

Equal Pay Advisory Board Meeting Minutes

Date	October 27, 2015
Time	4:30pm
Location	San Francisco Human Rights Commission 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 800 San Francisco, CA 94102

Advisory Board Members in Attendance: Marisa Diaz, Dolores Blanding, Dilraj Kahai, Anu Menon, Utuma Belfry. Also in attendance Theresa Sparks, Mullane Ahern, Hillary Ronen

Agenda Item: Presentation by University of San Francisco MBA Team on Equal Pay Reporting Model

Herman Badenhorst and Chaoyu Lo Presented an excel model for data collection and Tableau dashboard for presentation and for delving into the findings quickly.

Dilraj Kahai disclosed that 21Tech is licensed Tableau supplier to San Francisco. 21Tech is his company. Anything he says about Tableau is based on what he thinks the EPAB needs, and no other interest. He has not recommended Tableau before today.

Discussion of inputting all individual employee data, privacy concerns, and identifying outliers. The statistical analysis will be much better if individualized data are available vs. aggregate.

Recommend best practices for enforcement aspect in order to address factors that may explain wage gap that are nondiscriminatory.

If we developed a model in Elations, we could run Tableau as a dashboard after extracting data from Elations – that is likely so. Tableau public would be usable, but all of that data would be public. Tableau also shows job segregation easily if there is only one employee of a gender or race in a company or job category.

This would address the data collection but does not assist in the analysis of the statistical significance of the wage gap. The data used in this model is test data that was made up, and not real data. Part of the benefit of the pilot program would be utilizing real data and reviewing different techniques to identify outliers and strategize on the best way to analyze.

Recent discussions with Controller's office yielded the recommendation of seeking \$100K in order to hire economic consultants for testing and analysis and develop software as needed. That will be discussed later in the meeting. EPAB thanked USF team for the hard work they've put into this project.

Agenda Item: Discussion on Draft Report, Timeline, and Recommendations for Board of Supervisors

Most recent discussions with CON have been very productive: requesting an analysis from the Contoller's office of all city contracting ordinances to determine what the best terms and standards are that should be included in amendments that EPAB is working on proposing. Identifying consistencies and differences, and identifying best practices known to be effective in gathering information from city contractors in the interest of minimizing the reporting of that data. We have been fortunate to work with Peg Stevenson and Inger Brinck in CON regarding the work and analysis needed. We've discussed working with a contractor, possibly from the Controller's pool of contracting experts in economics and labor after putting out an RFP.

Dilraj expressed support for the idea of testing the analysis on CCSF data before requiring it of contractors. Analyzing what the benchmark is for the city will allow for better targets and analysis for contractors. City's pay system is structured and governed in a way that no significant wage gap should occur in any given role. Discussion ensued of gender segregation in different roles, and the question of whether the City hires a larger population of women than other employment sectors.

November 17th was decided as next meeting date. Hillary Ronen from the Office of Supervisor David Campos explained that they'd love to recognize the work of the EPAB in front of the BOS. They are very grateful for the work the EPAB has accomplished and agree with the recommendations they've reached thus far. The Supervisor was always aware that the dates and timeline set forth in the ordinance might have to change based on the work needed to be done. Certificates of honor – Tuesday – introduce hearing request on November 17th.

Introduce propose amendments, introduce Hearing Request, Certificates of Honor: **December 1st**
And then hearing the legislation and hear report in committee the first week in January after the legislative break on **January 7th**.

Agenda Item: Matters for Future Inclusion

Covered through discussion

Adjournment