

HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

City and County of San Francisco

Edwin M. Lee, Mayor

Thursday, March 8, 2018
Regular Meeting Minutes

5:30 pm

City Hall #416

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place

ROSTER OF COMMISSIONERS

Susan Belinda Christian, Chair

Melanie Ampon, Commissioner

Eva Chan, Commissioner

Theodore Ellington, Commissioner

Hala Hijazi, Commissioner

Maya Karwande, Commissioner

Mark Kelleher, Commissioner

Jason Pellegrini, Commissioner

Abigail Porth, Commissioner

Michael Sweet, Commissioner

Sheryl Evans Davis, Executive Director

SAN FRANCISCO HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
MARCH 8, 2018

Susan Belinda Christian
Melanie Ampon
Hala Hijazi
Theodore Ellington
Maya Karwande
Michael Sweet
Jason Pellegrini

Absent:
Eva Chan
Mark Kelleher
Abigail Porth

00:00:30 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
It is 5:38 on Thursday, March 8th. Are we at March 8th?

00:00:40 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Mm-hmm.

00:00:41 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
And this is the regular meeting of the San Francisco Human Rights Commission. Madam Secretary, would you please read the roll?

00:00:49 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Chair Christian.

00:00:50 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
Present.

00:00:52 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Ampon.

00:00:53 MELANIE AMPON
Present.

00:00:55 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Chan. Commissioner Ellington.

00:00:59 THEODORE ELLINGTON
Present.

00:01:00 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Hijazi.

00:1:02 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
She's stuck in traffic.

00:01:03 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Karwande

00:01:05

MAYA KARWANDE

Present.

00:01:06

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Kelleher. Commissioner Pellegrini.

00:01:10

JASON PELLEGRINI

Present.

00:01:11

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Porth. Commissioner Sweet.

00:01:15

MICHAEL SWEET

Present.

00:01:16

COMMISSION SECRETARY

We have quorum.

00:01:17

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you, Madam Secretary. Now I'll call for public comment on items not on the Agenda. And this is a time for members of the public to address the Commission on matters within our purview, but not on tonight's Agenda. Seeing no request for public comment, Madam Secretary, would you please read the next item on the Agenda?

00:01:40

COMMISSION SECRETARY

The item is New Commissioners Maya Karwande and Jason Pellegrini. The presenter is Susan Belinda Christian, San Francisco Human Rights Chair and--

00:01:54

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. So, I'm thrilled to say that we--tonight we welcome two new commissioners. We've needed you for and wanted you for a long time and we're very happy that you're here. First, I just want to tell you a little bit about each of them. Maya Karwande is an attorney. She is an associate at Kecker, Van Nest & Peters, one of the most prestigious law firms here in San Francisco ineffective. And she is also a center for--she's a member of the Center for Justice and Accountabilities Professional Network for Human Rights. And she clerked for an appellate court night circuit court judge, Judge Dorothy Nelson, and also for a district court judge in central district of California, Virginia Phillips. She also was an intern in the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia in Phnom Penh in Cambodia. So, Maya brings a lot of great human rights experience to the Commission. I'm really thrilled to have her here. She's a Boalt Hall graduate and Tufts undergrad. So, Maya, welcome.

00:03:01

MAYA KARWANDE

Thank you very much.

00:3:02

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Is there anything you'd like to say tonight?

00:03:05

MAYA KARWANDE

I would just say that I'm looking forward to serving as a commissioner and supporting all of the great work that the Commission has been doing...

00:03:15

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Really thrilled to have you. Welcome. And next, welcoming Jason Pellegrini. Jason is born and bred San Franciscan, and he graduated from the University of San Francisco with a Bachelor's of Science in Organizational Behavior and Leadership. Jason has worked both in the private sector and the public sector. He decided to leave the private sector to join a non-profit team, looking to better San Francisco and its residents. He has served as the director of facilities for Delivering Innovation and Supportive Housing, also known as DISH, since 2012. And is thrilled to have the opportunity to improve the city and change people's lives by working on the Commission doing the work that he does at DISH. He is also the president--currently the president of the Marina Community Associations Board of Directors. Been a member since 2015. He lives in the Marina district with his partner and their two Norfolk terriers. So, Jason, thrilled to have you.

00:04:16

JASON PELLEGRINI

Thank you. Excited to be here.

00:04:18

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Anything else you want to say?

00:04:19

JASON PELLEGRINI

No, I'm excited to work with the Commission and see what we can do for the good of San Francisco.

00:04:24

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

You both bring expertise that will benefit the Commission. And so really looking forward to having you and working with you. Is there any Commissioner comment on our new commissioners? Commissioner Ellington.

00:04:38

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Awesome. Just want to, for the record, welcome you guys to the Commission. And based off your bios, more than qualified to serve on this body. Jason, you're a San Francisco native?

00:04:51

JASON PELLEGRINI

Yes, I was--

00:04:51

THEODORE ELLINGTON

What high school?

00:04:52

JASON PELLEGRINI

Sacred Heart.

00:04:53

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Sacred Heart? Wow, all right. I'm a fellow native, as well, so I just wanted to point that out.

00:04:58

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Get all clubby about it, Jason. Any other public--I mean any other Commissioner comment? Any public comment on this item? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you please read the next item on the Agenda?

00:05:13

COMMISSION SECRETARY

The next item on the Agenda is Resolution in Support of Youth Justice Reform. The presenter is SF Youth Commission.

00:05:23

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So, we have two members. We have a member of the Commission and the director of the Commission with us tonight. Thrilled to have you. Thank you for being here.

00:05:32

ZACHARY FRENETTE

Greetings, Commissioners. I would like to start off by thanking you for your time, and congratulations to the new commissioners, as well. My name is Zachary Frenette and I am the chair of the Justice and Employment Committee at the San Francisco Youth Commission.

00:05:45

KIELY HOSMON

And my name is Kiely Hosmon. I'm the director of the Youth Commission. And just for you all to have a little background on the Commission, they are a body of young people between the ages of 12 and 23 that are appointed by the Board of Supervisors and the mayor. And their sole direction is basically to advise the Board of Supervisors and the mayor on any unmet needs that impact young people in San Francisco.

00:06:08

ZACHARY FRENETTE

Our reason for being here tonight is to talk about the resolution about youth justice reform, which the San Francisco Youth Commission just passed. The reason why we got started on conducting this work was, as many of you might already know, our main county jail facility at 850 Bryant is not seismically fit and will inevitably need to be closed. Last December, there was an announcement that the employees would be moving out of the Hall of Justice at the 850 Bryant facility, which in the Youth Commission's mind accelerated the timeline on the closure of that facility.

We think that this is an important issue for several reasons. The first being that as young people in San Francisco, who might potentially be paying taxes for the next 10, 20, 30 years, we do not want our tax money going towards debt service to pay off capital investitures in the county jail system. The second reason is because of the over representation of transitional-age youth in our San Francisco County jail system.

Transitional-age youth, which is 18- to 24-year-olds in case you didn't know, are over represented by a factor of three in terms of their incarcerated population compared to the population in the general pop. This is also an issue which over impacts minority communities, in specific in the African-American community--or, sorry, that was backwards. In general, in the African-American community in specific, the African-American community is over represented by a factor of 10 in our county jail system. So, this is very much so a civil rights issue and a human rights issue.

And lastly, 85 percent of people who are incarcerated at 850 Bryant and in the other county jail facilities are on pre-trial. They have not been convicted of a crime. They are simply sitting in jail because they have been denied bail or cannot afford bail. San Francisco also has one of the highest bail schedules of any urban city in the entire country, which is another reason why we think that this is an important issue to tackle head on. The Board of Supervisors has previously unanimously rejected funding for investments and either rebuilding or renovating our existing jails. And the Youth Commission has also previously requested that the Board of Supervisors hold a hearing on alternatives to incarceration for 18- to 24-year-olds. So this is something that my body, as well as our other civic leaders have taken a stance on previously, and we want to make sure that we're pushing the needle forward with the inevitable closure of 850 Bryant.

What can we do about it? The San Francisco Youth Commission has come up several strategies which we feel might help move this forward in a positive direction. The first one is reducing the bail schedule. Bail is obviously something that impacts low-income communities primarily, because folks who can afford bail don't typically sit in county jail because of bail. This is an incredibly important issue simply because of the fact that it can be incredibly disruptive and debilitating to have to remain in county jail if you haven't been convicted of a crime. The fact of the matter is that if you came in with a job, you've probably lost it. Depending on where you live, you might have lost your housing. And having spent that amount of time in the county jail facility, it makes it also difficult to reintegrate back into society. So that's one way we can impact.

The second is how we structure the way that we're charging certain types of crimes, specifically regarding snatch-and-grab phone thefts. This is a crime that is overwhelmingly perpetuated by young people. And it's currently a strikeable offense. That means that it's going to last with you for the rest of your life. And in our minds, it is being charged in a manner that is going to harm young people significantly throughout their entire life. We do not feel like it's a crime that warrants the strike.

Thirdly, invest more in TAY-specific behavioral health services. The fact of the matter is that homelessness and substance abuse are epidemics in public health issues and crises in San Francisco. You can't walk from this building to the main transit hub without coming directly in contact with that. And we that investing more in TAY-specific behavioral

health services, we'll be able to provide and address needs towards a very specific population that has a unique subset of needs. 18- to 24-year-olds have a rapidly different need--or a vastly different need from older populations. And that's something that's being addressed in the way that we tackle homelessness, and I think it's--it needs to be addressed in the way we tackle criminal justice issues and behavioral health services, as well.

Lastly, we can expand collaborative court programs that already exist. The TAY Collaborative Court, which is a diversionary program, is already in place and in effect. Initial statistics that have come from that program are overwhelmingly positive. According to the district attorney's office, from information they presented us, they have had to shutter their doors twice since opening. DCYF is investing further in the TAY Collaborative Court, but they still expect it to fill up the moment that they open the doors, which means that there is a great margin for us to positively impact young people in San Francisco by investing more resources in the types of programs like the TAY Collaborative Court simply because they do not have the bandwidth to operate at their full capacity. In addition, DCYF has offered to provide funding, but it is our understanding that without matching contributions of funds or time from the district attorney's office and the courts, as well, that we will not be able to capitalize fully on this already increased investment.

Many of these strategies are not very radical. A lot of them come out of previously efforts around justice reform for juveniles that have happened in the state of California and in San Francisco, efforts that have been very successful and positive for our communities, as well as coming out of the workgroup to envision the jail replacement project, which was a workgroup that was essentially formed to determine how we are going to move forward with the closure of 850 Bryant. So some of these strategies are directly being advocated for by existing bodies that were created for this exact purpose. And in our mind, we just continue to want to move the needle forward towards the implementation of those strategies. And this is not something that is only being discussed in San Francisco. And, in fact, many other communities have pushed this farther than we have. Two years ago, the state of--or excuse me, the state of Vermont raised the age of criminal responsibility to the age of 21. And the state of Connecticut introduced similar legislation last year. In January of 2017, the state of New Jersey completely eliminated its cash bail system, which reduced its incarcerated population by a factor of 20 percent.

So, the fact of the matter is that for as much as we like to claim that we push the needle on everything, there are whole states that have moved these issues far more along than we have in San Francisco. And in my mind, San Francisco should be a leader amongst these issues. So lastly, I just wanted to say that our end goal is this; we think that we are advocating for a reduction of 50 percent in the incarcerated population of transitional-age youth and a complete rejection of capital expenditures being invested into our county jail

system. We're here tonight to ask for the Human Rights Commission's support either in the form of a resolution or a letter of endorsement to join alongside our other endorsements, which at this point include the Center for Juvenile and Criminal Justice, Project What, as well as supporting letters from the Young Women's Freedom Center and Larkin Street Youth Services. The Youth Commission is continuing to push things forward on our end. Last week, we had a meeting with the District 1 office and we're in the process of requesting a budget and legislative analysis report, which will hopefully be able to detail the fiscal impacts in terms of how much these programs cost, but also how much these programs could potentially save because it's really expensive to keep people incarcerated. And it might actually be more expensive to keep them incarcerated than it would to invest in these programs. But we also want the budget legislative analysis report to see how far the needle can move by implementing some of these policies.

So, the District 1 office has been supportive and has offered to conduct that request on our behalf, and we are also going to be incorporating it into the Youth Commission's budget and policy priorities as we move into the next budgeting cycle. So I think that concludes my presentation. I just want to thank you guys for your time again, and I'm happy to answer any and all questions that you have regarding this legislation.

00:15:16

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Would you like to take questions now or move on to the Director and take questions then or how do you prefer it?

00:15:23

ZACHARY FRENETTE

We can go ahead and take questions now.

00:15:25

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay. So, Commissioners, are there any questions for the presenter? So, I just want to say, first of all, again thank you for being here tonight. It's great to see you. And I am fully supportive of the goals that you are laying out here. I work as an assistant district attorney here, and my assignment--my current assignment that I've had for a number of years is our behavioral health court. And so I'm, you know, very familiar with the work of the new TAY court and that, in fact, there have been several occasions where the court could not accept more participants because the resources were not there. And so definitely the city needs to put more resources toward our collaborative courts, particularly ones that provide behavioral health services to people in the city.

I have a question about how you came up with the percentage, the 50 percent request for reduction. What does that reflect?

00:16:26

ZACHARY FRENETTE

That reflects--so when we got started with this process, we took a hard look at the efforts that have been put into the juvenile justice reform. And those statistics are not very far off from what that system is actually been able to achieve by implementing some of these

policies over the five-year time frame. And then we also looked at national leaders who were kind of leading the way for this movement, and that was the call that was put out by Van Jones's organization, which was the Dream Corp, which is actually calling for a 50 percent reduction over 10 years for the entire population. And we felt that that was a strong position to base ourselves from due to the fact that other national leaders were already taking that standpoint.

00:17:12

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And I have another question about the resolved line on Page 5. And you mentioned that you were requesting that the Board and the city, you know, completely reject any financing for--to construct or renovate existing jails. So I completely understand why we, you know, you're calling for moving away from more jails to other strategies to--that are not incarceration strategies. But practically speaking, I know that the sheriff, for instance, feels that her jail is not safe and that she really believes that she needs a new jail. And so there's the value of making sure that those people who are incarcerated are safe and the people that work with them are safe versus not wanting to expand the number of beds. So when you say "out and out reject," what are--how do you--

00:18:18

ZACHARY FRENETTE

So, we currently have three separate jail facilities. There's 7th Street, 850 Bryant, and the facility in San Bruno, as well. We're at a moving target of about 200 people. That's the number that we've heard from multiple different sources who we've communicated with throughout this process. That's the number we need to reduce the population by to close 850 Bryant and not have to bring other jails online, specifically CJ 2 or CJ 6. So we are hoping that the BLA report might be able to shed some light on the fact that how many of these things that if we do them perfectly or even do them half as well as they can be done, what kind of numbers are we looking at for reducing our incarcerated population and can they get us to the point where we no longer need to spend money bringing CJ 2 or CJ 6 back online. So I'm on the same page with you in terms of that 850 Bryant is not safe currently. It's going to cost more to retrofit than it would to tear it down. I don't think anyone is talking about keeping that building on as a long-existing strategy.

From our frame of mind, if we invest in some of these policies, we might be able to get our number low enough to the point where we don't need to spend money renovating some of the offline jails at San Bruno. So we want people to be safe. We want the sheriff's department to be safe, but we're also recognizing that the system in a lot of ways is broken and has been broken for a very long time. And that instead of maintaining the status quo, we would like to push the needle a little farther on this.

00:19:57

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay. And I have a question about what you define as a jail. And I ask this because, you know, with the behavioral health issues there are people who are decompensated and who really should be in hospitals, but we don't have hospital beds for them. We need places

that are not jails but that are therapeutic, but for some people they need to be secure. And so would you call a therapeutic environment that was secure a jail?

00:20:30

ZACHARY FRENETTE

No.

00:20:32

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay. Those are the questions that I have. I appreciate your--in taking them. Commissioner Ellington.

00:20:39

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Yeah. First off, great report and great presentation. I guess just a couple different questions. Chair Christian covered a lot that was on my list. Can you talk about kind of the youth guidance center, and have you noticed any trends of the population that are--the TAY population that are currently in jails? Any trends in, I guess, recidivism rates, like if you are--if you go through the system, you know, under 18, do you--are there numbers that show that you're more likely to go to jail or experience some type of incarceration in your life?

00:21:24

ZACHARY FRENETTE

I just--I'm going to paraphrase to make sure I'm understanding. You're saying that is there an increased likelihood that if you spend time in the juvenile justice system that you will end up in the adult system?

00:21:32

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Correct.

00:21:33

ZACHARY FRENETTE

Yes.

00:21:34

THEODORE ELLINGTON

And does any of the work you do or does any of the research you've done inform kind of this policy here?

00:21:41

ZACHARY FRENETTE

It does. I mean there's been a lot of research into these kind of policies. And at the end of the day, nothing magic happens when you turn 18. And that's kind of the way that we're treating this system. Right now, we're--if you are charged as a minor in San Francisco, your chances to participate in a program like, what is it, CARC through Huckleberry House or some of the other diversionary programs, vastly increase your abilities to get back on your feet and not enter back into the system. Whereas, if it's a month later or several days later or whatever the circumstances are that you're being charged as an adult, it's a much worse scenario. So yes.

00:22:22

THEODORE ELLINGTON

And then just a follow-up question. Implement alternatives to incarceration for transitional-age youth. Can you talk about some of the successful programs that you've personally seen that works?

00:22:32

ZACHARY FRENETTE

Yes. So, the TAY Collaborative Court, in my mind, is a successful program. It's not been in implementation long enough to get a true recidivism rate, but the initial numbers are positive and are overwhelmingly better than folks who are not going through the TAY collaborative system. And this is also a program that some of my personal friends have gone through and their journeys in and out of that system and other systems, as well. So the feedback that I've heard overwhelmingly from the staff at the TAY Collaborative Court, as well as the district attorney's office, is that the program is working, but it's going to take a little bit longer before we can actually say we have a true recidivism rate. But the statistics for folks who are not participating in that program are severely worse than those who are.

00:23:17

THEODORE ELLINGTON

And then last question. In best case scenario, if this makes it to the Board of Supervisors' level, what is the kind of holy grail of what you want to accomplish here?

00:23:29

ZACHARY FRENETTE

I would say the holy grail minimally would be, number one, we need--this is not within the direct control of the Board of Supervisors. I recognize it. But having the support of as many groups as possible might help push this further. Number--sorry, I'm not going to prioritize them. Goal A would be a hard look at the bail system. It is not working. It is not set up to serve the people currently. So that's something I would definitely want to see addressed.

00:23:57

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

That's happening.

00:23:59

ZACHARY FRENETTE

Fantastic. So whatever that looks like, it needs to be different than it is today. Number two is that having a much more streamlined model for the TAY Collaborative Court to operate. And there needs to be some kind of investment in housing, as well. I know that they have a loose relationship right now with Larkin Street Youth Services, but there isn't enough funding attached to the housing to justify an entire program, and folks are kind of just being embedded in the portfolio of housing that Larkin Street currently operates. So I think that investing to the point where they are no longer able to shut down, especially because they already limit what types of cases that they're willing to bring on at this point. And I'm not saying that we need to adjust or change that, but the current limitations are gang-related cases and cases that involve a firearm. So there's a lot of cases that are not already being included, but for the low-level offenses especially where there's not violence involved, the TAY Collaborative Court should be able to take on all

of those cases and then funnel them into a situation that's going to be supportive in the long run too. Because in a lot of cases, folks are being sent back to what may look like a safe environment, but it's not necessarily a safe or conducive environment in terms of turning your life around.

00:25:20

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Got it. Thank you.

00:25:22

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Any other Commissioner questions or comments?

00:25:25

MAYA KARWANDE

Oh yes, I had a question.

00:25:27

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And this is Commissioner Karwande.

00:25:31

MAYA KARWANDE

Thank you so much for your presentation. Really informative and helpful. I wanted to follow up on a point that you just made about reforming the bail system. And I know you spoke about the disparities in the current cash bail system, as well as New Jersey's elimination of the cash bail system. I was wondering if you could speak a little bit about the alternatives to a cash bail system or what type of reform you're advocating for.

00:25:58

ZACHARY FRENETTE

Well, for starters it would just be lowering the schedule. So, communities select--I think that's under the purview of the judges, but they select the bail schedule itself, which essentially relegates how much money is required for certain types of crime. So at the very least a reduction in the schedule, I think, would be helpful as well as taking in account people's ability to pay, which I believe is what you were referring to as already happening. But I think that that's good first steps. But at the end of the day, I mean let's see how New Jersey plays out. That's still fairly new. But their statistics do not seem to have indicated that that policy is negatively impacting their communities. So maybe that is the end goal at the end of the day. That might be years down the line, I'm not saying we need to jump right into it. Obviously, I think that we should be intentional and do our research before we start jumping feet first into something that's radically different from what we are already doing. The process is slow and it has some growing pains along the way, but a reduction in the schedule and then a full implementation of ability to pay, I would say, are good first steps.

00:27:11

MAYA KARWANDE

And just a follow-up question. These reforms are--would apply throughout the criminal justice system, it's not specific to--

00:27:20

ZACHARY FRENETTE

So the cash bail would hopefully apply throughout the entire system. Some of the more focused policies around advocating for services and supports around transitional-age youth primarily relate only to TAY at this time.

00:27:35

MAYA KARWANDE

Thank you.

00:27:37

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you, Commissioner. Any other Commissioner comments or questions? Right now--and I'll take public comment after the presentation is fully complete. Are you going to be speaking, Director?

00:27:52

KIELY HOSMON

Yep.

00:27:54

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay, great. Any public comment on this item? Seeing none--so this is actually a discussion and a potential action item tonight. So is there a motion? I would just like to say before anybody does move, perhaps, we have a number of commissioners who aren't here tonight. That will always maybe be a case. But I wonder if we could consider a motion to ask the staff to work with us to draft a supportive letter of the resolution as opposed to considering whether or not we're going to adopt a resolution tonight. Might there be such a motion?

00:28:47

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Can you repeat--sorry, can you repeat that, please?

00:28:50

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

A motion to draft a supportive--a letter of support of the resolution to submit to the Board of Supervisors.

00:29:05

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Got something to say? Okay. No, I think this is one of those things that we have to do and I'm impressed with, again, the presentation that you made, Zach, and the work of the Youth Commission. Particularly as a former youth commissioner, I think it's important that the youth lead issues that affect them each and every day. So, with that, I move that we write a letter--or direct staff to write a letter of support for this resolution for youth justice reform.

00:29:36

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Is there a second? Thank you, Commissioner Hijazi. Is there any commissioner discussion on the motion? Is there any public comment on the motion? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you please read the roll?

00:29:52

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Chair Christian.

00:29:53

Yes.

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

00:29:54

Commissioner Ampon.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:29:55

Yes.

MELANIE AMPON

00:29:57

Commissioner Ellington.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:29:59

Yes.

THEODORE ELLINGTON

00:30:00

Commissioner Hijazi.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:30:01

Yes.

HALA HIJAZI

00:30:03

Commissioner Karwande

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:30:04

Yes.

MAYA KARWANDE

00:30:06

Commissioner Pellegrini.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:30:08

Yes.

JASON PELLEGRINI

00:30:10

Commissioner Sweet.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:30:11

Yes.

MICHAEL SWEET

00:30:12

Motion passes.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

00:30:13

Thank you. Unanimously. Thank you so much for your work and looking forward to working with you and going forward.

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

00:30:19

Thank you again for your time. I really appreciate your support.

ZACHARY FRENETTE

00:30:22

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

You're welcome. So, Madam Secretary, can I talk with you a minute? Madam Secretary, would you read the next item on the Agenda, please?

00:31:41

COMMISSION SECRETARY

All right. So it's the Grant Update on Violence Prevention and Intervention Services for LGBTQI Survivors of Violence. And this is LYRIC presented.

00:31:51

DENNY DAVID

Thank you. Well, my name is Denny David. I'm the deputy director over at LYRIC, and LYRIC is a LGBTQ youth development organization committed to social justice and leadership development. We're coming back to the Commission to say thank you so much for the support that the HRC has given to LYRIC and our partners at AWS to roll out queer and trans survivor advocacy services. Even here in San Francisco, services--funding for services like this are incredibly scarce and the need is huge. These are life-saving services and in the first six months of a 15-month contract we exceeded our target for total enrollment for the entire period. So we'd set out to serve 50 survivors and immediately as soon as we were able to bring on more staff and open up those services they were used up very quickly.

So we want to do a report back. We want to talk about the complexity of the issues we're seeing, as well as make a request for an extension in our funding which is set to end in June. But these are critical services that we need for the queer and trans community here in San Francisco. And we would like your support in making sure that we will be able to continue to provide those. I'm going to turn it over to one of our friends from Asian Women's Shelter.

00:33:23

MAY

Hi. Hello, I'm May from Asian Women's Shelter. We are a local shelter and support for survivors of domestic violence and/or human trafficking. And although our name is Asian Women's Shelter, here is a brochure, we actually serve all survivors, not just Asian, because we do have a program that we train community advocates bilingual to really help the community and the survivor along. So we actually speak up to 43 different languages, including Asian and non-Asian languages so that we can really help people navigate the system. And that's also one of our mission now, when we found the shelter 30 years ago. And another point that I want to point out is we also not just serve women, we also serve all gender on the spectrum and we have the special program supporting queer and trans survivors. And we're really honored to work with LYRIC to serve all the survivors of all ages basically. And lastly, we are also not just a shelter. We are contributing not just direct services to the survivor, but we are building up a loving community to really change--shift the culture from the abuse violence to a more loving and healthy relationship. So, I'll end here and the next--

00:34:57

GUSTAVO BANUELOS

Hi everyone, my name is Gustavo Banuelos and I'm one of the program managers at LYRIC, program manager for the access and engagement program overseeing our HIV prevention effort, sexual health efforts, and also RDV efforts. So currently overseeing our collaborative with AWS and LYRIC. And so if you take a look at the service flow chart, it kind of just--this is the model that we have for our collaborative. And so you can kind of just see the different works that we're doing both individual and group-level work. And so some of the individual work is taking place by the youth advocates and I myself, too, as a program manager, I do provide youth advocacy. While my caseload is like very limited, I do serve Spanish-speaking clients. Also, the groups--we have a group to address the violence. And Priya can kind of just elaborate a little more on that since they facilitate that.

But we do have other community building groups at LYRIC. Harm reduction to address just different strategies when people are using and also just find support. We have a group to kind of just talk about sex and in a very sex positive environment, but also kind of just educate the youth on different strategies and preventing HIV and STIs. Yeah, I'm going to step off. Priya.

00:36:39

PRIYA SUMAN

Hi, my name is Priya. I'm a youth advocate at LYRIC and I'm part of a five-person team. So we have four other youth advocates who also run a lot of groups with--I mean who also have groups and one PrEP navigator, which is the HIV prevention pill. Who also run a group specifically like, what Gustavo said, for sex positivity for HIV prevention, as well as talking about STIs and varying ways of staying safe. I'm basically just going to cover very briefly of the things that we end up working with, with the youth. A lot of the youth that we're working with have almost actually 100--yeah, close to 100 percent of them have all faced severe violence, whether they are facing it now or have in the past. Many of them have approached LYRIC specifically because of that. Many of the youth are homeless, so we are working with them to find housing. And, of course, being San Francisco it's fairly challenging. So not just finding them just a shelter based--for temporary, but really getting them into something that is much more sustainable where they're not constantly on and off the streets. Working with them on whether they're using. So we do use a harm reduction approach.

We're not kind of shutting out youth for needs that they really have because they use, but really working with them to minimize any harm that their usage and anything else that really can do. And that takes a while, as well. So we work in partnership with varying organizations. Other things that I'm also working with is providing support with immigration. So we work with partnership with Asian Women's Shelter, as well as other organizations. API Legal Support, APILO, based out of San Francisco to look at immigration, looking at whether youth need DVROs, which is a domestic violence restraining order for youth who are currently facing violence. Looking at what their immigration just like--education as well. So, we have a fellowship where--to look at

trans and gender nonconforming youth to get them through to get certification courses. The community health work of course, so we're, as advocates, working on the multiple of things, where we're looking at housing, education, immigration, currently developing safety plans with them, and also transition plans. So we do have internships and we work with 24 and younger. So there are youth who we work with are much younger, but there's a huge chunk who work--we work with from 18 to 24.

So it's also like really great that we partnered with Asian Women's Shelter because we're able to have this kind of partnership where once youth kind of age out of being 24 years old, they have services. I mean typically for me, when I turned 25, 25 was a great birthday party. But for a lot of our youth who require these supportive services for TAY age, when they turn 25 actually every support network for youth kind of drops. So it's really a scary time. So there's also a lot of work that we do to kind of create some--an environment where youth are able to come and do community building, as well, and get support, which we try to make it as sustainable as possible. And just to give you a timeline, like I've been working with youth, a bunch of them now since I joined and I joined like a year ago. And I don't think I'm kind of close, because there's something or the other that comes up. So I'm still kind of--I just managed to get a bunch of them into like permanent housing and out of transition. So it's been like a nice--it's been like a long process to do that.

And kind of piggybacking on looking at how long it takes for us as youth advocates to work with youth. We do have youth who come in every once in a while, but it takes a good amount of time, like a year sometimes or even more for us to work with them, because we're really trying to provide support where they can get to a point where they're more or less independent really. So, yeah, like just kind of giving an overall arching thing of what as a youth advocate that I've been working with and so has our team. And just referencing like we have--as Gustavo mentioned, we have like a bunch of our groups. So, part of the group that I coordinate is Good Loving, and we've also been putting a lot of work into doing prevention work, as well. So, not just doing crisis intervention but really trying to develop skills which can move towards healthy relationship, which also have a long-term impact. Yeah, so that's a little bit of an overall.

00:41:26

MAY

To Priya's point for youth survivors, you can actually apply that for adult survivors, as well, because you can imagine when a person is suffering in this abusive situation, it probably takes some time for them to figure out. Sometimes they might not see themselves as the victim. So when they are reaching out a lot of time from our experiences or the feedback that they gave us is that I don't know what's going on. I just need to--a safe place to talk to and to figure out. But because of the queer and trans survivor, a lot of time they might also feel extremely isolated from their community because they might be out. And that could be a tactic the abuser used on them. So it's really extremely important to build up the safe, sacred place for them and also building

up the community capacity to really support, providing non-judgmental safe place for them. And also we see like for especially immigrant survivors that we have specialized in because of the language access, we see a lot of them are really same again, isolated. So whenever we are outreach, for example, have this like Arab-speaking networking group, the overwhelmingly response was like this is great. I've never found a place to really share my concerns. I finally find a channel. So we really hope that this grant could expand, because like what Priya was making the point that we can't just drop them like with a year and then bye-bye. It's actually really--it needs time to build out their agency and rebuilding their support and their judgment on their self, because a lot of time during the abuse, the self-concept or the self-esteem was like shattered by the abuser. So it's a healing journey. It takes time. And we are happy that we are there to support them.

And lastly, I just want to make, especially for adult survivors, a lot of them are also dealing with children because of the issue and takes time to like really prep them to go through the court system, things like that. So along with LYRIC, we're actually providing really comprehensive support for them. So, yeah, back to Denny.

00:43:57

DENNY DAVID

Well, again, just want to thank you so much for the support that you've given our organizations to create the safety net for queer and trans survivors of violence. We're going to be here doing our work with them for years to come. And that's the nature of complex domestic violence and intimate partner violence issues. And we're here to partner with HRC and ask for continued support so that we can have a firm foundation, particularly in times when so many queer folks, trans folks, immigrant communities are under attack in our country. So thank you.

00:44:37

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you for the presentation. Commissioners, are there any questions or comments on the presentation? Could you just restate your request of us tonight?

00:44:49

DENNY DAVID

Yes. So originally, we'd been granted a 15-month contract that will come to an end in June. Given the nature of--long-term nature of violence, we're here to request that we have an extension to the contract beyond June. So that would create alignment with the Department on the Status of Women, which recently did a two-year extension to their grantees. The HRC is really funding a very specific unique need around queer and trans survivors. And so being able to also have the HRC take a similar step to create some level of stability and foundation would be a tremendous benefit to the young people and adults that we work with.

00:45:41

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Great. Thank you. So this is a discussion item for us, and thank you for this presentation. And we will work with staff to realize the goal.

00:45:52

SNEH RAO

Yeah. I just want to say on behalf of Director Davis, you know, we're really grateful for your partnership. LYRIC is certainly one of the most impactful partners that we work with, or let me say one of the more impactful partners that we work with. We're really grateful for all your leadership on, you know, intervention services for survivors of violence. And we did receive the request and we're looking into it right now to see to what degree we can extend that funding past the current fiscal year. Obviously, in some ways our hands might be tied, but we'll be sure to get back to you as soon as we have a more firm answer. But thank you, in the meanwhile, for all your work and for the very insightful and poised presentation. Really appreciate you all coming out tonight.

00:46:33

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yeah, it's an impressive work. The little binder that you put together is amazing. It's beautifully done, first of all. But secondly, substantively it's amazing. So thank you so much for this work. Commissioners, any more comments or questions? Commissioner Karwande.

00:46:52

MAYA KARWANDE

I had just one follow-up question. Thank you so much for your presentation. I understand just based on my work in immigration that the LGBT community suffers a lot of violence based solely on their identity in Central and South American countries. I understand that your organization is focused on helping those who have suffered violence in the past, and I'm wondering if it--if your services extend to those who were targeted or, you know, experienced violence because of their sexual orientation or if it's limited to those who have experienced violence in a domestic or intimate partnership?

00:47:42

DENNY DAVID

Thank you so much for that question. It's a really, I think, important point and a unique contribution that the queer and trans anti-violence movement is making, which is to help reframe this more--issue more broadly. So, in coming into, you know, originally, you know, and stepping into the domestic violence field, there are many assumptions that can be within it around what a heterosexual relationship looks like. So when we think about our anti-violence work, it's very holistic. So not just domestic violence or intimate partner violence. We're really acutely looking at gender-based violence broadly. The highest rates of violence that we see are among our trans and gender non-conforming community members. And then also just the histories of violence that people have experienced growing up. And it takes years to heal from that trauma. And so we're here to meet young people where they're at and bring them along on that journey toward healing. And so there are no limit--to answer your question very directly, there aren't limitations. But we have a really diverse community of folks who are healing from a number of forms of violence. And what I see most often is that they're actually coming to a point of wanting to actually take up a leadership role in the community to actually help break that cycle of violence that they're seeing and to integrate new interventions that maybe haven't been thought of before. So, for example, the integration of PrEP

navigation services into--with the relationship violence universe. So how can folks have a more kind of holistic access to support than they wouldn't ordinarily have.

00:49:24

MAYA KARWANDE

Thank you.

00:49:25

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Any more Commissioner comment or questions? Any public comment on this item? Welcome. And if you don't mind giving us your name. You don't have to, but we'd love to have your name, if you're willing.

00:49:46

MICHAEL WRIGHT

Mr. Wright. Just call me Mr. Wright.

00:49:48

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Mr. Wright. Welcome.

00:49:50

MICHAEL WRIGHT

I'm here to speak up for our not only transgender but additional females, as well. May I have the SF government channel give me the viewer, please?

00:50:01

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

We're not televised.

00:50:02

MICHAEL WRIGHT

You're not televised?

00:50:03

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Oh no.

00:50:04

MICHAEL WRIGHT

Okay. Well, I'll hold it up to you. This is the information sheet pertaining to victims of rape. We've got, in my view, about a thousand or better untested rape kits that are at the Halls of Justice or the police department. The police department is claiming that they've got grants and there's confusion and they can only process rape kits that are within the statute of limitations. I'm here today to educate not only this Commission, but also female victims and male victims of rape that there's this law that's called Continual Injuries. And I'd like it to be applied and navigated through this Commission so the females can realize the fact even though the statute of limitations may have passed, there's additional extraordinary series of law that's called Continual Injury, where if you can verify that you're still on the receiving end of your injury, you still can have your complaint processed not only in the criminal justice system, but also the civil and personal injury courtroom system, as well.

This excuse that the district attorney's office and the San Francisco Police is giving is unsupported. Okay. And also I want to point out that this discriminatory practice in

housing which you were talking about how housing is contributing to the problem of transgenders and others is also coming from the Board of Supervisors. For example, this Mission Rock apartment building complex claims it's affordable housing. But yet 40 percent of the housing is for people that's making \$121,000, \$96,000, and \$72,000 per year. They don't belong in affordable housing program. That contributes to the low available housing for low-income bracket people. They claim that the income housing entry level at Mission Rock starts at 45 percent of the median, which is \$36,300 per year.

00:52:21

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Excuse me, Mr. Wright. The three minutes are up. Can we--can you wrap up your comments, please?

00:52:27

MICHAEL WRIGHT

Yeah. So, what that means is five classes of income, of very low-income people are not being included in the housing opportunity.

00:52:37

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you very much for coming out tonight.

00:52:39

MICHAEL WRIGHT

Okay. And also I wanted to point out that you got a sign out there that says this is closed session. That's why I didn't come in earlier. So I didn't get a chance to speak on the opening public comment, and then plus the comment that I'm on now. So is there any way that I can get that time that I that I missed out on? Because I did come here earlier.

00:52:58

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

There will be opportunity for comment later on specific items. I'm sorry we can't go back to public comment. We announced it.

00:53:03

MICHAEL WRIGHT

Okay. All right.

00:53:05

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Thank you so much for coming out tonight. And, Madam Secretary, given the time, I'm going to take the privilege of the Chair to move up Item No. 9. Something that we are several months behind in dealing with and just want to get that business out of the way.

00:53:24

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Okay.

00:53:26

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

If you could read that item on the Agenda, please.

00:53:28

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Nomination and Vote for Chair and Vice Chair of the San Francisco Human Rights Commission.

00:53:34

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. So, Colleagues, tonight we are going to handle--hopefully handle nominations and the vote for Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission. And how we're going to do it is first to take nominations, and then when there are no further nominations, I will close it and then we'll take a vote. And if we get the business done, we get it done. If not, we continue it until we get it done. So I am opening nominations for, first of all, for Chair of the San Francisco Human Rights Commission.

00:54:13

THEODORE ELLINGTON

I just--just for public sake, there is a sign outside that does say this is closed for a private meeting. And just before--

00:54:22

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Maybe somebody can go--

00:54:23

THEODORE ELLINGTON

--we take that vote, do we mind flipping that sign?

00:54:26

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yeah. Thank you, Commissioner. Is that what you wanted to say?

00:54:28

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Yeah.

00:54:29

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay. Commissioner Ampon.

00:54:31

MELANIE AMPON

I would like to nominate our existing Chair, Susan Belinda, to continue for 2018.

00:54:42

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Is there a second on that nomination?

00:54:49

MAYA KARWANDE

Second.

00:54:51

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you, Commissioner. Are there any further nominations for the position of Chair? Now would be the time. Seeing none, I will close the nominations. And, Madam Secretary--actually, I'll ask for public comment. Any Commissioner comment on the nomination? Any public comment on the nomination? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you please read the roll?

00:55:27

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Chair Christian.

00:55:28

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Yes.

00:55:30

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Ampon.

00:55:31

MELANIE AMPON

Yes.

00:55:33

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Ellington.

00:55:35

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Yes.

00:55:36

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Hijazi.

00:55:37

HALA HIJAZI

Abstain.

00:55:40

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Karwande.

00:55:43

MAYA KARWANDE

Yes.

00:55:45

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Pellegrini.

00:55:48

JASON PELLEGRINI

Yes.

00:55:51

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Sweet.

00:55:52

MICHAEL SWEET

Yes.

00:55:54

COMMISSION SECRETARY

With the majority vote, Chair Christian will remain the Chair of the Human Rights Commission.

00:56:02

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

And what was the vote?

00:56:03

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Oh, the vote was six-one. Six yes, one abstain.

00:56:11 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
One abstention. Okay, thank you.

00:56:14 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Sorry.

00:56:15 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
Thank you. And now we'll move on to nominations for Vice Chair of the Human Rights Commission. Commissioner Ellington.

00:56:22 THEODORE ELLINGTON
Yeah, I move that we--or I'd like to nominate Commissioner Sweet for the Vice Chair position.

00:56:29 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
Is there a second to that nomination? I will second that nomination. Is there any Commissioner comment on the nomination? Any public comment on the nomination? Are there any other nominations for the position of Vice Chair? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, would you please read the roll?

00:56:59 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Chair Christian.

00:57:01 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
Yes.

00:57:02 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Ampon.

00:57:04 MELANIE AMPON
Yes.

00:57:06 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Ellington.

00:57:07 THEODORE ELLINGTON
Yes.

00:57:09 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Hijazi.

00:57:10 HALA HIJAZI
Abstain.

00:57:13 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Karwande.

00:57:16 MAYA KARWANDE
Yes.

00:57:19 COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Pellegrini.

00:57:21

JASON PELLEGRINI

Yes.

00:57:23

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Commissioner Sweet.

00:57:25

MICHAEL SWEET

Yes.

00:57:27

COMMISSION SECRETARY

With a six yes and a one abstained, we will have Commissioner Sweet as the Vice Chair of the Human Rights Commission.

00:57:37

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you very much. And I appreciate your vote of confidence and will do my best to live up to it. Thank you. Moving back to the regularly scheduled program, we are now at No. 5, Adoption of Minutes dated November 9th. And so, Colleagues, these have been circulated and hopefully you've had enough time to take a look. And I will entertain a motion.

00:58:14

MICHAEL SWEET

Motion to approve the minutes of January 25th.

00:58:18

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Is there a second?

00:58:19

MELANIE AMPON

Second that motion.

00:58:21

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Any comment on the motion? Any public comment on the motion? Mr. Wright?

00:58:32

MICHAEL WRIGHT

Yes. Yeah, I would like to comment on the motion that I would like this included in your process to showing why there's a shortage of housing which contributes to the unstabilization and vulnerability of violence on both transgender and standard females. For example, could I have the viewer, please?

00:58:59

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Mr. Wright, this is about the adoption of these minutes dated January 25th. And so the comment is specific to that. Do you have comments related to that?

00:59:08

MICHAEL WRIGHT

Oh. No, no, no. I'll wait.

00:59:10 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
Thank you. Any other public comment? Seeing none, Madam Secretary, please read the roll.

00:59:20 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Chair Christian.

00:59:22 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
Aye.

00:59:25 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Ampon.

00:59:27 MELANIE AMPON
Yes.

00:59:28 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Ellington.

00:59:30 THEODORE ELLINGTON
Yes.

00:59:31 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Hijazi.

00:59:32 HALA HIJAZI
Aye.

00:59:33 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Karwande.

00:59:35 MAYA KARWANDE
Yes.

00:59:37 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Pellegrini.

00:59:39 JASON PELLEGRINI
Abstention. Abstaining.

00:59:41 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Okay. Commissioner Sweet.

00:59:46 MICHAEL SWEET
Aye.

00:59:48 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Motion passes.

00:59:51 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Would you read the next item on the Agenda, please?

00:59:54

COMMISSION SECRETARY

The next item on the Agenda is Update on Projects and Staff. This will be from various staff members of the Human Rights Commission. We will start with the staff recommendations for following hearing on January 25th, followed with the transgender legal education and support services, the RFP, followed by the annual report and update on events, advisory committees, and then staff roles.

01:00:21

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Welcome.

01:00:23

SAMI IWATA

Thank you. Sami Iwata speaking to the first item on that Agenda. Thank you, Chair and Commissioners. This is in reference to the March 5th recommendation by staff, in your binder. I just want to highlight a couple of key points from that. So recent city actions, such as the retroactive application of Prop 64 Adult Cannabis Use, as well as the removal of certain onerous criminal fines and fees are explicitly addressing historic and current inequities that are--and impacts of our policies and programs on our residents. This is a start, but stark inequities do exist for our residents, especially along racial lines. Race currently can predict outcomes such as education, income, incarceration, and life expectancy. And for a black African-Americans and Latinx Hispanic residents, we see persistent disparities along these indicators. We also heard about this from the earlier presentations by the San Francisco Youth Commission, as well.

So how might the city continue to actively address this systemic inequity? Well, one best practice is for jurisdictions to first recognize their responsibility to address them in an explicit way. And then also then to identify and track progress for key community indicators where there are racial inequities. To then promote transparency and accountability. These are then displayed on community-facing dashboards such as Seattle has today. Accurate data underlies these types of indicator tracking. On January 25th of this year, this Commission heard about data challenges that the city faces. Most notably, in our opinion, the fact that not all departments capture race and ethnicity data, and of those that do the information is not consistent across the board. In other words, there is no data standard today for the key lens we need to assemble a view across silos to make systemic change. For these reasons, we recommend that the city first affirm that it has a collective and urgent responsibility to address inequities in its existing systems. This position paves the way to begin explicitly integrating equity best practices into its systems, including budgeting and hiring. And it also allows us to begin to apply racial equity analyses more comprehensively to our programs and services.

Secondly, we recommend the city adopt a data standard for race and ethnicity. And third, we create a racial equity indicators dashboard identifying a set of key indicators, such as kindergarten readiness, housing stability, median income to track and report progress in

an accessible and meaningful format to the public. This approach provides opportunities to partner with our community to develop innovative solutions. In closing, it is only by creating equity for all our residents regardless of race, means, can San Francisco harness its full potential and achieve stronger and most importantly sustainable economic growth and vitality. Thank you. I'm happy to take any questions.

01:03:52

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Commissioners, are there any questions on this presentation? Commissioner Ellington.

01:03:59

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Yeah. I know we've been--thank you, first off, for coming and giving kind of a detailed account of just data and where we need to be. I know we've been talking about this for a while and have had a number of presentations, and I'm looking at just the recommendations here on this document. Where do we go from here as a sort of governing body, I guess, and then where do we go from here on the staff level?

01:04:31

SAMI IWATA

Right. Thank you for the questions, Commissioner. And so far--in terms of an action item and so far as the Commission wants to make a recommendation to Mayor Farrell and particularly Supervisor Cohen and Supervisor--and President Breed, excuse me, are moving forward on data collection to make--for the Commission to make a recommendation to those individuals to move forward on this work would be helpful.

01:04:58

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

To the Board?

01:04:59

SAMI IWATA

Yeah, to the Board. Yeah. And the mayor to the extent. Whatever we can do to move it forward.

01:05:07

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. Commissioner Hijazi.

01:05:09

HALA HIJAZI

How does this affect staff load? Where would this be housed? I know you're talking about Data SF and working in collaboration with Data SF. But currently does this increase--is this--is there a budget involved in this? Is this going to increase a staff in HRC? Is it just more collaboration to make sure that we're looking and working with the SF making sure that they and other departments are using these indicators? So like budget-wise, how does this affect our budget and how does it affect the staffing?

01:05:36

SAMI IWATA

Right. Thank you for that question, Commissioner. I think, in short, we're not trying to boil the ocean. So the good news is we do have a lot of data. It's just in silos. I think we would need to delve in further to further understand the gap between what we want to

create and what exists. We would be partnering with Data SF closely. It wouldn't be data that the HRC would necessarily hold. That should be in a central place where already data is held. I imagine we would be doing work to--with key stakeholders to get agreement on what those key community indicators are. The good news is we're not starting from scratch there. But to, I think, hold that--the work to get the agreement on what that would be. And so I think it's to be determined, but I do feel like between the partnerships--we do feel between the partnerships available we would--it does not seem at the outset here a Herculean task.

01:06:35

HALA HIJAZI

So I'm more likely to support it if I had more of a process. This to be determined, these unknowns are important especially during upcoming budget cycles. So especially in light of the fact that other departments are taking into consideration are doing this type of work the duplication of efforts that increase in our general fund spending. So for me, I'd be more comfortable--and this is great work and this is--I mean this is what I really wanted, this kind of update. But for my level of comfort and also my stakeholders and also just to be more fiscally responsible to make sure we're not duplicating efforts, I just kind of want to know, you know, what the process is. I mean is this something that the-- Supervisor Breed and Malia Cohen are going to be working on before they go to the Board of Supervisors as a whole or is this something still on the staff level that we're going to have to determine?

01:07:27

SAMI IWATA

Right. Those are great questions. I will investigate further and get back to you on that. And we want to avoid duplicating effort and we could clarify that through a process.

01:07:39

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Do you have any comments, Sneh?

01:07:42

SNEH RAO

I mean my understanding, and I haven't followed this issue too closely, but my understanding is that this time Sami is trying to lead the effort to build a support for this work. And if Mayor Farrell and if the Board of Supervisors agree to support this work then the next step would be to take stock of how much work lies ahead, what resource request to ask for, and how those resources would be administered. I don't think anyone at this stage is saying that the HRC would administer a citywide data keeping project of this scale and scope. So I think the step before the Commission today is really just to endorse the work of this letter and then the next steps would be determined by the mayor, the president of the board, and other leadership on the board.

01:08:36

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Any other Commissioner questions or comments right now? Any public comment on-- well, actually, yes, I'll go ahead and take public comment on this March 5th recommendation for a--to draft a resolution.

01:09:03

MICHAEL WRIGHT

I believe this is related to the subject matter and has a lot to do with the type of situation that you have on your hands. Can I have the viewer, please?

01:09:16

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Danielle has stepped away and we're not able to provide that to you right now, unless you--

01:09:23

MICHAEL WRIGHT

Well, let me--maybe I can explain it to you.

01:09:25

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Noah, can you assist?

01:09:27

NOAH FRIGAULT

I'll try.

01:09:42

MICHAEL WRIGHT

If not, I can explain it verbally to you.

01:09:45

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay. Thank you, Noah.

01:09:54

MICHAEL WRIGHT

One of the reasons why we're having such a major problem with assaults, homelessness out in the street is that the Board of Supervisors are the main issue. Every time they make a notice, a campaign that they're running for office, the next word out of their mouth that they want to take care of the problem of homelessness. Now, a good example of that is this new apartment building complex called Mission Rock. It's 1,500 apartment units. Now, this document here explains that 15 percent of all new developments is supposed to be for very low and low-income families and single persons. Okay. And it's part of Section 334.3 of the Community Redevelopment Law that says at least 15 percent is supposed to be affordable--included in affordable housing. Jane Kim and Linden Bree price fixed and rearranged the requirements to get into the apartment building complex. The lowest income is \$36,000. You got people making \$121,000, \$96,000, \$72,000, and then \$44,000. That's part of the 40 percent affordable housing. People in those income brackets are not very low income and low-income families. And the very set of people that's homeless out in the streets are at the low incomes and supposed to be targeted to help them from being homeless on the streets.

Now, the income level that they're starting at is 45 percent of the API, which is the scale that's used. Now, by using that scale of 45 percent you exclude one, two, three, four--five income ranges of low income people and families. You take away the opportunity for them to even apply to be a tenant in the building. And yet you include people that's

making \$121,000 a year and then claim that they're part of an affordable housing program. It's not fair. It's not fair and I'm moving you to talk to the mayor and Breed, because this is price fixing. You're deliberately violating the civil rights of low income bracket people, and the people that's got disabilities both mental and physical. You're in violation of the American Disabilities Act and constitutional law too, pertaining to the 14th Amendment. That's not due process and equal protection under the law. Then they further demonstrate that they're hypocrites because they take homeless teachers and take a building and build affordable housing for homeless teachers, but when you come to non-homeless teachers you want to send them to a shelter or a navigation center.

01:12:52

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you, Mr. Wright. You're at three minutes right now. Unfortunately, our bell isn't working right now, but thank you for your comments. Is there any further public comment on the March 5th letter? This is--Sneh, are you--you're asking--this is just listed as discussion, so we're considering--I guess you've asked us to consider creating a resolution based on--

01:13:23

SNEH RAO

I'll defer to Sami on explaining the ask.

01:13:28

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay. You can go, we just can't take any action. Okay, please.

01:13:37

SAMI IWATA

I believe in discussion with the Director, we're asking for a recommendation at this time.

01:13:42

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

A recommendation. Okay. So, I would recommend that we follow what we've been presented with and ask the staff to create a resolution outlining these objectives that are contained in the March 5th letter. Commissioner Hijazi, I know that you had some concerns. Were those addressed at all by Sneh's comments regarding what they're asking for tonight?

01:14:12

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

So is that a clear enough request or we can refine it, if not.

01:14:23

SAMI IWATA

Let me restate to make sure I understand. So the staff would draft a resolution for the Commission in support of the work outlined here?

01:14:33

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

The work outlined...

01:14:33

SAMI IWATA

To move that forward, yeah.

01:14:34

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

--in the recommendation to begin to move that forward and bring it back to the Commission for discussion and review and go from there. So can I have a motion?

01:14:48

THEODORE ELLINGTON

So moved. Does there need to be a motion? I mean is it kind of just a directive from the Chair to--

01:14:54

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Well, it's either--if it's not a directive from the Chair, it should be a motion. And I'm asking that it come from the Commission.

01:15:00

MICHAEL SWEET

So moved.

01:15:01

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Is there a second?

01:15:12

THEODORE ELLINGTON

What's--I'm confused about what the motion is at this point.

01:15:05

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Recommending, asking the staff to draft--begin drafting a resolution in support of the recommendations that have been laid out in this letter.

01:15:14

THEODORE ELLINGTON

And then that resolution would then come back in front of us to--

01:15:17

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Absolutely.

01:15:17

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Okay.

01:15:18

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

It would have to be reviewed and adopted by the commission.

01:15:21

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Got it.

01:15:22

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Okay. Is that a second?

01:15:25

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Commissioner Sweet seconded.

01:15:28 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
Commissioner Sweet second. Okay.

01:15:30 MAYA KARWANDE
No, he made the motion. I'll second the motion.

01:15:33 THEODORE ELLINGTON
Okay, I'm sorry.

01:15:35 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
So, Terry, would you please read the roll?

01:15:41 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commission Chair Susan Christian.

01:15:43 SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN
Yes.

01:15:47 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Ellington.

01:15:48 THEODORE ELLINGTON
Yes.

01:15:50 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Hijazi.

01:15:51 HALA HIJAZI
Abstain.

01:15:55 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Karwande.

01:15:57 MAYA KARWANDE
Yes.

01:15:59 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Pellegrini.

01:16:01 JASON PELLEGRINI
Yes.

01:16:03 COMMISSION SECRETARY
Commissioner Sweet.

01:16:04 MICHAEL SWEET
Yes.

01:16:07 COMMISSION SECRETARY
We have five yeses and one no.

01:16:11

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

You have one abstention.

01:16:13

COMMISSION SECRETARY

Oh, one abstain.

01:16:17

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you. So please go forward, Sami, with the staff and begin to draft the resolution and bring it back to us at the appropriate time and we'll go from there.

01:16:28

SAMI IWATA

Great. Thank you very much, Chair and Commissioners.

01:16:30

SUSAN BELINDA CHRISTIAN

Thank you so much for your presentation tonight. So, it is almost five minutes to 7:00 and we've lost several Commissioners. One, two, three, four, five. No longer have a quorum. And so we can do no further business. Commissioners, we can continue to hear from acting Director Rao about the matters--the update on project and staff or we can roll it to the next meeting. I know--you need to leave, Commissioner Ellington, right, as well? So--

01:17:08

THEODORE ELLINGTON

Just keep going until we--I mean--