may be working on. So thank you.

00:19:53

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. And please do give Supervisor Ronen our thanks for moving this forward and being a champion of this. Colleagues, are there any other questions or comments for Ms. Morales? Director Davis.

00:20:11

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

No, I was just going to agree and say thank you so much. And to also say, in the conversation with Barbara Garcia as well as with Dr. Emily Murase. There is--as this builds out to really think about the training and the workshops and the prevention piece that HRC will still be involved. And one of the things that I shared with Supervisor Ronen, which are public comment referenced earlier, is that we really have to stop thinking of rape as just a female issue, and that there are a lot of folks that when this was first starting, when word got out that this office was happening, that they really wanted to make sure that people understood that all genders are feeling that they don't have a place and space to report it and that women have more access and that it's more acceptable for them to talk about it.

And just yesterday, I was having a conversation with one of our investigators because there is man who has been harassed in his dwelling and nobody takes it serious, and they keep telling him to man up. So just for us to not forget about other victims.

00:21:27

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Any other questions or comments? Sure.

00:21:33

MULLANE AHERN

Thank you so much, Carolina. I just wanted to add, as I shared at the last Commission meeting, I was drugged and raped two-and-a-half years ago and faced failure after failure systemically with all of the departments that are charged with serving rape victims. And it's an appalling disgrace. And so to the extent that each of you can, you know, support this office in some way and just, you know, really--I think it's essential that we do better as a city. And, you know, as the Director said this is an all gender issue, but it's also something that, you know, there are so many women that come forward and then are just simply discarded. And violence against women cannot just be a punchline. So, you know, for our police department, our DA's office, our medical examiner, you know, every single component of our system needs to step up and recognize, as Carolina said, this is an epidemic. So I would urge you, again, to watch the hearing if you have not already. It was extremely compelling. Victim after victim came forward, myself included, to testify about our experiences. And I think that it really just shows a dire need for San Francisco. So, you know, thanks again Carolina and, you know, all of the supervisors that are working on this. I'm very grateful on a personal level. And, you know, just professionally looking at the policies and, you know, what's not happening for our city in terms of training and everything else, we need to change. So reform must be on the horizon. Thanks.

00:23:30

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you, Mullane. Ms. Morales, I have a quick question that you may or may not have the answer to. So this is now in the Department of Public Health. And I would imagine that one of the things that we need to do as a city as provide--is to provide more resources for treatment for people who do present at hospitals and say that they've been sexually assaulted. So has Mayor Farrell put any money into the Department's budget to address that?

00:23:57

CAROLINA MORALES

Thank you, good question. Yes. So we've been advocating for a few changes, actually, within SF General. We want to create a more specific unit where sexual assault and sexual harassment survivors, when they need treatment they can go there and have a place where they can feel safe, they can speak freely with an advocate or with a counselor, and also receive attention more efficiently, like faster because many times they have to wait like six hours. So for that, we also had been requesting some funds for more staffing for the forensic team. And they have. They're going to be increasing them by, I think, 2.5 FTE in their forensic team at SF General. So thank you for asking.

00:24:48

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. And, again, you mentioned a few ways that you already believe that the HRC and other commissions can come together and support this progress. And please, if there are any other ways or any thoughts that you have please don't hesitate to, you know, let us know through the Director or, you know, directly.

00:25:09

CAROLINA MORALES

Sounds great, thank you. And it's coming to committee at some--I'm not sure if actually if it's coming to committee next Wednesday. We've been requesting a date, but because during the budget process every committee is--basically we don't have a date yet, but we would love to share that date with you through Director Davis. If any of you are available to come and testify on how you think this office is important for the city of San Francisco, we would welcome and be very grateful for that.

00:25:42

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Please do provide that information. Commissioner Hijazi.

00:25:46

HALA HIJAZI

Yes, I see in our packet this was dated May 18<sup>th</sup>. Is there an updated version of this legislation that we can also receive that can be e-mailed to us?

00:25:56

CAROLINA MORALES

Not yet, but we will--

00:25:57

HALA HIJAZI

Okay, perfect.

00:25:58

CAROLINA MORALES

--as soon as that becomes available, we will.

00:26:00

HALA HIJAZI

Thank you very much.

00:26:00

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Yes, thank you.

00:26:03

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Commissioners, any other questions or comments at this time? Any public comment on this item? Seeing none, thank you so much and looking forward to working with you.

00:26:13

CAROLINA MORALES

Thank you, Commissioners. Thank you, Director.

00:26:18

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Madam Secretary, would you please read the next item under No. 4?

00:26:24

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Upcoming Events.

00:26:29

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

I just wanted to make note of one change. So the twelve o'clock event on June 28<sup>th</sup> is actually going to be at St. Ignatius College Prep High School and not at USF. And then the other event, twelve o'clock at LinkedIn is still happening, and then the other event six o'clock at MOAD is also happening. And I don't know, I think the last time we talked about this we hadn't confirmed, but John Burress is also going to be a part of that panel on the 6:00 p.m., the evening at MOAD.

00:27:09

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Any questions, Commissioners, about the upcoming events? Any public comment on this item? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you read the next item, please?

00:27:23

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Director and Chair's Reports.

00:27:26

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So we'll begin with the Director's Report. And these are discussion items.

00:27:35

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

So in your packets--sorry, there's so much in here. In your packets, I just wanted to make sure to share with you the presentation that Theo Miller and I presented to the school district this past Tuesday, as part of the My Brother and Sisters Keeper Initiative. I don't know if there are questions or comments. I can just quickly go through the first couple of slides were kind of historic. They were Mr. Miller's slides. As some of you know, the MBSK initially started while Mr. Miller was still with the PUC and was doing double duty. And so that was one of--that was created initially with Theo Miller, Landen Dickey from the school district and Zack McCray from the San Francisco Foundation. So the timeline and the framework and those buckets were established before it was moved to the HRC.

As we go to the next pages, those are the three larger kind of frameworks. Basically, the Youth Council which was launched this year is now going to be part of the Opportunity Youth United national action teams, community action teams. A group in The Mission has received funding to support that effort. The Community Collaboratives which are a group of folks representing Pacific Islander, Latin X and African-Americans. The Community Collaboratives, that was established again at the beginning. Those three buckets were--those three populations or demographics were identified as--because of the school district and because those are the groups with the largest disparities and were identified. And that is something that we inherited. And just the champions. The Life Course framework is basically how all the work is moved and it's just highlighting some of those buckets. And then the rest of it is things that you've seen, presentations you've

already hears. And then I'll just say at the end are the asks that were presented to the Board of Education, which it sounds like we'll move forward. The professional development that the HRC will do in partnership with the school district at their August institute to both share with administration, how they can partner with the HRC as well as do trainings to do some work at schools and to do more partnership with the schools as we've already done. And then lastly, the district--Commissioner Haney and Commissioner Cook wanted to follow up. They are trying to identify funds to have a liaison at the district who is assigned to support the work of the MBSK and to help with the data collection work.

So if there are questions, please feel free, let me know. But that is just--wanted to make sure that you all saw that we presented at the Board of Ed meeting on Tuesday. Also wanted to share with you the continuity of work plans. So this is the third time. The template is given to us from the Mayor's office. We are instructed to fill it out and return it. And so just wanted to make sure as we do these different transitions and things that we had at least shared this with the Commission. So this is just a snapshot of what we were asked to share with the Mayor's office as they prepared for the incoming mayor, and that's what we shared. And then as a part of that, is the budget presentation. So this document is the budget presentation that we did--that I did yesterday before Budget and Finance Committee. And, again, they gave us the language. They told us what they wanted to see highlighted. And so this is based on the format that was given. They asked for you to really focus on high-level programming and projects and initiatives and to just have two--just to have two charts that shared your expenditures and your FTEs. And so that is what this is. And so, again, if there are questions or--I will say, as I did the presentation for that and talked yesterday about the desire to have funding to do more systems evaluation and that we wanted to do more with Stanford, the supervisors that were on the Budget and Finance Committee said that they--I said that we had secured some funding, outside funding and they asked that the city actually secure funding. They would prefer that the city pay for that. So they are looking to add \$100,000 so that we can do some data evaluation work in partnership. So that is that piece.

Just update on CAHRO. They are planning--the California Association of Human Relations Organizations. I recently joined that board. They are trying to plan an event for the end of the year in Los Angeles. As they begin planning and get more details, I will share that information. They also want San Francisco to consider hosting or doing something, so we're kind of going back and forth. What makes sense right now, and I'm not--I don't think I've shared this. We received money from the San Francisco Foundation to expand the work that we've been doing with the police to pilot that in Oakland, and then have just now received--the Silicon Valley Foundation, when I reached out to them to see if they wanted to support some of the speakers' series and the work that we're doing, Oakland said that they would rather we pilot it in San Jose. So they're going to give money. So we will work with San Jose Police Department this summer and also Oakland and Urban Strategies, which has been funded to do violence

prevention, to do a regional strategy. And so hopefully that'll inform some of the work that we'll do with CAHRO. So this summer we'll do some community police relations work regionally and that will be funded by San Francisco Foundation and the Silicon Valley Foundation.

And the--what was that, Lori, two weeks ago we had the delegation from South Korea. They came. We shared with them. They were really grateful for the collateral and the material that we had. They had questions about how do we deal with discrimination and investigations. They talked a little bit about trying to prepare for the unification and what that looks like and how it's just interesting as we hear about some of the conversations that how the president has talked about like, yes, they've done bad things but other people have done other really bad things. And the South Koreans really felt strongly that there hasn't been enough to really address the violations of human rights. And they just had some concerns about how they would deal with that, because they've already had people coming as they come in and kind of basically defect to South Korea that they had struggles with how to deal with that and how to actually support them, and then how do they actually--to the point that our, again, public comment made like for us some of those struggles have been around enforcement of what are the things that we can do. And so we had some conversations like that. And I'm looking at Mullane, because we had a conversation today about what we can do within our ability and maybe we should be doing things like saying to people we're going to post or we're going to send letters that say who's been nonresponsive to action if we can't levy fines and fees, or if we don't actually have power to sue, but that we need to do something so that people really take seriously when there's a violation found. And so that was some of what we talked about with the delegation from North Korea. So I think that is it for me.

00:36:10

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay, thank you. I have a couple of questions with respect to what you were just saying about the staff thinking about ways the agency could highlight a lack of response to enforcement decisions or admonishments or whatever. So is that a conversation that will be had--I mean is that going forward? I think that's a very good idea to have that conversation with the city attorney to figure out exactly what we can lawfully say and post and how we might do that.

00:36:43

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

Well, I mean yes. And so we can definitely visit with the city attorney, but it is a matter of public record when we send letters to people or to organizations and to entities. And it was--it's within our right to say if somebody said did they respond or what was the response, I think it's really important for the staff to be able to say that they've done what they are supposed to do, and that in some point in time that the responsibility is no longer ours. And I feel like there are a couple of things that have come up recently, is that we are hearing from people then what's the point of me coming here. If I come here, I file a complaint, you have a finding, I get a letter and I give the letter to the landlord or to the

business or to whomever and they don't have to do anything then what's the point. And so we're trying to really be intentional about like how do we first and foremost say--even if it's outside of our jurisdiction, even if it's not something that's a protected class if someone comes in and they are feeling like somebody didn't treat them like a person and didn't value them, how do we actually make sure that people leave the HRC, leave the office feeling like we saw them and that we heard them and that we value them. And so that is something that we're really drilling down on right now, because some of the regulars, Lori and I were talking about, sometimes they just come in because they just want someone to listen to them. And to that, and I've had some conversations with Barbara Garcia. This is something we actually put--I put in the budget presentation. We really need to think about how do we have onsite mental health support, because people do get traumatized by things that happen to them, and how do we support people that when they come in and they say this happened to me because I'm in a wheelchair or this happened to me because I'm a person of color. And sometimes they are a person of color and something happened to them but it didn't happen to them because they were a person of color. And so we still need to support them in unpacking that.

And so that is one of the things we're trying to figure out, like how do we balance when there's actually a finding. That's one thing. And we have a finding and the--there's no response to the finding. And then how do we handle something when there's absolutely really--it's not within our jurisdiction. There's no violation, but people still feel bad. And so I just--we don't want to keep saying to people sorry, that's not--go across the street. That's not our issue. So really trying to be more intentional about--the Human Rights Commission shouldn't just be about what's on a piece of paper, it should be about how do we actually make people feel like we see them as human and that we value them.

00:39:35

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Well, I definitely support you in that, and I'm sure I'm not the only Commissioner who does. And to the extent that Commissioners can support the staff and the agency in working out ways to do that or, you know, being part of that, please do pull us in. Commissioner Chan, are you trying to--Commissioner Chan.

00:39:57

EVA CHAN

Oh. I don't know if this is the right time to bring this into the discussion, but just to follow up on what you presented about having onsite mental health support. Would it be possible to maybe suggest to borrow something from the public health context of a care navigator to kind of direct some of the very vulnerable people who come into the office to the proper place where--or the proper office that does have jurisdiction? Because I think people get lost in between coming to places where they feel comfortable such as our office. And when you direct them to another part of the bureaucracy, they get intimidated. And so maybe that on top of the mental health support as well is that additional navigation.

00:40:45

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

Right. And so one of the things that we're working on with DPH is that they--everyone I assume is familiar with the HOT Team. And so for lack--so the way that Director Garcia explained it is that we can work with them to develop a HOT Team for--

00:41:03

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Home Outreach Team.

00:41:04

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

Yes. But an outreach team that would--if they're not stationed in HRC that they're stationed within close proximity that when things happen that they would be able to come over and support. They have been really great. There have been times when we leave at seven o'clock at night and people come in and it's not that they're necessarily homeless but they're really frustrated about something, and we've been able to call them and they've sent the HOT Team. So we're just trying to work now to be more specific about like how do we support someone that's in crisis mode and need support and needs somebody to just take them to the next location, right. That's the other piece we're really trying to be mindful of; that we're not just like call this number, but how do we actually make, as they call it in the nonprofit world, like a warm handoff, like that we actually take them. So...

00:41:58

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And in Van Ness, that building, there are several--there's another commission, there are agencies who have people who would have the same need. And so maybe, you know, for the building there could be--and the residents, city residents there, there could be this person shared.

00:42:13

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

Yeah, we met with the Mayor's Office of Disability yesterday and they were excited that we had been negotiating that deal and wanted to--we have the--I have the outreach team coming to the office next week, maybe, to do an assessment to see where they could be and how they could support. And Mayor's Office of Disability said please let us know, we want to be a part of that. And so I would imagine the Rent Board and other places have very similar needs.

00:42:44

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yeah, the new police accountability office, as well. I also--did you want to--Mullane.

00:42:57

MULLANE AHERN

Chime in. I just wanted to add to the Director's point. Some of these respondents who are neglecting their responses and, you know, are discriminating against people are city contractors getting a lot of money from the city. And, you know, that's unacceptable for the HRC to be blown off by city contractors. So, you know, that's one aspect of the public finding that, you know, we want to focus on so that we can bring people into compliance. And...

00:43:31

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

Yeah. Because I would say the one thing that really elevated this for us is there's an 88-year-old--I would say monolingual, but really she's bilingual but limited English. 88-years old. Hard of hearing. Second language. And she worked on her case by herself for a year. Came to the office for a year. And the company had been non-respondent for the last seven months. And I literally had to make three calls to heads of departments and say this is unacceptable. This agency is getting way too much money and they're non--this is not about the individual, like they're also disrespecting the office of the HRC because the staff sent a letter and they did not respond. And so within a couple days, the attorney responded but it's like this is not how it should work. We should not have to call department heads to get a response from someone who's getting that much money from the city to do work. And to have this 88-year-old woman be two years to try and get her door fixes. It just doesn't make sense.

00:44:47

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Do you think it makes any sense or whether it's an idea that could be pursued to report these kinds of these lack of responses to the Board of Supervisors on a regular basis at a public meeting?

00:45:00

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

So that is the--so that's what we talked about today, like what's the process so that we could actually say, you know, this is the second letter we've sent to you. We're giving you notification. If you do not respond, you will be in our quarterly, monthly report to the Board of Supervisors and this report will live on our website. So we're just trying to--so that's the stuff that we definitely can take to the city attorney, but at this point maybe the threat of it getting to another body will make people be more responsive. But...

00:45:35

MULLANE AHERN

And my final point is just that the vast majority of our cases in discrimination are based on disability, in housing. And most of these are nonprofit housing providers that work with the city. So just, you know, putting it in context. It's people with disabilities and a lot of intersectional issues and, you know, we again just kind of need to do better. And so we're strategizing on that.

00:46:03

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

I think it might be time, since we have new commissioners, for another report from the staff about the discrimination division since it's such a core aspect of what the agency does, so we know the work that the agency is doing and understand all of these issues. Commissioner Karwande.

00:46:22

MAYA KARWANDE

Apologies if this is just a question out of ignorance. But Director Davis, you mentioned that the letters that are sent are public records. Is there a list, is there like any sort of repository of like, you know, these are the letters that the Human Rights Commission sent this year?

00:46:42

MULLANE AHERN

You know, we keep statistics on how many cases we have and what the outcomes are, you know, whether they're settled in mediation or, you know, if there's no finding of discrimination sometimes we still make recommendations even if it's not a violation of laws. You know, sometimes you can see that there was discrimination that may not be unlawful. So we make recommendations on those and we certainly have all those--

00:47:06

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

So it's all in house but there's nothing--there's no public--like these are the--

00:47:09

MAYA KARWANDE

That was my question, yes.

00:47:10

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

So there's no public listing that says these are the 50 organizations we received complaints against. This is, you know, finding-no finding or--so that's another thing that we talked about, is the bigger piece is to look at what's trending because in the last couple of weeks there's one--well, there's two organizations that have come up repeatedly that there's an issue in terms of not just necessarily what's happening at their sites, but the way that they respond to concerns. And there's a trend with one of them in terms of the individuals that are complaining, what they look like and their mental health status. So there's another piece that I'm like that's the stuff that I want us to start to be looking at. Like if there's a trend where certain people with these characteristics keep coming up with the same or similar complaints, then you know--so right now we're working on what that looks like to say, well, we want to come and do training with your frontline staff, right, the folks who are engaging with this population. So we're working that out, but there is no public space right now that says these are all the places where we receive complaints and this is what happened with them. And so, again, that's maybe a good thing to think about.

00:48:27

MULLANE AHERN

And we do have that information internally. Each week the discrimination team meets and we talk, you know, troubleshoot on cases and identify anything that might look like systemic discrimination and, you know, identify those patterns and trends.

00:48:43

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Commissioner Ellington.

00:48:45

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Do we have any inroads with city attorney's office or Mayor's Office of Housing? It seems to your earlier point around access and nonprofit providers, et cetera, it would seem that if there's a connection to any sort of city department then we should be able to use some sort of leverage to either deny funding or tap into the city attorney's code enforcement team or--just thinking out loud here.

00:49:12

SHERYL EVANS DAVIS

So it's a--again, this is the larger problem. And so as we build some of this out, like this--when I called some of the departments, and so I don't want to put people on blast necessarily right now, but when I called some of the departments, because they have strong personal relationships with somebody in that organization, they didn't think that there could be a problem. Like they couldn't imagine that it could be a problem. And so they made it about the individual that was complaining. And so I had to go back to, well, let's talk about this process. Like this letter was sent to you--was sent to your agency that you fund this many times. And so, yes, ultimately they were able to support and make something happen, but it's like that shouldn't have to be the trigger every time. And so that's the question about like what is the bigger picture, are we reporting to the Board of Supervisors and the folks who hold the purse strings are now going to be more accountable.

But to Mullane's point, a lot of the complaints that we get are people that are low income, that have disabilities and are struggling to kind of make it. And they typically just kind of take what they get. And so when you get the people that come in to HRC, typically those are the folks that fight, right, and that they have the energy and the time and the bandwidth. And so they're waiting to wait it out. And what we found is that by the time they finally push through something, they're so frustrated, they're so hurt that they're just like fine, I'll just take whatever. And ultimately the companies win and they've played this game where they're like, no, we gave them--we told them verbally that we would do this. And they're like, no, they didn't. And then it took us two months to get like the written letter and by then the people have either moved out of where they were or have just--they've been harassed on site by--because sometimes these are issues between residents. So it's just--we do have to figure out a more systemic kind of way where that there's a trigger where something happens and where people feel accountable. But a lot of these agencies have the capacity to do it because they've been doing it for so long and so they are the go-to. And what happens a lot is new--it's harder for new agencies to get in. And so the same agencies keep getting it and it doesn't really matter. And because of who they're serving, sometimes it really doesn't matter.

00:51:36

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Commissioners, any other questions or comments at this time?  
Commissioner Karwande.

00:51:44

MAYA KARWANDE

Well, I would just echo what you mentioned earlier in that I think it would be helpful for the Commission to have, and especially myself as a new commissioner, to have an update on the discrimination unit and just sort of the different processes that work. Because just talking through it right now, I guess some questions that come to my mind is is a letter sent to an agency upon initiation of a complaint or upon a finding of discrimination. And that might change the extent or how such letters or records could be made public on a

website or tracked in some way that people could understand what HRC is doing and also some aspect of public shaming, which can be effective.

00:52:34

MULLANE AHERN

I'd be happy to present to the Commission on, you know, our workflow, the process and I also would invite you to come by any time and, you know, you could sit in our meetings, our case round meetings and really get a sense of the work that we're doing. And so yeah, I'd be happy to troubleshoot ideas and strategize, especially as the housing market is, you know, extremely difficult to navigate for people. The way that housing is advertised is changing with technology. And so, you know, we're trying to look at the bigger picture and really figure out how to be most effective about preventing and addressing discrimination.

00:53:12

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And so maybe it can be a combination of orientation for new commissioners and then a presentation to the Commission, because I know it's, you know, it's not necessarily in and of itself confusing work but it's not work that we do every day.

00:53:23

MULLANE AHERN

Right.

00:53:23

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And, you know, you've told us, you know, a hundred times what you do and sometimes it's difficult for some of us, and I'll just speak for myself, to retain, you know, I find myself asking. And so how do we do that? And so it will be--I think it could be helpful for the newer commissioners, especially, to do an orientation and then for us to, you know, maybe dedicate most of a meeting to just understanding what it is the discrimination division does.

00:53:44

MULLANE AHERN

I'd be happy to present.

00:53:46

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Any other Commissioner questions or comment? I would just also, just want to highlight that Sheryl did say that she now is--you're a board member now of CAHRO. Great. So HRC is once again represented on this regional body, which I think is very important. And, you know, I'm hoping that some of the work that we as commissioners want to see done can be done regionally because I think that's really the only way that any of the problems that we consider really get solved. And I'll just segue from there into the Chair's Report, at letter B.

And so, Commissioners, I just wanted to, you know, basically issue spot on a couple of things that have come up recently that I believe we should be thinking about and, you know, this is not going to be any kind of in-depth presentation tonight. Certainly, the discussion can go wherever people want to take it right now. But the first bullet under

the report, the Supreme Court decision masterpiece, *Cake Shop vs. Colorado Civil Rights Commission*. I'm sure people are aware of this decision and it does--it's one of the few things that does happen--come out of the Supreme Court that has direct bearing on the work that we do in the agency also as a commission that we are called upon to do under our charter and our bylaws. And so Sneh was good enough to send around a summary to the Commission. And I know that Lori sent it out by e-mail, and it is existing under Item No. 5 right now too. And just for purposes of the record, I'll just read some highlights.

And so on June 4<sup>th</sup>, the U.S. Supreme Court issues a 7 to 2 ruling in favor of a Colorado baker who refused to make a wedding cake for a gay couple because of his religious opposition to same-sex marriage. The 7-2 ruling was very narrow in scope. Although it was for the baker, it didn't focus on the larger question of LGBTQ rights or religious liberties. Instead, it called into question how the Colorado Civil Rights Commission officials treated Jack Phillips, the bakery owner. And I think the takeaway, unfortunately, the narrow takeaway from this ruling was that review has to be neutral. You know, here at the Human Rights Commission the agency does these discrimination complaints all the time. And what the court did find was that the way that the--that the Commission considered the complaint was not neutral, which is what the law requires. And from the perspective of the court, it was also not respectful or tolerant.

So it hasn't happened since I've been sitting as a commissioner, but one of the things that the Commission is called upon to do when necessary is to review decisions of the agency regarding discrimination. So someone can appeal to us and we would sit as an appellate body over whatever decision the agency made. And so this has direct bearing on how we should, you know, accord ourselves in a situation like that. And certainly how I'm sure the staff already does approach individuals who come forward with issues of discrimination and the parties who are involved. And so just, you know, it's a question of the law. And so I just thought it was really important for all of us to acknowledge that this has occurred and understand what it means, you know, literally for us in our positions as commissioners. I don't know if anybody has any other comments about this right now. Questions?

Moving on to California Assembly Bill 931. So on April 3<sup>rd</sup> of this year, California Assemblywoman Shirley Weber introduced a bill that would restrict the state standard for when police officers may use lethal force. The existing standard allows police officers to use lethal force when they deem it reasonable. I think it might be objectively reasonable by--under the current law, police can use deadly force whenever. An "objectively reasonable officer would have done so under the same circumstances regardless of whether there was an immediate threat to life or bodily security or whether there were available alternatives." And so the bill that has been proposed would authorize police officers to use deadly force only when it is necessary to prevent imminent and serious bodily injury or death. That is given the totality of the circumstances. There was no

reasonable alternative to using deadly force, including warnings, verbal persuasion or other non-lethal methods of resolution or de-escalation.

So this is obviously something that is being considered right now. And I know that some law enforcement agencies opposed the bill. I know that others do not oppose it. I know that the district attorney supports the bill and obviously a host of other individuals and organizations would support this bill. I think personally as a commissioner, and for the Human Rights Commission, I think it's something that we should look at and understand and take a stand on unless it--people feel that it would be improper in some way that becomes, you know, visible to us. But it's something that I think we should be thinking about and hopefully speaking on. Commissioner Ellington.

00:59:42

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Yeah, you--should I let you finish? You read my mind. Can we request maybe someone from the DA's office maybe to come and give a presentation of some sort or some more information, I think?

00:59:56

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

It would be my hope that we could have--I'm not, you know, someone from the assembly (unintelligible).

01:00:00

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Or--yeah.

01:00:

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yeah, or the ACLU in addition to other, you know, people like the district attorney who have, you know, certainly the district attorney's office has a stake in this because it is the standard--the legal standard that exists as the standard that the district attorney must apply. And so--and the district attorney has stated forcefully and publicly that he does favor a change in the law. So, yeah, this is something that I would like to agendize, and just wanted to raise that tonight and make certain that I'm not the only one who's interested in looking at it.

And then I'll just move along to what's being called the Zero Tolerance Immigration Policy and the separation of migrant families at the border. The separation from children from parents. I mean this is not obviously the only, you know, immigration issue that has come up since the administration changed. There are a host of things that are problematic and alarming that we might want to--we certainly do want to understand how it--how they affect the people who are within our jurisdiction. I think that is within our charge to understand these things. But certainly regionally because, you know, we are not--in the Bay Area we don't share a border with another country. Sometimes it feels like we do, but we don't. But certainly the state does. And I would--it's my hope that--especially now that we are, you know, having close contact with CAHRO, that we might be able to, as regional human relations organizations come out with a common stance, that we can in

solidarity with each other put forward throughout the state. So, I mean this horrific policy is in flux and, you know, grows every day. And I know that there are, you know, commissioners who probably spend a lot of time thinking about this and talking to people in the community. So whether tonight is the time to begin this discussion or later, this is something else that I feel strongly that we should have a presentation on. And I think that that might be it just on these things that I'm hoping that we can take a look at and look at the impact in San Francisco, but also in our region and the state as well. Any Commissioner comment or questions about those things? Any public comment? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you read the next item, please?

01:02:36

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioners' activities in the community.

01:02:39

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So this is an opportunity, as we always have at every meeting, for the Commissioners to report back to the Commission on work that we are doing within San Francisco's various communities. And this is a discussion item. Does anyone want to talk about anything? Commissioner Hijazi.

01:02:56

HALA HIJAZI

I had the honor to attend two Iftars sponsored by the American Jewish Community, hosted for the Muslim community and also part of their interfaith engagement dialogue. And also spoke today at the Interfaith Counsel to provide discussion points about Ramadan and the meaning of Ramadan and the context of the times that we're living in.

01:03:20

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you, Commissioner Hijazi. Any other Commissioner comments? Any public comment on this item? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, please read the next item.

01:03:33

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Matters of interest for possible inclusion on future Agendas.

01:03:37

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So, Colleagues, as always I'm happy and eager to hear things that you would like to see on future Agendas or work that you would like to see the Commission doing. You can always let me know. But this is also a time when these things can be discussed if anybody has anything on their mind right now. Any public comment on this item. Seeing none, Madam Secretary, please read the next item.

01:04:02

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Adjournment.

01:04:03

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay. It is 6:45 p.m. and we are adjourned. Thank you.